

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD**

**HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD RESOLUTION NO. 2023-XX-HRB**

**A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
ISSUING A FINDING OF NONCOMPLIANCE WITH THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S  
STANDARDS FOR THE RELOCATION OF THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA SAVINGS AND LOAN  
COMPLEX COMMUNITY ROOM FROM APN 010-145-023 TO APN 010-145-002.**

WHEREAS, the subject site is known as the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex ("Complex"); and

WHEREAS, the Complex consists of Lots 2, 4, 6, and 8 located on Block 91 and is currently comprised of Assessor Parcel Numbers (APNs: 010-145-002, 010-145-023, 010-145-024); and

WHEREAS, APN 010-145-002 is comprised of lots 2 & 4 and is owned by D&K Dolores, LLC ("D&K Dolores"). APN 010-145-023 and 010-145-024 are comprised of lot 6 and 8, respectively. Both lots 6 & 8 are owned by Esperanza Carmel Commercial LLC ("Esperanza Carmel"); and

WHEREAS, International Design Group (IDG), ("Applicant") submitted an application (DR 22-157) on behalf of Esperanza Carmel on May 24, 2022, requesting the construction of a mixed-use building located on Lots 6, 8, and 10 of Block 91; and

WHEREAS, the Applicant submitted a second application (DR 22-310) on October 3, 2022, on behalf of D&K Dolores for the relocation of the Community Room to Lot 4 from Lot 6 of Block 91, associated with the proposed improvements shown as part of the application, DR 22-157; and

WHEREAS, an intensive survey of the Complex dated December 2022, prepared by PAST Consultants, concluded that the Complex is eligible for listing on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources as the property is representative of the theme of Architectural Development in the Context Statement; retains all of its original character-defining features and has retained a high degree of integrity; is greater than 50 years old; and, meets the requirements of Criteria 3 for listing; and

WHEREAS, the survey concluded further that the subject property is eligible for listing in the Carmel Inventory as a primary resource because it is eligible for listing on the California Register of Historic Resources (CRHR) under Criteria #3, *Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values* for its intact Bay Region Modern-stylistic elements designed by

prominent local architects Walter Burde & Associates and Will Shaw & Associates, in addition to meeting the criteria for listing on the local inventory as outlined in CMC 17.32.040; and

WHEREAS, on January 23, 2023, the Historic Resources Board adopted Resolution 2023-XX-HRB, listing the Complex on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources and Carmel Register of Historic Resources; and

WHEREAS, notwithstanding the adoption of Resolution 2023-XX-HRB, in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), sites determined to be eligible for listing on the CRHR are a historic resource for the purpose of CEQA and therefore subject to the requirements of the city's historic preservation ordinance (CMC 17.32); and

WHEREAS, the relocation of the Community Room constitutes a major alteration to a historic resource; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to CMC 17.32.160.B, determinations of consistency for major alterations shall be prepared by a qualified professional and shall be supported by written documentation that (1) identifies which of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are applicable to the project, (2) reviews the proposed project, and (3) explains the basis of the determination. If an evaluation concludes that a proposed alteration is not consistent with the Secretary's Standards, the report shall list aspects of the project that are not consistent, along with guidance for modifying the project to comply with the Secretary's Standards; and

WHEREAS, staff retained the services of PAST Consultants ("PAST"), a contracted qualified professional retained by the city, to prepare a Phase II Evaluation ("Phase II") to determine whether the proposed relocation of the Community Room is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards; and

WHEREAS, PAST evaluated the project for consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Ten Standards for Rehabilitation in a Phase II dated January 12, 2023. PAST found that Standards #1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, and 10 are applicable to the project. The evaluation concluded that the project, as proposed, is not consistent with Standards #2, 5, 9, and 10 and therefore is not consistent with the Secretary's Standards; and

WHEREAS, the Phase II recommends as part of the conclusion: *The project under consideration proposes the relocation of a primary character-defining feature of the building complex's original design: the spatial relationship between the bank building and the Community Room. To maintain the integrity of the subject historic site and its environment, this report respectfully recommends a new design approach that allows the original Burde/Shaw design and the building complex's corresponding character-defining features to remain in place; and*

WHEREAS, notice of the public hearing was published on January 13, 2023, in compliance with State law (California Government Code 54956); and

WHEREAS, on January 23, 2023, the Historic Resources Board held a public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the Application, including, without limitation, the information provided to the Historic Resources Board by City staff and public testimony on the project in accordance with CMC 17.58.040.B; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution and its findings are made based upon the evidence presented to the Historic Resources Board at its January 23, 2023, hearing, including, without limitation, the staff report and attachments submitted by the Community Planning and Building Department; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Resources Board did hear and consider all said reports, attachments, recommendations, and testimony herein above set forth and used their independent judgment to evaluate the project; and

WHEREAS, the facts set forth in the recitals are true and correct and are incorporated herein by reference.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Historic Resources Board of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea does hereby find the project inconsistent with the Secretary's Standards as follows:

1. Relocating the Community Room from its original location would substantially alter the south elevation of the building complex and result in the removal of the elevated walkway, which is an important character-defining feature. (Standard 2)
2. Relocating the Community Room removes the spatial relationship between the bank building and the Community Room, which is a primary character-defining feature of the original design concept. (Standard 5)
3. Relocating the Community Room destroys historic materials of the covered walkway, removes the original landscape walls and raised pavement areas surrounding the Community Room, and alters the original design concept by relocating the Community Room elsewhere on the site. (Standard 9)
4. Relocating the Community Room is not reversible and will destroy the integrity of the setting of the historic resource. (Standard 10)

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historic Resources Board of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea issues a Finding of Noncompliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the relocation of the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex Community Room located at the southeast corner of Dolores Street and 7th Avenue in the Service Commercial (SC) Zoning district; APNs: 010-145-002, 010-145-023, 010-145-024.

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA THIS 23<sup>rd</sup> DAY OF JANUARY 2023, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Jordan Chroman  
Chair

---

Leah Young  
Historic Resources Board Secretary