Carmel Design Traditions 1.5
Residential Design Guidelines

Outline

Working draft: November 22, 2022

This outline is "informal," in that it includes notes at different levels of information under individual topics. It also may not be consistent in the use of conventional outline formatting. The intent is to provide more detail for topics where key changes in editing will occur and to provide less information for topics that will remain essentially as written in the existing design guidelines in the interest of "brevity."

The outline draws substantially upon the organization of the existing residential design guidelines but adds some new material. This is noted in parenthesis in some locations of the outline. The outline also indicates where a change in the degree of "emphasis" will occur for a guideline, noting, for example, that some things "must" occur. This is to indicate how "strengthening" of the existing guidelines will happen. In the actual editing, "shall" will be used as appropriate.

Most of the edits are based on the information collected during the strategy phase. That said, we are still reviewing the individual handbooks from Workshop #2. Therefore, some additional notes will be added as that information is evaluated. Furthermore, the approach to some of the more critical topics still needs further discussion. This will occur as we delve into the editing of the document itself.

Some notes about adding more illustrations are included in the outline as well. The notes about illustrations are in RED FONT. However, this is not all of the new images that will be included. Most topics will have more images; those noted in the outline are to be certain that those insertions are understood to be included.

The residential design guidelines document is organized into four "sections:"
Section 1. Introduction to Design Review
- Explains the system in general but not with the detail of the "tracks" that is in the current document.

Section 2. The Design Traditions of Carmel
- Adds new material that describes the valued characteristics of Carmel.
- Provides a summary of architectural styles and their features

Section 3. Concept level design guidelines
- Much of this is in the existing document, with edits as needed; also, some new topics are added.

Section 4. Final level design guidelines
- Much of this is in the existing document, with edits as needed; also, some new topics are added.

General graphics notes

1. Reuse all of the hand sketches from the existing guidelines; add color to all of them.
2. Some existing photos will be used, to express continuity of policies. These will be ones that are not "dated" (such as by a car in the foreground from that period).
3. Many existing photos will be replaced with contemporary color examples.
4. Some "grids" of photos will be included, to show a wider range of examples, both pro and con, as illustrated in the Strategy Paper.

SECTION ONE
<u>Introductory Material</u>

(Include a graphic for the back side of the section divider page: perhaps a screened back photo of a street scene?

<u>Introduction to the Design Review Process</u>

(Chapter: from existing guidelines, edited and expanded)

About the design guidelines

This describes the basic structure of the design review system, without going into detail that would become dated….

What are Design Guidelines?
(See existing text; minor edits to be made.)

Why have Design Guidelines?
(See existing text; minor edits to be made.)

Their scope
They apply to design in the R-1 zone districts
They also apply in other zone districts single family is allowed
Design categories
Single family houses
Landscaping on site
Design in the ROW
Includes ADUs and accessory buildings

The format of the Design Guidelines
Update existing text and graphic with new guidelines example, including new photo.)
Design objective
Guideline statement
Supplementary information
Illustrations

How the guidelines are organized
New paragraph, including….
Guiding principles
The two stages of review

By levels of context

Citywide (the Guiding principles)

Neighborhood level

Site level (landscapes and site features)

Buildings

Using this document (new material)

How property owners are to use it

Must demonstrate full compliance with the guidelines

Use at the outset of a project

Instruct designers and builders they must comply

How the City will use the DGs

In providing informal advice

During formal review

By staff

By a DRB?

By the PC

Determining compliance

Compliance with all relevant guidelines is required

Use of "should" and "shall"

Use of Imperative mood means "shall."

A formal "finding" must be recorded

The role of precedent

Previous approvals do not imply new decisions.

Conditions vary

Relationship to other policies and regulations

(New material; a short statement about each)

The General Plan

The zoning code

Other city policies

Historic resources

Climate change

Sustainable materials (maybe this is a subtopic of climate change)

Etc.

State laws

Regional Housing Needs Allocation

ADUs

Solar access

Coastal Commission

Planning a project

(from existing guidelines, edited; also update the associated diagram)

Reformat the existing flow chart diagram. (It has detailed text associated with it to review also.)

Consider the context (see explanation that follows)
Consider the site
Consider existing structures
Consider your program requirements
Summarize the basic approach

The Design Traditions of Carmel

(New section, to be adapted from previous DT 1.0 unpublished materials and recent sources, including workshop findings and Historic Context Statement.)

Defining characteristics of Carmel

(From the Strategy Paper, The following text is to be edited based on workshop comments.)
Carmel is a Village in the Forest which is:

We need to decide if we include photos in this Design Category. It could benefit from them, but the selection of images will be highly reviewed by the community; using only one image per topic could be a problem…using more creates clutter. Perhaps some form of montage at the beginning?

NEIGHBORHOOD

Subdued: No one thing is attention-grabbing; a building fits within the context of its block, its neighborhood and the city at large.

Exploratory: There is a sense of discovery along each street. One must experience a block in space and time, by moving along or through it.

Historic: A rich mix of historic and other traditional buildings, representing a range of styles is found throughout the community.

ARCHITECTURE

Genuine: A sense of authenticity is conveyed in natural building materials and design.

In scale: Buildings are human-scaled in their forms, materials and details.

Crafted: Buildings are of high quality and durable. This also is expressed in design details of buildings.

Diverse: There is variety in the range of building styles that fit in with the character of being a Village in the Forest.

Nestled: Buildings fit in with and are subordinate to the forest setting.

LANDSCAPES

Informal: Landscapes contribute to the forest character.

Walkable: Landscapes are pedestrian-scaled and enhance the public realm.

Connected: Properties connect to the public right-of-way with landscape details that extend the forest character. They are not walled off.

   DOWNTOWN
Pedestrian-friendly: Buildings are human-scaled with details at the street level that invite exploration.

Open and welcoming: Storefronts, courtyards and landscapes enhance the interplay of indoor and outdoor spaces.

Factors that distinguish one neighborhood from another
While many … to the Design Guidelines discussing how to consider the context of a project: (To be edited)

1. The amount of <u>light</u> available: This relates to the character of the tree canopy and street widths.

2. The extent of the <u>tree canopy</u>: Most streets are intended to have a sense of enclosure with a healthy tree canopy, but a few were planned to be more open, such as in the Mission area.

3. <u>Street widths</u>: This influences where on-street parking occurs and street edges are treated. Most are of similar widths, but narrower ones exist and others are wider, such as near the Mission.

4. Variations in <u>topography</u>: This may be in the slope of a street itself or of lots, which may occur as "uphill" and "downhill" conditions. This influences the location of garages, how building forms may be stepped on a site and the way in which view opportunities exist.

5. <u>Street layout:</u> Most street are laid out in a grid with informal street edges. A few actually are laid out with curves such as Ridgewood Rd. and a portion of 14th Avenue.

6. The different <u>phases</u> in which the City has developed: Carmel City began in 1888 as a community of approximately 40 blocks. …….

Understanding "context"
   New text:
   What is context?
   How context is defined and used
   Variations in context (by neighborhood, etc.)
Insert a graphic of different "layers" of context.

Historic Development Patterns

(A brief overview of development in Carmel, from the earlier publication and the historic context statement)

Reuse the historic photos in the old "The City's Design Character" publication to the extent feasible.

> First European Settlers
> The Mission
> Modest beginnings
> Etc…..

A sampling of Carmel Styles

(to be adapted from the earlier publication and the historic context statement)

Update with new images of styles; see historic context for suggestions; ask staff for examples.

> A photograph of each typical style is included.
> Key features of the individual styles are listed for each style
> The intent is to build an appreciation of the quality of design and variety in detailing, all within a range that is consistent with village character

The Expansion of Carmel

Carmel City began…(edit text from the old Design Character of Carmel publication, which is derived from the Historic Context statement.)

Use existing graphics, including map of annexations

The Evolution of a Block in Carmel

What were the typical development patterns of a block?…(edit text from the Design Character publication.)

Use existing graphics showing development of a block over time.

SECTION TWO

Concept level design guidelines

(Much of this material exists in the current design guidelines. Edits focus on adding emphasis and clarity for interpretation. Some key new topics also are added.)

Add a graphic for the back side of the section divider page: a screened back photo?

Guiding principles

(To be adapted from the Strategy Paper, to be edited based on workshop comments)

We need to decide if we include photos in this section. It could benefit from them, but the selection of images will be highly reviewed by the community; using only one image per topic could be a problem…using more creates clutter. Perhaps some form of montage at the beginning?

1.0 Guiding Principles Title

Introduction to the guiding principles…
How the Guiding Principles are used
They are part of the design guidelines.
All projects <u>must</u> demonstrate compliance with them.

1.1 Maintain a healthy forest character.
- Plan all landscapes in both the public and private realms to sustain the Village in a Forest and restore areas that are in need.
- The compatibility of many buildings also is improved with more forest-like front yards.

1.2 Enhance the forest in all improvement projects.
- Provide layers of landscaping (varying plant and tree heights) between the street and each home and use drought-tolerant plants and fire-resistant materials while continuing to convey the forest character.

1.3 Keep it modest.
- Design buildings and landscapes to be human-scaled and fit in with their surroundings rather than stick out.

1.4 Respect historic precedents.
- Retain traditional buildings that convey the history of the community.

1.5 Fit with the context.
- "Remember your neighbors" is an important principle. This varies by neighborhood.

- Key design factors include:
    - Building size (height and width)
    - Building form and proportion
    - Percentage of solid-to-void (ratio of windows to wall)
    - Building materials
    - Roof form
    - Color
    - Fit with the topography

1.6 Pay attention to detail.
- Convey excellence and authenticity in materials and design.
- Add value with well-crafted work that is visible to the community and promote the use of natural materials.

1.7 Encourage a "compatible diversity" in design.
- Avoid repetition in building designs and site features. Express individuality in subtle ways while respecting surroundings.

Neighborhood-wide guidelines (Concept level)

(from the existing design guidelines, to be edited for clarity and emphasis; some new topics also are added.)

2.0 Site Assessment
2.1 Conduct a preliminary site assessment
   Existing text to be edited.
   This <u>must</u> be documented as part of a review submittal.

3.0 Preserving the forest character
3.1 Existing significant….Retain key elements
   (See existing text.)
3.2 Locate new…
   (See existing text.)
3.3 Protect root systems…
Use existing b&w photos (the two images of roots being disturbed).
3.4 Maintain and enhance…
   (See existing text.)

<u>Right-of-way-character</u>

New photo(s) of appropriate ROW character, with native plantings, bark
    Design in the ROW
        Must maintain forest character, etc.

3.5 xxx (new DG text about ROW design.)

<u>Parking in the ROW</u>

Use the photo provided from the steering committee of a car parked among the trees.
        Must be "informal"
        Show preferred examples, Yes and no
Show an inappropriate parking solution, with the ROW paved; perhaps one of the old photos so we don't have someone's current car? Or an image that doesn't show the license plate?
    3.6 xxx (new DG text

    3.7 Where a parking area…(See existing)

<u>Preserving historic resources (new text)</u>

Perhaps staff can get a couple of photos of officially registered landmarks to use?
    Reference special review of listed resources
    Reference potential flexibility and incentives for preservation

    3.8 xxxxxxx (general statement about preserving; also reference ordinance and official inventory)

4.0 Neighborhood street character guidelines

<u>Street layout/grid</u>

    4.1 Maintain traditional…(see existing text)

<u>Street edge, curbs and gutters</u>

Nice street edge photo(s); could use old ones of gutters; they are pretty good, even if in b&w.

    4.2 Maintain existing patterns…(see existing text)

    4.3 Maintain the existing character of street gutters…(see existing text)

Site planning guidelines (Concept level)

(from existing DGs, to be edited)

5.0 Working with topography

Topography and slopes

Do we want a sketch of a stepped retaining wall?
Also a diagram of the stepping of a building on a slope?
Should we re-do the existing sketches to better reflect the types of buildings being constructed
today: make it a two story building, with a stepped form?

5.1 Minimize construction on steep slopes. …(see existing text)

5.2 Minimize cut and fill…(see existing text)

5.3 Minimize visual impacts……(see existing text)

5.4 Avoid abrupt changes……(see existing text)

Site Drainage

5.5 Retain water on site …(edit existing text)

5.6 Design retainage as an amenity (expand guidance)
Use rain gardens
Reference other materials and regulations

Create a free-hand sketch of a rain garden;

6.0 Open space, site coverage and setbacks

6.1 A significant portion of each site…
Minimize site coverage
Reference code requirements
Summarize what counts as site coverage
Use the existing sketch of combined driveways, with color added.

Front setbacks (new material)
Use existing sketch of staggered front setbacks, with color added.

6.2 Provide variety in building setbacks (expand existing text)
Primary structures

Secondary structures (garages)

6.3 Stagger front setbacks…(expand existing text

Side yard setbacks

6.4 Consider locating open space…(see existing text)
Use existing sketches showing how open space can be combined; add color.
6.5 Variety in side yard setbacks is encouraged……(see existing text)
Create a plan view (sketch or model?) of a building that has some sidewall offsets that result in varied setbacks.

Garage Encroachment (new text)
Provide more detail about criteria for considering encroachment of a garage.
Note this is a conditional use… perhaps revocable if use changes?…
- Must be consistent with main building
- Etc.

6.6 xxxx (new DG about encroachment)
Must be small in scale; must be at grade…
Cannot have a sloped cut driveway
Sketch or photo of inappropriate drive?

6.7 xxxxx (new DG about encroachment)
Must be subordinate to the forest

Progression of Spaces

6.8 Use a progression of space spaces…(see existing)
Provide a progression of spaces in front portion of the site
Expand discussion about "layering" of landscape elements
Reference other guidelines that follow for more specific details
Use existing sketch, with color; revise annotations and leader lines.
Also add a grid of good examples of progression of space.

Tree protection (revised section)

6.9… protect roots..
See other city information…
Does staff have any photo of a good example of protecting tree roots?

6.10…xxx (revised DG)
Revise the existing DGs to be more general (delete the prescriptive standards)
Reference specific prescriptive standards that are located elsewhere.

Landscaping (new?)

Maybe a grid of good front yard landscapes goes here? (There would be another one later, in the Final DGs section.)

6.11 Landscaping <u>must</u> be included in a project

6.12 Add general guidelines about landscaping
Maintaining forest character
Informal planting arrangements
Also reference more detailed planting recommendations in other locations

7.0 Privacy, views, light and air
Privacy

7.1 Organize functions… Preserve reasonable privacy
Expand discussion on considering neighbors

Views

Use current sketches, with color.

7.2 Maintain views to natural features (existing text)

7.3 Share views with neighbors (maintain through a property)
Photo(s) of shared views looking through trees and over houses to the ocean? (Maybe the existing one?)

Light and air

7.4 Maintain access for neighbors (expanded)

7.5 Maintain solar access (expanded)
Photo of rooftop solar panels

8.0 Parking and access
New photos similar to old ones illustrating various topics; reuse the carport image; also the old photo of a garage tucked under is good.

8.1 Minimize impacts (not dominate) from existing text

8.2 Parking facilities that maintain…(edit existing)
Coordinate with landscape and building designs

Driveway design

Reuse sketch of shared driveway, in color.
Reuse photo of carport
Reuse other color photos from our interim mockup for this section.

8.3 Locate driveway separate from a walkway (see existing text)

Use old sketches, in color

8.4 Minimize width and amount of paving
   Use permeable materials (expand discussion and provide more examples)

8.5 Limit the degree of cut (slope) for driveway (new)
   May <u>not</u> result in a three-story wall exposed to the street

Garage location

A series of site diagrams, or Sketchup models, might go here to show yes and no examples of by-right garage locations (not encroachment condition)

8.6 Position… to Minimize impacts on the street and on trees
   Address differences in relation to topography (uphill and downhill conditions)

8.7 Locate a garage to minimize…
   Conceal the garage entrance when feasible.

8.8 in limited circumstances…
   Locating a garage under a house
   Re-emphasize that this is permitted <u>only</u> in limited circumstances (as currently stated in the DGs)
   When other options are not feasible
   When the resulting design minimizes impacts

Building design – concept level

9.0 Building mass and scale

Building mass

9.1 A building's mass should relate…(see existing; expand)

9.2 Minimize the appearance of mass as viewed from the street
> Use a one story element in front

Models or photos of good and bad front massing examples;

9.3 Organize the mass into realistic modules to reduce perceived size
> Avoid overly busy variations in wall planes.
> (provide more illustrations)

Reuse the two old sketches, with color added. But also create a series of Sketchup models of Yes and No examples. Or a matrix of photos of examples?

9.4 Avoid placing a tall… (see existing)

9.5 Step the building height…(see existing)

9.6 When locating floor area…(see existing)

Building scale

9.7 Convey human scale(see existing; expand)
> Explain the term, "human scale"

Building height
Sketches of front height, yes and no? There would be variations on one and two story options, perhaps. RELATES TO ALTERNATIVES ABOUT BULK PLANE IN FRONT

9.8 A building shall appear to be no more than two stories…
> Provide a one-story element in front
> Perhaps reference Bulk Plane, if that moves forward
> Two story maximum as viewed from street
>> Minimize amount of exposed underfloor wall surface as viewed from the street

Provide new illustrations – "Yes and no". PHOTO OR MODEL?
> Step the building mass with the topography

10. Building Form

Building form

10.1 A building form should…(from existing)
   Keep it simple
Include more "yes" and "no" example in Sketchup models

10.2 Use restraint when introducing…(see existing)

Roof form

10.3 Use simple roof forms…(see existing)
   Keep it simple

10.4 A roof form should be in proportion…(see existing)
   Keep in proportion
   Roof pitch
       Pitched roofs are preferred.
           Mention flexibility for pitched roofs related to authentic styles
           Flat roofs
               Only on a one story element is permitted in front
Maybe a matrix of photos (or sketches?) of roof pitches/forms, related to different styles?

10.5 Roof eave lines should appear low in scale.

SECTION THREE

Final level design guidelines

(Much of this material exists in the current design guidelines. Edits focus on adding emphasis and clarity for interpretation.)

Some sort of graphic for the back side of the section divider page: a screened back photo?

Building design – Final Details

(to be edited from existing DGs)

Introduction to building design

> Keep the design simple.
> Promote diversity of styles.
> Be consistent within an individual building

11.0 Guidelines for building design

(expanded discussion)

Architectural style

11.1 Designing in historic styles
> Accurate historic styles are permitted/encouraged
> "Good" (simplified) interpretations of historic styles also are permitted
> Must be in scale, meet other guidelines

11.2 Diversity in building design
> Fitting in a new "contemporary" style
> > Must meet all the design guidelines, including landscaping
> Diversity is discussed in two ways:
> > Avoiding repetition of the same design
> > Accommodating new "styles" that fit in

Simple and restrained character

11.3 Keep building forms, materials…restrained…
> Simple and restrained character is required

Building scale

11.4 Must appear low in scale

11.5 Must be subordinate to forest character

Design integrity

Some hand sketches? Somehow showing consistency in a design concept, versus a "scrambled" design with different ideas?

11.6 Must have a consistent design concept throughout

Architectural details

11.7 Must have a sense of authenticity
Scale of building details must be in keeping

A matrix of good details from Carmel; Eaves, windows, doors, etc.

Building materials

Photo matrix of appropriate building materials, including some alternative materials?

11.8 Provide variety along the block

11.9 Use of natural materials is preferred

11.10 Wood…xxxx…
Examples
Lap siding
Shingles
Board and batten
Etc.
11.11 Stone as a building material…
Application of stone:
Can't "float" above lighter materials
May not appear as a veneer
May not be an "accent" panel
Types of stone permitted
Carmel stone or similar

11.12 Brick as a building material…

11.13 Stucco as a building material…

11.14 Alternative materials may be permitted.
They must appear similar in character to natural materials

Types permitted
How they must be applied
Show yes and no examples of apply stone; use existing sketches, with color to extent feasible.

Roof Design

11.15 Roof materials should be consistent…
Types permitted
Shingles
Tiles
Metal

11.16 Relationship to building style
Must be consistent
Must be in scale

11.17 Alternative roof materials may be considered
Must appear similar to traditional materials
11.16 new technologies in roofs…
Cool roofs
Solar panels

Entrances and porches

11.17 Keep in scale
11.18 Integrate with the overall design
Photos(s) of oversized entries from outside of Carmel.
Also use the existing sketch of an oversized entry, in color

Windows and doors

11.19 Style must be consistent with architecture
Location on street facing walls
Proportion of solid to void must be similar to traditions (no large surfaces of blank walls facing the street)
photos of appropriate and inappropriate window to wall ratios?
Detailing (frames must have depth, convey high quality and durability)
Close up details of windows with appropriate depth of frames, muntins, etc.

Balconies and decks
Decks in the rear only
Locate balconies to maintain privacy
Keep balconies in proportion

Skylights (and other rooftop appurtenances)
Location
Character

Night sky impacts

Chimneys

Integrated with overall design

Must appear authentic

Use existing yes and no sketches of chimneys, in color

Garages

New photos of good garages; could be a grid?

Subordinate to house

Integrated design

Garage door

Minimize size

Blend with building

No "stock" doors

Other secondary structures (including detached ADUs)

Must be consistent with design of the house

Conversion of a garage to an ADU that does NOT encroach

Address treatment of the existing driveway

Retain as parking space, or

Convert to front yard landscaping

Reference zoning code provision that a garage which has been permitted to encroach is a conditional use; can it be converted to an ADU?

Color (reframe the "note" about color in the existing DGs into formal guidelines)

Keep the overall color scheme muted.

Provide examples of close up color schemes, in a matrix; focus on muted colors. Somehow we want to talk about use of white… if the building is small, but not large and if landscaping is in front?

Be consistent with the style

Building lighting (exterior)

Matrix of yes and no light fixtures (or just photos some in a side column?)

Minimize number of fixtures

Screen light source from street

Promote night skies principles

Landscape design – final phase

      i.   Introduction to landscape design

          1.   Intent is to maintain forest character

Matrix of some "nice" photos of forest character in front yard landscapes

      ii.   Landscape guidelines

          1.   Enhance the tree canopy

          2.   Plant selection

              a.   Native

              b.   Drought-tolerant

              c.   Fire resistant

          3.   Landscaping in ROW

              a.   Must be natural, informal

          4.   Paving materials and design

Photo examples of paving materials, in the side column?

              a.   Must use muted colors

              b.   Must be permeable

              c.   Must be tree-friendly (not impact roots, etc.)

      iii.   Fences, walls, site lighting & utilities

          1.   General

              a.   Must fit with forest character

              b.   Should be subordinate to plant materials in the landscape

              c.   Must provide views into the site

                   i.   Semi-permeable

                 ii.   Low in height

          2.   Fences in front yards

The matrix of fences that we mocked up an as example in the Strategy Paper

              a.   Open yard without a fence is preferred

              b.   Fence design must be informal

                   i.   No "industrial" designs

              c.   Fence Materials

                 i.   Wood, unpainted or stained

                       1.   May be treated for first resistance

                 ii.   Metal pickets permitted?

                iii.   No stone piers

                iv.   No synthetic materials

          3.   Garden walls (in front yards)

              a.   Must be low in scale – maintain view into site

               b.   Must be stone, with matte finish

              c.   Muted colors only

          4.   Retaining walls

              a.   Minimize the use of retaining walls

                 i.   Avoid in front yard

                       1.   Must demonstrate need

                       2.   Must step it in increments if permitted

        ii. Screen a retaining wall with a building

    b. Scale

        i. Minimize height

        ii. Step in increments

    c. Materials

        i. Stone, similar in appearance to Carmel stone

    d. Not permitted in the ROW

5. Gates and arbors

Matrix of gates, yes and no

    a. Maintain diversity in design

    b. Keep it simple, and in scale

    c. Use natural materials

6. Site Lighting

    a. Must be simple in character

    b. Must be shielded, focused downward

7. Utilities

    a. Heat pumps

        i. Location

        ii. Screening

    b. Utility meters

SECTION FOUR

Some sort of graphic for the back side of the section divider page: a screened back photo?

Resources

Definitions of key terms
Are these to be included? Is this really useful? Or perhaps better to reference them?

Credits