

From: **Sue McCloud** <
Date: Fri, Sep 10, 2021 at 9:59 AM
Subject: WWI Monument for the
To: <

brandon

I thought perhaps former Planning Chair and architect Don Goodhue who lived across the street from Greene might have some definitive insight but just talked to him and he has zip.

So here is the reference in Hale's book pg 99 about Greene's gift to the city I have one other former neighbor of Greene's to contact--but they have homes in Carmel and Washington and have not been able as yet to reach them.:

"World War 1 Memorial Arch was designed by Charles Sumner Greene, who also supervised its construction as a gift to Carmel. The memorial was built in 1921 in place of the old water trough, plumbed by Thomas Reardon in earlier times. It was built in **commemeration of the fifty-six men who left Carmel to fight in the First World War**, and was **spurred into being by the Carmel American Legion which spearheaded a year long fund raising project**. Activities included a dance (Fandango) at the La Playa, and the production of three plays at the Manzanita Theater. On November 11, 1921, the cornerstone was laid, complete with time capsule. Upon completion of the arch, Charles Sumner **Greene also donated a "white stone bowl" on which he personally carved a design of breaking waves**. Many of us remember that drinking fountain well, and were sorry to see it removed in the 1960's out of fear of vandalism"

At this point it seems clear why, and who built the memorial and for what purpose.. commemorating those who served in the war! Which in turn is consistent with the memorials in Devendorf--except for the 9/11 memorial.

Sue

In a message dated 9/9/2021 9:19:23 AM Pacific Standard Time, bswanson@ci.carmel.ca.us writes:

Ah, thank you for the clarification. I will also fly this up the flagpole with our City Attorney while you reach out to your contact. I hope you will be able to join the HRB meeting tomorrow to participate as well.

Will stay in touch...

-Brandon

Brandon Swanson [he, him, his]
Director, Community Planning and Building
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea
(831) 620-2024
Pronouns: he, him, his

On Thu, Sep 9, 2021 at 8:59 AM Sue McCloud <cloud93921@aol.com> wrote:
Thx Brandon--

but my concern is any entity changing a donation to the City--e.g. I was very involved with Doolittles in raising money for the renovation of Sunset and put my money where my mouth is with a large 6 figure gift. So absent any info to the contrary all you have to go on is the account that Greene donated the design and oversaw the construction of the monument as his gift--the City accepted the gift and that should not be undone--**it is a legal issue**. I remember a general discussion I had with Greene at his home on Carmelo when I was on the Planning Commission but nothing I could quote and his daughter Betty is the one who ran the stables on Junipero where we kids rode our horses down to the beach. I have one more contact who might have personal knowledge--will get back to you

sue

In a message dated 9/9/2021 8:39:53 AM Pacific Standard Time, bswanson@ci.carmel.ca.us writes:

Mayor McCloud,

Thanks for the email, we will ensure that this gets to the HRB members today.

-Brandon

On Wed, Sep 8, 2021 at 6:42 PM Sue McCloud < > wrote:

Brandon

I was contacted this afternoon re the Historic Board meeting this Friday and an agenda item re the WWI monument.

You may have seen my Aug 26 Letter in the Carmel Pine Cone:

"In answer to Mary Schley's article in the current Pine Cone "Should WWI Plaque Honor Only Veterans?" My answer is a resounding YES!

To quote from Sharon Lee Hale's book, " A Tribute to Yesterday", "The World War 1 Memorial Arch was designed by Charles Sumner Greene, who also supervised its construction as a gift to Carmel. The memorial was built in 1921 ...in place of the old Carmel watering trough...in commemoration of the 56 men who left Carmel to fight in the First World War". Greene's objective in his generous gift to the City is very clearly stated.

None of us 100 years later is in a position to modify Charles Sumner Greene's gift memorializing those 56 men--to do so would be to ignore their putting their lives on the line in World War 1--it is after all called a "Memorial Arch"!

Sue McCloud".

I added to the above with a second item re WWII which I have sent to all of Council and is also repeated below.

"The key point is that the Monument given to the City by resident and architect Charles Sumner Greene was his gift to the City. The City cannot not modify this gift and Mr. Greene is no longer alive.

I wish now to supplement the above with comments I made speaking for the Council and City at the 2009 Memorial Day service in Devendorf Park which expands on the above:

"This simple granite boulder pays tribute to the 20 men from Carmel-by-the-Sea who lost their lives in WWII. These men represented the RAF, Army Air Force, Marine Corps, Navy, Navy Air Corps and Merchant Marine. The American Flag flying proudly above, provides a constant reminder of the men, their sacrifice and the ever-present need for bravery and selflessness in times of national danger. One can imagine they felt protected and immune from the realities of the outside world in this bucolic and friendly village. But even before war broke out formally, many of these Carmel men realized where their duty lay and enlisted hoping to stave off war or to be there to defend us if war came.

The citizens of Carmel hold these lost servicemen in the highest love and respect for their heroism and selfless devotion to their country in its time of greatest crisis. The 20 families felt their loss then, and still today these men are missed by family and friends. Their stories are poignant and inspiring and although some remain elusive, their sacrifice is of no less consequence.

In 2000 an article in the Pine Cone told the story of a retired English Royal Air Force Flight Lieutenant, Ray Ravenscroft, who visited Carmel and was intrigued when he saw that the first Carmel serviceman killed, Gordon Bain, served in the RAF. On his return to England, Lt. Ravenscroft did further research into Bain. In his words, "Pilot Bain enlisted in the RAF in August 1941, some four months before Pearl Harbor. As an American citizen he did not have to join." This article was the inspiration to preserve the history of these men wherever possible.

The hope has been to lift the names of these men up from the dusty records of history and almost 65 years later to refresh them with the color of their lives, remember them among their family and friends, hear of their hopes and dreams, and honor their bravery and sacrifice with a sense of unbounded admiration and gratitude.

Two of those who died in WWII were veterans of WWI. Their dedication to country was exceptional. The majority, however, were in their twenties and teens. Carmel author Bechdolt's words touch us with the true spirit of the youth and dreams of these young men:

'And in the long run we will always find the greatest pride in remembering those who blossomed so quickly into the splendor of fighting manhood and remember them as they were when we saw them among us'."

The point here is we cannot undo the purpose of their service and subsequent sacrifice. Similarly the City cannot undo the gift of Charles Sumner Greene.

Sue McCloud
Mayor, 2000-2012"