



## **CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD**

Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue,  
Kathryn Gualtieri, Kathy Pomeroy

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers  
East Side of Monte Verde Street  
Between Ocean and 7th Avenues

### **REGULAR MEETING Monday, December 16, 2024**

**MEETING 4:00 PM**

**THIS MEETING WILL BE HELD VIA TELECONFERENCE AND IN PERSON AT CITY HALL. The public is welcome to attend the meeting in person or remotely via Zoom; however, the meeting will proceed as normal even if there are technical difficulties accessing Zoom. The City will do its best to resolve any technical issues as quickly as possible.**

**To attend in person, visit the City Council Chambers at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and Seventh Avenues. To view or listen to the meeting remotely, you may access the YouTube Live Stream at:  
<https://www.youtube.com/@CityofCarmelbytheSea/streams>, or use the link below to view or listen to the meeting via Zoom teleconference:**

**<https://ci-carmel-ca-us.zoom.us/j/88188362744?pwd=9H2DI5GuqQ2eCddEodDJusxbLVYhX.1>. To attend Zoom webinar via telephone, dial +1 669-444-9171. Webinar ID: 881 8836 2744. Passcode: 001916.**

**HOW TO OFFER PUBLIC COMMENT: Public comment may be given in person at the meeting, or using the Zoom teleconference module, provided that there is access to Zoom during the meeting. Zoom comments will be taken after the in-person comments. The public can also email comments to [mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us](mailto:mwaffle@ci.carmel.ca.us). Comments must be received 2 hours before the meeting in order to be provided to the legislative body. Comments received after that time and up to the beginning of the meeting will be made part of the record.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES - Under the Brown Act, public comments for matters on the agenda must relate to that agenda item, and public comments for matters not on the agenda must relate to the subject matter jurisdiction of this legislative body. Hateful, violent, and threatening speech is impermissible public comment, as it disrupts the conduct of the public meeting. This is a warning that if a member of the public attending this meeting remotely violates the Brown Act by failing to comply with these**

**requirements of the Brown Act meeting, that speaker will then be muted.**

Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to 3 minutes, or as otherwise established by the Chair. Matters not appearing on the agenda will not receive action at this meeting and may be referred to staff. Persons are not required to provide their names, and it is helpful for speakers to state their names so they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**CONSENT AGENDA**

Items on the consent agenda are routine in nature and do not require discussion or independent action. Members of the Board or the public may ask that any items be considered individually for purposes of Board discussion and/ or for public comment. Unless that is done, one motion may be used to adopt all recommended actions.

- 1. Adoption of the 2025 Historic Resources Board Meeting Calendar
- 2. August 21, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; November 20, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; December 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; February 26, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; March 18, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes
- 3. September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes
- 4. October 16, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; April 15, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; May 20, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes
- 5. June 17, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; October 21, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; November 18, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes
- 6. August 19, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

**DIRECTORS REPORT**

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

- 7. Next Regular Meeting: January 27, 2025

**ADJOURNMENT**

**CORRESPONDENCE**

This agenda was posted at City Hall, Monte Verde Street between Ocean Avenue and 7th Avenue, Harrison Memorial Library, located on the NE corner of Ocean Avenue and Lincoln Street, the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office, 5th Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us> in accordance with applicable legal requirements.

**SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA**

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Historic Resources Board regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and Seventh Avenues during regular business hours.

**SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC**

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2000 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

December 16, 2024  
CONSENT AGENDA

**TO:** Historic Resources Board Commissioners

**SUBMITTED BY:** Shelby Gorman, Administrative Coordinator

**SUBJECT:** Adoption of the 2025 Historic Resources Board Meeting Calendar

## RECOMMENDATION:

Adopt the 2025 Historic Resources Board meeting calendar

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

In accordance with the Historic Resources Board Rules of Procedure, the Board holds regular meetings on the third Monday of each month at 4:00 p.m. When a regular meeting falls on a public holiday, no regular meeting shall be held on that day. Such meetings may be rescheduled to another business day, or canceled by motion and adopted by the Historic Resources Board.

The purpose for adopting a meeting calendar is to identify any conflicts with public holidays and to preempt the need for last-minute schedule changes, providing the Board, staff and the public adequate notice of scheduled meetings throughout the year for planning purposes.

In preparing the 2025 Historic Resources Board meeting calendar (Attachment 1), staff identified conflicts with public holidays and suggested special meeting dates. The Historic Resources Board is being asked to review and adopt the meeting calendar.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

## ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: 2025 Historic Resources Board Meeting Calendar

CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD MEETING DATES  
CALENDAR YEAR 2025

MEETING DATES
Monday, January 27, 2025 <i>Rescheduled from Monday, January 20, 2025 - Martin Luther King, Jr. Day</i>
Monday, February 24, 2025 <i>Rescheduled from Monday, February 17, 2025 - President's Day</i>
Monday, March 17, 2025
Monday, April 21, 2025
Monday, May 19, 2025
Monday, June 16, 2025
Monday, July 21, 2025
Monday, August 18, 2025
Monday, September 15, 2025
Monday, October 20, 2025
Monday, November 17, 2025
Monday, December 15, 2025

City-Observed Holidays:

New Year's Day	Wednesday, January 1, 2025
Martin Luther King, Jr. Day	Monday, January 20, 2025
Lincoln's Birthday	Wednesday, February 12, 2025
President's Day	Monday, February 17, 2025
Memorial Day	Monday, May 26, 2025
Independence Day	Friday, July 4, 2025
Labor Day	Monday, September 1, 2025
Veteran's Day	Tuesday, November 11, 2025
Thanksgiving Day	Thursday, November 27, 2025
Day after Thanksgiving	Friday, November 28, 2025
Christmas Eve	Wednesday, December 24, 2025
Christmas Day	Thursday, December 25, 2025



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

December 16, 2024  
CONSENT AGENDA

<b>TO:</b>	Historic Resources Board Commissioners
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Shelby Gorman, Administrative Coordinator
<b>SUBJECT:</b>	August 21, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; November 20, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; December 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; February 26, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; March 18, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

## RECOMMENDATION:

Approve draft minutes

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

The Historic Resources Board routinely approves minutes of its meetings.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

None.

## ATTACHMENTS:

- Attachment 1: August 21, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes
- Attachment 2: November 20, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes
- Attachment 3: December 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes
- Attachment 4: February 26, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes
- Attachment 5: March 18, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, August 21, 2023**

**Tour 3:19 p.m.  
Meeting 5:01 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Chair Chroman was recused from Item A, MA 23-117 (Griffin).**

**Item A: MA 23-117 (Griffin) - 3rd Avenue 2 northwest of Junipero Street**

**Chair Chroman returned to the Tour.**

**Item B: MA 23-116 (Esperanza Carmel, LLC) - 26336 Scenic Road**

**Item C: MA 23-103 (Cypress Inn) - Northeast corner of Lincoln Street and 7th Avenue**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Board Member Erik Dyar announced that the Carmel Heritage Society and American Institute of Architects Monterey Bay (AIA) will be hosting a Home Tour on September 9, 2023. There are eight (8) houses on the tour. Tickets may be purchased at [www.carmelheritage.org](http://www.carmelheritage.org).

Board Member Hall announced that the Notable Home proposal has been submitted to the City Council and will likely appear on the October 2023 City Council meeting agenda.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**Item 1:** Adoption of Minutes: May 15, 2023 Regular Meeting

**Item 2:** Adoption of Minutes: June 19, 2023 Regular Meeting

**Item 3:** Adoption of Minutes: July 17, 2023 Regular Meeting

**It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt the Consent Agenda.**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None**

### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 4: MA 23-146 (Lopez 5 NW, LLC):** Consideration of adding a historic resource to the Carmel Register and making a recommendation to the City Council on a Mills Act Contract application, MA 23-146 (Lopez 5 NW, LLC), for the historic "Cosmas House" located on Lopez Avenue 5 northwest of 4th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-232-028-000. **CONTINUE TO A DATE UNCERTAIN.**

Mamie Waffle, Principal Planner, informed the Board that Item 4, MA 23-146 (Lopez 5 NW, LLC), was legally noticed and agendized, but incomplete noticing necessitated a continuance.

**Item 5: MA 23-103 (Cypress Inn):** Consideration of making a recommendation to the City Council on a Mills Act Contract application, MA 23-103 (Cypress Inn), for the historic "La Ribera Hotel" listed on the Carmel Register and located on the northeast corner of Lincoln Street and 7th Avenue in the Residential-Commercial (R-C) District. APN 010-147-008-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Christopher Barlow, Architect, commented on some aspects of the property and addressed questions of the Board.

Gerard A. Rose, Attorney, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution recommending that the City Council enter into a Mills Act Contract with Sentimental Journey, LLC for the historic "La Ribera Hotel" located on the northeast corner of 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Lincoln Street. APN: 010-147-008-000.**



**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman**  
**NOES: Board Member(s): None**  
**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None**  
**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None**

**Item 6: MA 23-116 (Esperanza Carmel, LLC):** Consideration of making a recommendation to the City Council on a Mills Act Contract application, MA 23-116 (Esperanza Carmel, LLC), for the historic "Mrs. Clinton Walker House" listed on the Carmel Register and located at 26336 Scenic Road in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 009-423-001-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Christopher Mitchell, Managing Director, commented on some aspects of the property and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Hall to adopt a Resolution recommending that the City Council enter into a Mills Act Contract with Esperanza Carmel, LLC for the historic "Mrs. Clinton Walker House" located at 26336 Scenic Road. APN: 009-423-001-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman**  
**NOES: Board Member(s): None**  
**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None**  
**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None**

**Chair Chroman was recused from Item 7, MA 23-117 (Griffin).**

**Item 7: MA 23-117 (Griffin):** Consideration of adding a historic resource to the Carmel Register and making a recommendation to the City Council on a Mills Act Contract application, MA 23-117 (Griffin), for the historic "Agnes Shorting House" located on 3rd Avenue 2 northwest of Junipero Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN 010-108-007.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Christopher Barlow, Architect, commented on some aspects of the property and addressed questions of the Board.

Vice Chair Hall opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None.

Vice Chair Hall closed the meeting for public comment.

It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a Resolution adding a historic resource to the Carmel Register and recommending that the City Council enter into a Mills Act Contract with Michael Griffin and Kimberly S. Griffin Trust for the property located on 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue 2 northwest of Junipero Avenue. The motion included the condition that the maintenance plan be revised to include an evaluation of the existing windows to ensure that non-original windows are made more compatible, and that any existing screens are either removed or moved to the interior of the windows. APN: 010-108-007-000.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): Chroman (recused)  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None

Chair Chroman returned to the dais.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave a report and answered questions of the Board.

- **Notable Homes Proposal Update:** The proposal has been tentatively scheduled to be presented to the City Council in October of 2023.
- **Planning Commission Special Meeting:** This Wednesday, August 23, 2023 at 5:00 p.m., there will be a meeting to discuss a recommendation of the Second-Draft Wireless Ordinance to the City Council. The meeting will be held in the Council Chambers and via Zoom.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 8:** Next Regular Meeting: September 18, 2023

**ADJOURNMENT**

**6:14 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jordan Chroman, Chair

\_\_\_\_\_  
Leah R. Young, Recording Secretary

**REGULAR MEETING**  
**Monday, November 20, 2023**

**TOUR TIME 3:30 p.m.**  
**MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent from the Tour of Inspection: None.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A:** DS 23-160 (Lutz) - Santa Fe Street 4 northwest of 6th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**Item 1:** Adoption of the 2024 Historic Resources Board Meeting Calendar

**It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to approve the Consent Agenda.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman.  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 2: HE 23-097 (Hofsas House, Inc.):** Consideration of a historic determination for the single-family residence known as "Donna Hofsas House" and a historic determination for the Hofsas House Hotel located on San Carlos Street 4 northwest of 4th Avenue. APNs: 010-124-014-000, 010-124-001-000. **CONTINUED TO DECEMBER 18, 2023.**

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**Item 3: DS 23-152 (Velo, LLC):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for additions and site modifications at the historic "S. J. Miller House" located at the northwest corner of Casanova Street and 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-273-012-000. **CONTINUED TO A DATE UNCERTAIN.**

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**Item 4: DS 23-160 (Lutz):** Request for reconsideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards issued by the Historic Resources Board on September 18, 2023, for Design Study application, DS 23-160 (Lutz), for additions, alterations, and site modifications including a kitchen addition, bedroom addition, and new detached garage in the front setback at the historic "Elizabeth F. Armstrong House," and a request to add the historic resource to the Carmel Register and creation of a design nonconformity (reduced composite side yard setback) located on Santa Fe Street 4 northwest of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-092-005-000.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Thomas Hood, Architect, gave a presentation, including a series of photos.

Breck Lutz, Property Owner, commented on the project and addressed the Board regarding the process and findings thus far.

Brian Congleton, Architect, commented about the project and addressed the Board regarding the property owner's concerns.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Katherine Gualtierri.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Pomeroy to adopt a Resolution adding the historic "Elizabeth F. Armstrong House" to the Carmel Register, approving the creation of a design nonconformity in the composite side yard setback (per CMC 17.32.100). APN: 010-092-005-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman.**  
**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**  
**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**  
**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Hall to allow a 235-square-foot garage, 11 feet wide.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall.  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): Chroman, Pomeroy.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, informed the Board that a vote was needed on Public Hearing Items 2 and 3.

It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to continue Item 2, HE 23-097 (Hofsas House, Inc.), to December 18, 2023.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Pomeroy to continue Item 3, DS 23-152 (Velo, LLC), to a date uncertain.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 5:** Update on the Junipero Serra Statue

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- **Forest and Beach Commission Vacancy:** There is currently one (1) vacancy; applications will be accepted until December 6, 2023. The term ends in May of 2025.
- **Mills Act Contracts:** On December 5, 2023, the City Council will be discussing four (4) Mills Act contracts recommended by the Board. In a prior meeting, the City Council directed staff to prepare an urgency ordinance to place a moratorium on Mills Act applications while the Council reconsiders

the current policy; this item will be on the agenda at the upcoming City Council meeting on December 5, 2023.

- **Notable Homes Program Update:** City Council has considered the proposal, but because of the current heavy workload, Council wanted to delay the review of the Notable Homes Program until the Design Traditions 1.5 project has been completed.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Next Regular Meeting: December 18, 2023.

**ADJOURNMENT**

4:53 p.m.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Jordan Chroman, Chair

---

Leah R. Young, Recording Secretary

**REGULAR MEETING**  
**Monday, December 18, 2023**

**TOUR TIME 3:15 p.m.**  
**MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent from the Tour of Inspection: Karyl Hall.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A:** HE 23-097 (Hofsas House, Inc.) - **House:** Dolores Street 2 northeast of 4th Avenue

**Item B:** HE 23-097 (Hofsas House, Inc.) - **Hofsas Hotel:** Dolores Street 2 northeast of 4th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent: Karyl Hall.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 1:** HE 23-097 (Hofsas House, Inc.): Consideration of a historic determination for the single-family residence known as “Donna Hofsas House” and a historic determination for the Hofsas House Hotel located on San Carlos Street 2 northwest of 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue. APNs: 010-124-014-000; 010-124-001-000.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Anthony Lombardo, Attorney representing the Property Owner, gave a verbal presentation and commented on the historicity of the project.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: David O’Neil, Stephanie Kirz, Mary Crow, Allan Williams, Neal Kruse, Carolyn Hardy, and Kent Seavey.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Pomeroy to approve the designation of Donna Hofsas House as a local historic resource.**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Pomeroy, Chroman.  
NOES: Board Member(s): None.  
ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.  
ABSENT: Board Member(s): Hall.**

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment, because earlier technical difficulties disallowed members of the public participating via Zoom to raise their hands or unmute themselves to comment on the project. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Julie Wendt.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to issue a Determination of Ineligibility for the Hofsas House Hotel.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Pomeroy, Chroman.  
NOES: Board Member(s): None.  
ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.  
ABSENT: Board Member(s): Hall.**

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, thanked the Board for their service this year and wished everyone happy holidays.

Chair Chroman thanked staff for all their hard work throughout the year.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 2:** Next Special Meeting: January 22, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**4:55 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jordan Chroman, Chair

\_\_\_\_\_  
Leah R. Young, Recording Secretary



**SPECIAL MEETING  
Monday, February 26, 2024**

**TOUR 3:15 p.m.  
MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Kathy Pomeroy, Karyl Hall, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent from the Tour of Inspection: None.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: DS 23-217 (Voriss):** Torres Street 4 northeast of 6th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Kathy Pomeroy, Karyl Hall, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**Item 1:** Adoption of Minutes: August 21, 2023 Regular Meeting

**Item 2:** Adoption of Minutes: September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting

**Item 3:** Adoption of Minutes: November 20, 2023 Regular Meeting

**Item 4:** Adoption of Minutes: December 18, 2023 Regular Meeting

**The following items were pulled for discussion: Item 2: Adoption of Minutes: September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting at the request of Board Member Dyar, who did not attend the September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting.**

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to approve Item 1: Adoption of Minutes: August 21, 2023 Regular Meeting, Item 3: Adoption of Minutes: November 20, 2023 Regular Meeting, and Item 4: Adoption of Minutes: December 18, 2023 Regular Meeting from the Consent Agenda.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue approve Item 2: Adoption of Minutes: September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): Dyar.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 5: DS 23-217 (Voris):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application, DS 23-217 (Voris), for the construction of a detached garage in the front yard setback of the historic "Doll House" also known as "Hansel & Gretel" located on Torres Street 4 northeast of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-092-010-000.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Brian Congleton, Architect representing the owners of the property, gave a verbal presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Garth Bowman, Katherine Gualtieri, Cindy Lloyd

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application, DS 23-217 (Voris), for the construction of a detached**

garage in the front yard setback of the historic "Doll House" also known as "Hansel & Gretel" located on Torres Street 4 northeast of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-092-010-000.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

Brian Congleton, Architect, approached the Board to ask for an amendment to the plans for the garage allowing for an increase in the steepness of the roof by lowering the eaves and raising the peaks slightly to make the structure better match the architecture of the original building without violating the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Garth Bowman

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application, DS 23-217 (Voriss), for the construction of a detached garage in the front yard setback of the historic "Doll House" also known as "Hansel & Gretel" located on Torres Street 4 northeast of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-092-010-000 with an amendment allowing for an increase in the steepness and height of the roof within the parameters of the code.**

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board.

- **Grant Award:** The City is under contract with Seth Bergstein at PAST Consultants for Phase II of the Historic Context Statement and work is underway.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Board member Hall requested training on the Historic Review process.

Chair Chroman directed staff to prepare an item for the next agenda establishing a celebration of the 100-year anniversary of the Comstock neighborhood.

Item 7: Next Regular Meeting: March 18, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**4:40 p.m.**

APPROVED:

---

Jordan Chroman, Chair

ATTEST:

---

Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, March 18, 2024**

**MEETING 4:00 PM**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**Item 1:** Certified Local Government Annual Report

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, informed the Board that there were no substantial differences from the previous year's report.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Pomeroy to adopt the Consent Agenda.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

<b>AYES:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman</b>
<b>NOES:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): None.</b>
<b>ABSTAINED:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): None.</b>
<b>ABSENT:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): None.</b>

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 2:** Report on Comstock Cottages

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, presented the Report and addressed questions of the Board.

The Board received the report and provided feedback.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: Katherine Gualtieri

The meeting was closed for public comment.

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 3: Historic Context Statement Phase II Update.** On January 9, 2024, City Council approved a contract with PAST Consultants, LLC, and also accepted a \$40,000 CLG Grant with local match of \$26,667, for Phase II of the City's Historic Context Statement Update. This effort will expand upon the Phase I update, completed in 2022, which extended the document content from 1965 to 1986. On March 18, 2024, PAST Consultants and City Staff will introduce the project and discuss a proposed revised Table of Contents and seek feedback.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the Report and addressed questions of the Board.

Seth A. Bergstein, Principal Architectural Historian with PAST Consultants, spoke on the Historical Context Statement and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: Mel Ahlborn

The meeting was closed for public comment.

The Board considered the Report and provided guidance to staff and PAST consultants.

## **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the Report which included the following updates:

- **Housing Element:** The City's Housing Element is currently in its 60-day review period with the State. Staff are expecting to get a letter from the State on March 25<sup>th</sup> either informing them of substantial compliance or comments to address. Adoption is tentatively scheduled for April 2<sup>nd</sup>.

Board member Dyar informed the Board of a lecture to be hosted by the Carmel Public Library Foundation in partnership with AIA Monterey Bay on the life of Kip Stewart, Carmel resident and architect.

## **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 4:** Next Regular Meeting: April 15, 2024

## **ADJOURNMENT**

5:12 p.m.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Jordan Chroman, Chair

---

Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

December 16, 2024  
CONSENT AGENDA

**TO:** Historic Resources Board Commissioners

**SUBMITTED BY:** Shelby Gorman, Administrative Coordinator

**SUBJECT:** September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes

## RECOMMENDATION:

Approve draft minutes

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

The Historic Resources Board routinely approves minutes of its meetings.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

None.

## ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: September 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes



**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, June 17, 2024**

**TOUR TIME 3:00 PM**

**MEETING 4:00 PM**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Katherine Gualtieri, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: DS 23377 (Fradin):** Northwest Corner of Torres Street and 1st Avenue

**Item B: DS 24115 (Salehi):** Southwest Corner of Santa Rita Street and 1st Avenue

**Item C: DR 23278 (Carl Cherry Foundation):** Northwest Corner of Guadalupe Street and 4th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Katherine Gualtieri, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 1: DR 24087 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial, LLC):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for exterior building modifications and site improvements at the historic "Aucourt Commercial Block" located at Lincoln Street 3 southwest of Ocean Avenue in the Central Commercial (CC) Zoning District and Downtown Conservation District (DC) Overlay. APN: 010-191-001-000. **Continue to a date uncertain.**

A continuance to a date uncertain was requested by the Applicant; no action needs to be taken.

**Item 2: DR 24-287 (Carl Cherry Foundation):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Review application DR 24-287 (Carl Cherry Foundation), for the demolition of an existing 300-square-foot brick patio; 36-square-foot theatre building storage closet; and 360-square-foot art studio building to accommodate a 775-square-foot new art studio building at the historic "Carl Cherry Center for the Arts" located at the northwest corner of Guadalupe Street and 4th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-024-013-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Bob Walker, Applicant, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Commission.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Gualtieri to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Review application DR 24-287 (Carl Cherry Foundation), for the demolition of an existing 300-square-foot brick patio; 36-square-foot theatre building storage closet; and 360-square-foot art studio building to accommodate a 775-square-foot new art studio building at the historic "Carl Cherry Center for the Arts" located at the northwest corner of Guadalupe Street and 4th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-024-013-000.**

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**  
**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**  
**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**  
**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**Item 3: DS 23377 (Fradin):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the demolition of a non-historic laundry closet, construction of a 75-square-foot bathroom addition, and associated site improvements at the historic "Taggart House" located at the northwest corner of Torres Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 009-132-004-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Alan Lehman, Designer for the project, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Board. Scott and Robin Fradin addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Gualtieri to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the demolition of a non-historic laundry closet, construction of a 75-square-foot bathroom addition, and associated site improvements at the historic "Taggart House" located at the northwest corner of Torres Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family**

**Residential (R-1) District. APN: 009-132-004-000 with the condition to add a four-inch jog in the bathroom from the northwest corner of the building.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**Item 4: DS 24-115 (Salehi):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application DS 24-115 (Salehi), for an 18-square-foot kitchen addition, 78-square-foot bathroom/laundry addition, modified garage door and enlarged garage door opening, roof deck above a detached accessory dwelling unit, and associated site modifications at the historic "Mary Haven House" located at the southwest corner of Santa Rita Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-027-001-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Jun Sillano, Architect for the project, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Gualtieri and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application DS 24-115 (Salehi), for an 18-square-foot kitchen addition, 78-square-foot bathroom/laundry addition, modified garage door and enlarged garage door opening, roof deck above a detached accessory dwelling unit, and associated site modifications at the historic "Mary Haven House" located at the southwest corner of Santa Rita Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-027-001-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

## **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- **Staffing Update:** The City is actively recruiting for a Director of Community Planning and Building.

Chair Chroman mentioned the ethics training taken by several members of the Board.

Board Members Dyar and Gualtieri gave an update on the progress of the Comstock celebration scheduled for September 2024.

## **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 4:** Next Regular Meeting: July 15, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**5:11 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Jordan Chroman, Chair

---

Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

December 16, 2024  
CONSENT AGENDA

<b>TO:</b>	Historic Resources Board Commissioners
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Shelby Gorman, Administrative Coordinator
<b>SUBJECT:</b>	October 16, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes; April 15, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; May 20, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

## RECOMMENDATION:

Approve draft minutes

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

The Historic Resources Board routinely approves minutes of its meetings.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

None.

## ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: October 16, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes

Attachment 2: April 15, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

Attachment 3: May 20, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, October 16, 2023**

**TOUR TIME 2:45 p.m.  
MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent from the Tour of Inspection: Jordan Chroman.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: DR 23-164 (Laub Trust)** - Northeast Corner of Ocean Avenue and Dolores Street

**Item B: DR 23-233 (128 S Canon, LLC)** - Ocean Avenue 2 northwest of Mission Street

**Item C: DS 23-126 (Barnes)** - Santa Fe Street 3 southwest of 2nd Avenue

**Item D: DS 23-160 (Lutz)** - Santa Fe Street 4 northwest of 6th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Karyl Hall, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent: Esther Goodhue and Jordan Chroman.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**Item 1: DR 23-233 (128 S Canon, LLC):** Consideration of a Track 1 Design Review referral, DR 23-233 (128 S Canon, LLC), for storefront modifications to an existing non-historic building location on Ocean Avenue 2 northwest of Mission Street in the Central Commercial (CC) District and Downtown Conservation (DC) District Overlay. APN: 010-113-007-000.

**Item 2: DR 23-164 (Laub Trust):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Review application DR 23-164 (Laub Trust) to repair existing stucco,

repaint the entire building in a new color scheme, and install one storefront awning on the Ocean Avenue frontage located at the northeast corner of Ocean Avenue and Dolores Street in the Central Commercial (CC) District and Downtown Conservation (DC) District. APN: 010-134-009-000.

**Board Member Dyar requested that Item 2, DR 23-164 (Laub Trust), be pulled for discussion.**

**It was moved by Vice Chair Hall and seconded by Board Member Pomeroy to approve the following Consent Agenda Item: Item 1, DR 23-233 (128 S Canon, LLC).**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Hall, Pomeroy.  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): Chroman, Goodhue.

### **ITEM PULLED FROM CONSENT AGENDA**

**Item 2: DR 23-164 (Laub Trust):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Review application DR 23-164 (Laub Trust) to repair existing stucco, repaint the entire building in a new color scheme, and install one storefront awning on the Ocean Avenue frontage located at the northeast corner of Ocean Avenue and Dolores Street in the Central Commercial (CC) District and Downtown Conservation (DC) District. APN: 010-134-009-000.

Board Member Dyar had questions about the bay windows in the front and wanted to know if those windows were included in the maintenance plan, along with the stucco repair.

Jason Spaits, Applicant and Master Lease Holder, stated that the bay windows were not currently included in the maintenance plan but that this issue would be addressed in the near future.

Board Member Dyar stated that he would like to see the façade of the building returned to its original Art Deco appearance by removing the non-historic bay windows. Dyar acknowledged that the applicant is under no obligation to remove the bay windows but feels the bay windows detract from the original architectural style.

Spaits responded to Dyar and stated that the original building was used as a bank, but the new use would be for retail, and the building now has a different function, necessitating the bay windows for retail display purposes.

Dyar reiterated that the applicant was under no obligation to take his advice.

Spaits thanked Dyar for his input.

Vice Chair Hall stated that even if the bay windows were kept, they would need repairs, as indicated by the applicant, to occur in a future phase.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Vice Chair Hall to approve the following Consent Agenda Item: Item 2, DR 23-164 (Laub Trust).**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Hall, Pomeroy.  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): Chroman, Goodhue.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 3: DS 23-201 (Vais):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application, DS 23-201 (Vais), for alterations, and site modifications, to the historic "Louis Ralston House" located on Lincoln Street 4 northwest of Santa Lucia in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) Zoning District. APN: 010-173-006-000. **NO ACTION REQUIRED.**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, recommended the Historic Resources Board take no action on the application. The project has been revised so that it qualifies as a minor alteration to a historic resource for which the associated Determination of Consistency can be issued by staff.

No action was taken.

**Item 4: DS 23-160 (Lutz):** Request for reconsideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards made by the Historic Resources Board on September 18, 2023 for Design Study application, DS 23-160 (Lutz), for additions, alterations, and site modifications including a kitchen addition, bedroom addition, and new detached garage in the front setback at the historic "Elizabeth F. Armstrong House," and a request to add the historic resource to the Carmel Register and creation of a design nonconformity (reduced composite side yard setback) located on Santa Fe Street 4 northwest of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-092-005-000.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, provided direction to the Board regarding meeting protocols and procedures in association with the project. Waffle stated that staff is prepared to provide a staff report if the Board chooses to hear the item.

After some discussion by the Board, Vice Chair Hall opened the meeting for public comment.

Breck Lutz, Property Owner, thanked the Board for their time and effort. Lutz discussed the size of the garage and received information from Waffle regarding meeting protocols and options available to the Board regarding project continuance and public hearings.

**Board Member Goodhue took a seat at the dais.**

Waffle provided further direction to the Board, including options to hear the project or continue the project.

**It was moved by Vice Chair Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to continue the project and to delay the hearing until all Board Members were present.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

<b>AYES:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy.</b>
<b>NOES:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): None.</b>
<b>ABSTAINED:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): None.</b>
<b>ABSENT:</b>	<b>Board Member(s): Chroman.</b>

**Item 5: DS 23-126 (Barnes):** Consideration of adding the historic "G.H. Phillips House" to the Carmel Register of Historic Resources, granting the creation of a design nonconformity, and issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties for Design Study application DS 23-126 (Barnes) for additions, alterations, and



site modifications, including a 333-square-foot addition to the rear (west) elevation and a new 185-square-foot rear deck located on Santa Fe Street 3 southwest of 2nd Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) Zoning District. APN 010-102-003-000.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Vice Chair Hall opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Megan Koch.

Waffle responded to Koch's question as to whether any correspondence was received from neighbors of the project property. Waffle said she had received no correspondence and deferred to Eric Wynkoop, Architect.

Wynkoop said he had received a letter of support from the neighbor to the south but no other correspondence. Wynkoop commented on the project and addressed questions of the Board.

**It was moved by Vice Chair Hall and seconded by Board Member Dyar to adopt a Resolution adding the historic "G.H. Phillips House" to the Carmel Register of Historic Resources, granting the creation of a design nonconformity, and issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties for additions, alterations, and site modifications to the "G.H. Phillips House" located on Santa Fe Street 3 southwest of 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue. APN: 010-102-003-000.**

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy.  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): Chroman.

#### **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the report and addressed questions of the Board.

- **Reminder to the Board:** The City's birthday and Halloween parade will be held on Tuesday, 10/31/2023. Waffle requested that Board Members RSVP to Leslie Fenton.
- **Staffing Update - Recruitment to Fill Vacant Assistant Planner Position:** Over sixty (60) applications were received; first round of interviews is over; final interviews should be completed within the next two weeks.
- **Upcoming Special Meeting of the Planning Commission on 11/15/2023:** This will be a public workshop to discuss local ADU Ordinance; the meeting time has yet to be determined.

#### **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 6:** Next Regular Meeting: November 20, 2023

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

4:35 p.m.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Karyl Hall, Vice Chair

---

Leah R. Young, Recording Secretary

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, April 15, 2024**

**TOUR 3:30 p.m.  
MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: Jordan Chroman.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: HE 23-209 (Rodriguez)** - Camino Real 4 northwest of 11th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent: Jordan Chroman.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Katherine Gualtieri

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Board member Dyar spoke in favor of a celebration for Comstock. An invitation only fundraiser for the Carmel Heritage Society has been scheduled for Friday, July 12, 2024. On the following day, Saturday, July 13, 2024, a public lecture and talk at the Carmel Women's Club on Comstock will take place. There will be a more formal tour available for the public for a fee on the following Sunday, July 14, 2024.

EAA Monterey Bay is organizing a talk partnering with the Monterey Museum of Art set for May 11, 2024 covering the work and life of Mickey Muennig, Big Sur architect.

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 1:** Historic Context Statement Phase II Monthly Update: Historic Context Statement Phase II monthly update status report and discussion.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a report and addressed questions of the Board.

Vice Chair Hall opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 2: HE 23-209 (Rodriguez):** Consideration of a determination to list the "J. Henry Ohloff House," located at Camino Real 4 northwest of 11th Avenue, on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources. APN: 010-275-006-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Anthony Lombardo, on behalf of the applicant, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Vice Chair Hall opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: Mel Ahlborn

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Vice Chair Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution adding the "J. Henry Ohloff House," located at Camino Real 4 northwest of 11th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) district, to the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources. APN: 010-275-006-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): Dyar.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): Chroman.

## **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- **Staffing Update:** Email communication will no longer be sent to Board Member's personal email addresses. Board members can schedule a time to meet with City staff to discuss.
- **Housing Plan:** The Housing Plan was submitted to the State on April 11<sup>th</sup> and they did indicate that the plan will be certified as written. The formal letter of certification should be received in the coming days.
- **Capital Improvement Program:** A project budgeted at \$300,000 for the repainting of the Sunset Center and Harrison Memorial Library has begun with work starting on the north wing of the Sunset Center. The project will also include remediation for lead and asbestos.
- **DS 23-017 (Voris):** The project for the construction of a detached garage in the front setback of the historic "Doll House" also known as "Hansel & Gretel" was approved by the Planning Commission at the April 13<sup>th</sup> meeting.

## **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Board Member Dyar requested the Board make a recommendation for the City Council to approve a proclamation honoring Comstock and recognizing the 100-year anniversary celebration planned for July 2024.

**Item 3:** Next Regular Meeting: May 20, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**4:58 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Karyl Hall, Vice Chair

---

Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, May 20, 2024**

**TOUR TIME 3:30 PM**

**MEETING 4:00 PM**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: Jordan Chroman and Karyl Hall.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: HE 24042 (Dunham) - Santa Fe Street 5 northwest of 3rd Avenue**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: Jordan Chroman and Karyl Hall.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

None.

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 1: Historic Context Statement Phase II Monthly Update:** Status report and discussion on partial Draft (May 13, 2024), provided by PAST Consultants

(Attachment 1).

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a verbal report and addressed questions of the Board.

Seth A. Bergstein, Principal Architectural Historian, and Kent L. Seavey, Subconsultant and Architectural Historian gave a status update on the Historical Context Statement.

Board Member Dyar opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Cindy Lloyd.

Board Member Dyar closed the meeting for public comment.

**Item 2: Review Draft Proclamation Honoring Hugh W. Comstock**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave a verbal report and addressed questions of the Board.

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Katherine Gualtieri and Bobbi Voris.

Katherine Gualtieri informed the Board that the Comstock celebration was moved to September 2024.

The Board gave direction to staff to have the City Council read the proclamation at an August 2024 City Council meeting.

**It was moved by Board Member Goodhue and seconded by Board Member Pomeroy to continue the Review Draft Proclamation Honoring Hugh W. Comstock to the July 15, 2024, Historic Resources Board meeting.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Pomeroy**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): Hall, Chroman.**

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 3: HE 24042 (Dunham):** Consideration of a preliminary determination of historic ineligibility for the property located at Santa Fe Street 5 northwest of 3rd Avenue. APN: 010-102-005-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a verbal report and addressed questions of the Board.

Thomas Dunham, Property Owner, addressed the Board.

Board Member Dyar opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Katherine Gualtieri, Cindy Lloyd, Thomas Dunham, David O'Neil.

Board member Dyar closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Goodhue and seconded by Board Pomeroy to issue a preliminary determination of historic ineligibility for the property located at Santa Fe Street 5 northwest of 3rd Avenue. APN: 010-102-005-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Pomeroy  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): Hall, Chroman.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- The City Council issued a proclamation declaring the third week of April as National Volunteer Appreciation Week and, as part of that proclamation, recognized the members of the Historic Resources Board.
- Today, May 20, 2024, is Board Member Hall's last meeting as a Board Member on the Historic Resources Board.
- Upcoming Meetings:
  - Tuesday, May 21, 2024 - Budget Workshop at City Hall (open to the public)
  - Wednesday, May 22, 2024 6:00 p.m. – Urban Forest Master Plan Community Meeting at the Sunset Center in Carpenter Hall
  - Monday, May 27, 2024 – City Offices Closed; Annual Memorial Day Ceremony at Devendorf Park

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 4:** Next Regular Meeting: June 17, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**5:10 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Erik Dyar, Acting Chair

---

Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary





# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

December 16, 2024  
CONSENT AGENDA

**TO:** Historic Resources Board Commissioners

**SUBMITTED BY:** Shelby Gorman, Administrative Coordinator

**SUBJECT:** June 17, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes; October 21, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes;  
November 18, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

## RECOMMENDATION:

Approve draft minutes

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

The Historic Resources Board routinely approves minutes of its meetings.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

None.

## ATTACHMENTS:

- Attachment 1: June 17, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes
- Attachment 2: October 21, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes
- Attachment 3: November 18, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, June 17, 2024**

**TOUR TIME 3:00 PM**

**MEETING 4:00 PM**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Katherine Gualtieri, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: DS 23377 (Fradin):** Northwest Corner of Torres Street and 1st Avenue

**Item B: DS 24115 (Salehi):** Southwest Corner of Santa Rita Street and 1st Avenue

**Item C: DR 23278 (Carl Cherry Foundation):** Northwest Corner of Guadalupe Street and 4th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Katherine Gualtieri, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 1: DR 24087 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial, LLC):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for exterior building modifications and site improvements at the historic "Aucourt Commercial Block" located at Lincoln Street 3 southwest of Ocean Avenue in the Central Commercial (CC) Zoning District and Downtown Conservation District (DC) Overlay. APN: 010-191-001-000. **Continue to a date uncertain.**

A continuance to a date uncertain was requested by the Applicant; no action needs to be taken.

**Item 2: DR 24-287 (Carl Cherry Foundation):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Review application DR 24-287 (Carl Cherry Foundation), for the demolition of an existing 300-square-foot brick patio; 36-square-foot theatre building storage closet; and 360-square-foot art studio building to accommodate a 775-square-foot new art studio building at the historic "Carl Cherry Center for the Arts" located at the northwest corner of Guadalupe Street and 4th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-024-013-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Bob Walker, Applicant, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Commission.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Gualtieri to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Review application DR 24-287 (Carl Cherry Foundation), for the demolition of an existing 300-square-foot brick patio; 36-square-foot theatre building storage closet; and 360-square-foot art studio building to accommodate a 775-square-foot new art studio building at the historic "Carl Cherry Center for the Arts" located at the northwest corner of Guadalupe Street and 4th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-024-013-000.**

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**  
**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**  
**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**  
**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**Item 3: DS 23377 (Fradin):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the demolition of a non-historic laundry closet, construction of a 75-square-foot bathroom addition, and associated site improvements at the historic "Taggart House" located at the northwest corner of Torres Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 009-132-004-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Alan Lehman, Designer for the project, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Board. Scott and Robin Fradin addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Gualtieri to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the demolition of a non-historic laundry closet, construction of a 75-square-foot bathroom addition, and associated site improvements at the historic "Taggart House" located at the northwest corner of Torres Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family**

**Residential (R-1) District. APN: 009-132-004-000 with the condition to add a four-inch jog in the bathroom from the northwest corner of the building.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**Item 4: DS 24-115 (Salehi):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application DS 24-115 (Salehi), for an 18-square-foot kitchen addition, 78-square-foot bathroom/laundry addition, modified garage door and enlarged garage door opening, roof deck above a detached accessory dwelling unit, and associated site modifications at the historic "Mary Haven House" located at the southwest corner of Santa Rita Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-027-001-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Jun Sillano, Architect for the project, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Gualtieri and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application DS 24-115 (Salehi), for an 18-square-foot kitchen addition, 78-square-foot bathroom/laundry addition, modified garage door and enlarged garage door opening, roof deck above a detached accessory dwelling unit, and associated site modifications at the historic "Mary Haven House" located at the southwest corner of Santa Rita Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-027-001-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

## **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- **Staffing Update:** The City is actively recruiting for a Director of Community Planning and Building.

Chair Chroman mentioned the ethics training taken by several members of the Board.

Board Members Dyar and Gualtieri gave an update on the progress of the Comstock celebration scheduled for September 2024.

## **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 4:** Next Regular Meeting: July 15, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**5:11 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Jordan Chroman, Chair

---

Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary

**REGULAR MEETING  
Monday, October 21, 2024**

**TOUR TIME 3:30 PM**

**MEETING 4:00 PM**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection:

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: HE 24235 (Bland):** Camino Real 2 southwest of 7th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Katherine Gualtieri, and Kathy Pomeroy.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 1:** Historic Context Statement Update Monthly Progress Report: 100% Working Draft

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 2: DS 24204 (Esperanza Carmel, LLC):** Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the replacement of the existing asphalt driveway with a new pea gravel driveway, the repair of an existing stone curb along the south edge of the driveway, and the addition of a new stone curb along the north edge of the driveway, located at the historic "Mrs. Clinton Walker House" located at 26336 Scenic Road in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District, Archaeological Significance (AS) Overlay, Park Overlay (PO), and Beach/Riparian (BR) Overlay. APN: 009-423-001-000. **Recommend continuance to a date uncertain.**

A continuance to a date uncertain was requested by the Applicant; no action needs to be taken.

**Item 3: HE 24235 (Bland):** Consideration of a determination to list the "Lucy Hayward House " located at Camino Real 2 southwest of 7th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) Zoning District on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources. APN: 010-265-002-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

Bob Walker, Applicant, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Commission.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Dyar and seconded by Board Member Gualtieri to adopt a resolution approving a determination to list the "Lucy Hayward House " located at Camino Real 2 southwest of 7th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) Zoning District on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources. APN: 010-265-002-000.**

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman  
**NOES:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSTAINED:** Board Member(s): None.  
**ABSENT:** Board Member(s): None.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- **Capital Improvement Plan (CIP) Updates:** The City is actively recruiting for a Director of Community Planning and Building.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 4:** Next Regular Meeting: November 18, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**5:11 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jordan Chroman, Chair

\_\_\_\_\_  
Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary

Historic Resources Board Meeting Minutes  
November 18, 2024

**REGULAR MEETING**  
**Monday, November 18, 2024**

**MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Katherine Gualtieri, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following Board Members were absent: None.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Cindy Lloyd.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 1:** Elect a Vice Chair

**It was moved by Board Member Gualtieri and seconded by Chair Chroman to elect Eric Dyar as the Vice Chair of the Historic Resources Board.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**Item 2:** Historic Context Statement Update

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the Historic Context Statement Update.

Seth A. Bergstein, Principal Architectural Historian, and Kent L. Seavey, Subconsultant and Architectural Historian, presented the options for the cover of the Historical Context Statement and addressed questions of the Board.



Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Cindy Lloyd.

Chair Chroman closed the meeting for public comment.

The Board gave direction to staff to revise terminology in some biographies.

**It was moved by Board Member Gualtieri and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution accepting the updated City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Historic Context Statement Update as present.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Gualtieri, Pomeroy, Chroman**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): None.**

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave a report and answered questions of the Board.

- **Staffing Update:** The recruitments for an Acting Director of Community Planning and Building and a Principal Planner are ongoing.
- **Holiday Closure:** City Hall offices will be closed to the public Thursday, November 28 and Friday November 29.

**BOARD MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 10:** Next Regular Meeting: December 16, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**4:38 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jordan Chroman, Chair

\_\_\_\_\_  
Shelby Gorman, Recording Secretary



# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

December 16, 2024  
CONSENT AGENDA

**TO:** Historic Resources Board Commissioners

**SUBMITTED BY:** Shelby Gorman, Administrative Coordinator

**SUBJECT:** August 19, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

## RECOMMENDATION:

Approve draft minutes

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

The Historic Resources Board routinely approves minutes of its meetings.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

None.

## ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: August 19, 2024 Regular Meeting Minutes

**REGULAR MEETING**  
**Monday, August 19, 2024**

**TOUR TIME 3:15 p.m.**  
**MEETING 4:00 p.m.**

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR**

The following Board Members were present for the Tour of Inspection: Erik Dyar, Kathryn Gualtieri, and Esther Goodhue.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: Kathy Pomeroy and Jordan Chroman.

**TOUR OF INSPECTION**

**Item A: HE 23285 (Community Foundation for Monterey County):** Monte Verde Street 4 southwest of 3rd Avenue

**Item B: HE 24157 (Storre):** Northwest corner of Lincoln Street and 8th Avenue

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS**

The following Board Members were present: Erik Dyar, Kathryn Gualtieri, and Esther Goodhue.

The following Board Members were absent for the Tour of Inspection: Kathy Pomeroy and Jordan Chroman.

Board Member Gualtieri nominated Board Member Dyar to be the Chair of the meeting.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC APPEARANCES**

None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Board Member Dyar informed the Board of the Carmel Heritage Society and AIA Monterey Bay home tours scheduled for September 8, 2024 11AM-4PM. Eight homes will be on the tour, including four Comstock properties.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

There were no items on the Consent Agenda.

**ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

**Item 1:** Historic Context Statement Update Monthly Progress Report

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the Historic Context Statement Update Monthly Progress Report and addressed questions of the Board.

Seth A. Bergstein, Principal Architectural Historian, and Kent L. Seavey, Subconsultant and Architectural Historian, spoke on the Monthly Progress Update Report for the Historical Context Statement and addressed questions of the Board.

Board Member Dyar opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Nancy Tulley.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Item 2: HE 23285 (Community Foundation for Monterey County):** Consideration of a determination to list the "Alice Y. Nugent de Delvin House" located at Monte Verde Street 4 southwest of 3rd Avenue on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources. APN: 010-223-009-000.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Eric Miller, Architect for the project, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Anthony Lombardo, representative for the Applicant, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Kent Seavey, Architectural Historian, spoke on the project and addressed questions of the Board.

Board Member Dyar opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Cindy Lloyd.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Gualtieri and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a resolution issuing a Determination of Ineligibility for the "Alice Y. Nugent de Delvin House" located at Monte Verde Street 4 southwest of 3rd Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) district to the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources. APN: 010-223-009-000.**

**The motion passed by the following roll call vote:**

**AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Gualtieri, Goodhue**

**NOES: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**

**ABSENT: Board Member(s): Pomeroy, Chroman.**

**Item 3: HE 24157 (Storre):** Consideration of a determination of historic ineligibility for the property located at the northwest corner of Lincoln Street and 8th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) district. APN: 010-192-008-000

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the staff report and addressed questions of the Board.

Anthony Lombardo, representative for the Property Owner, gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None.

The meeting was closed for public comment.

**It was moved by Board Member Gualtieri and seconded by Board Member Dyar to issue a Determination of Ineligibility for the property located at the northwest corner of Lincoln Street and 8th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) district. APN: 010-192-008-000.**

**The motion does not pass as a result of the following roll call vote:**

- AYES: Board Member(s): Dyar, Gualtieri.**
- NOES: Board Member(s): Goodhue.**
- ABSTAINED: Board Member(s): None.**
- ABSENT: Board Member(s): Pomeroy, Chroman.**

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the following updates and addressed questions of the Board:

- **Staffing Update:** The City is actively recruiting for a Director of Community Planning and Building.
- There will be a community meeting to discuss affordable housing on Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6PM–8PM at Carpenter Hall in the Sunset Center.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

**Item 4:** Next Regular Meeting: September 16, 2024

**ADJOURNMENT**

**5:37 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Erik Dyar, Acting Chair

\_\_\_\_\_  
Shelby Gorman for Leah R. Young,  
Recording Secretary