



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Historic Resources Board

May 18, 2015

**To:** Chair Dyar and Board Members

**From:** Marc Wiener, Senior Planner

**Subject:** Consideration of a Design Review (DR 14-38) application and associated Coastal Development Permit for alterations to the Carmel Mission including improvements to the parking area, courtyards, and gift shop

---

**Recommendation:**

Issue a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

**Application:** DR 14-38

**APN:** 009-531-003

**Block:** US

**Lot:** 38

**Location:** SW Corner of Rio Road and Lasuen Drive

**Applicant:** Brett Brenkwitz, architect

**Property Owner:** Dioceses of Monterey

**Background:**

The Carmel Mission is located at the southwest corner of Rio Road and Lasuen Drive. The Mission property is approximately 6 acres in size and includes the Carmel Mission, Junipero Serra School, Murphy Gymnasium, Gift Shop, the Bishop's residence and several other structures. Construction of the Mission Basilica was completed in 1797, but many of the buildings on the site, including the Downie Museum, Mora Chapel, the Blessed Sacrament Chapel, the Convento, and the Gift Shop, were constructed in the early to mid 1900's. The Carmel Mission is listed on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources and the Mission Basilica and the associated grounds are listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

In 2010, the City approved the seismic retrofit and structural support of the Mission Basilica that included the in-kind replacement of siding and roofing materials in certain areas of the building. The project also included the construction of an ADA compliant restroom at the rear of the Basilica. Staff notes that the project was completed in 2013 and the applicant has indicated that the work was the first phase of a two-phase project.

The applicant has now submitted a proposal for Phase II of the project. The primary purpose of the proposed work is to update the existing infrastructure of the Carmel Mission. The City's Historic Preservation Consultant, Mr. Kent Seavey, has drafted a report (Attachment B) which includes a project summary. The following is a bullet-point list of the proposed alterations.

Front (East) Elevation Changes:

- Grading of the parking lot to provide three new ADA parking spaces, improved drainage, and new paths of travel
- Reconstruction of the 1928-1938 arch over the entry gate
- Removal a portion of the non-historic plaster wall adjacent to the Gift Shop to provide a pedestrian entry with new wood gates
- Proposal to switch the Gift Shop entry door with an adjacent window in order to improve circulation
- Replacement of a window on the north elevation of the Gift Shop with a Dutch door
- Increase the height of the porch in front of the Blessed Sacrament Chapel, which requires a new set of concrete stairs and planter boxes to serve as guardrails. The purpose of the alteration is to meet ADA requirements.

Basilica Forecourt and Downie Building:

- Minor grade alterations to the east portion of the Basilica Forecourt for the purpose of meeting ADA requirements, which include a ramp that connects the courtyard to the fountain, gardens, and Downie Orientation Center.
- Seismic retrofit of the Downie building and installation of an ADA family restroom on the west side of the building in an area currently used as a storage space
- Removal of an interior adobe wall in order to expand the interpretive space. The applicant is proposing to delineate the location of the original wall on floor to provide a guide for the potential future replacement of the wall.
- Installation of a new Carmel Mission site model at the front of the building

Mora Chapel

- Seismic retrofitting, cleaning, and conservation as necessary
- Installation of new exhibit panels and cases within the building
- Floor of the south facing Loggia will have a new ADA accessible boardwalk
- New interpretive panels on the south side of the Loggia in the voids between the support columns

#### Convento Museum Wing

- Seismic retrofitting, cleaning, and conservation as necessary
- Addition of new exhibit panels and display cases
- Several interior alterations that included new structural shear walls in the kitchen area and alterations to stairs. The existing floor plan is depicted on Sheet A-10 of the plan set and the proposed is depicted on Sheet A-11 for comparison.

#### Blessed Sacrament Chapel

- Seismic retrofitting, cleaning, and conservation as necessary
- Removal of a shed roof above the carriage gates on the west elevation (see Sheet A-20) to allow access for trucks
- Addition of a ADA access ramp on the west elevation

#### Main Quadrangle

- The removal of the Main Quadrangle concrete in order to install drainage, sewage, storm water and other infrastructure improvements, including some additional planting areas.

#### New Restroom

- Addition of a new restroom at the southwest corner of the Main Quadrangle. The proposed restroom is 621 square feet in size, and includes a Spanish-style design with stucco siding and a clay-tile roof.

#### **Staff analysis:**

**Environmental Review:** The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requires environmental review for alterations to historic resources that are not consistent with the. If the alterations are consistent with the standards, potential historic resource impacts under CEQA do not require further analysis. Staff has determined that this project is consistent with the Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation and therefore no additional environmental review is required.

**Consultant Review:** The proposed project was reviewed by the City's Historic Preservation Consultant, Kent Seavey. An analysis is included as Attachment B. Mr. Seavey determined that

the project would be consistent with the Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation, and has made the following recommendations to achieve consistency with the Secretary's Standards:

1. That the replacement concrete installed on the east portion of the Basilica Fourcourt employ an earth-tone tint consistent with the historic character of the Forecourt setting.
2. That removal of the adobe wall in the Downie Building is done in a manner that it can be replaced in the future. The applicant is proposing to delineate the location of the original wall on floor to provide a guide for the potential future replacement of the wall. Staff recommends that the applicant maintain a photographic record of wall as well.
3. That the pavement removed from the Quadrangle will be replaced to match existing in pattern and material type.

Staff concurs with Mr. Seavey's analysis and recommendations. Special conditions have been drafted to address each of these recommendations.

**Entry Arch Reconstruction:** The Secretary of the Interior (Secretary) Standard #9 recommends that *"be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion to protect the integrity of the property and its environment."*

The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the arch over the entry gate fronting the Forecourt, as depicted on Sheet A-17 of the plan set. The entry arch was constructed between the years of 1928-1938 and may have acquired historic significance in its own right. In staff's opinion, the addition/reconstruction of the arch will have some impact on the public view of the Mission Basilica. The Board should consider whether replacing the arch is an essential component of this rehabilitation project as it may impact the view of the Mission Basilica, which is the primary historic resource on the site.

**Planning Commission and City Council Review:** This application will be reviewed by the Planning Commission for the issuance of a Design Review approval and Coastal Development Permit, following the issuance of a Determination of Consistency by the HRB. The Commission may require design revisions. Staff will refer this application back to the HRB if the revisions are substantial or potentially inconsistent with the Secretary's Standards.

In addition, the northeast portion of the parking lot is located on the City Right-of-Way, and as such the applicant will be required to obtain an Encroachment Permit from the City Council in order to make the proposed modifications.

***Environmental Review:*** The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requires environmental review for alterations to historic resources that are not consistent with the. If the alterations are consistent with the standards, potential historic resource impacts under CEQA do not require further analysis. Staff concludes that the proposed alterations would be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and therefore, do not require additional environmental analysis.

***Alternatives:*** The staff recommendation is to issue a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary's Standards. Alternatively, the Board could direct additional changes to the plan to achieve consistency with the Secretary's Standards, in which case, the Board may need to continue the item to allow the applicant to return with further-revised plans. Finally, the Board could find the application inconsistent with the Secretary's Standards, which would result in either the applicant withdrawing the project or require additional CEQA analysis to evaluate impacts on historic resources.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

- Attachment A – Project Conditions
- Attachment B – Kent Seavey Report
- Attachment C – Secretary of the Interior Standards
- Attachment D – Project Plans

CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

DR 14-38  
Dioceses of Monterey  
SW Corner of Rio Road and Lasuen Drive  
Block: US, Lot: 38  
APN: 009-531-003

---

**SPECIAL CONDITIONS:**

1. The replacement concrete installed on the east portion of the Basilica Fourcourt shall include an earth-tone tint consistent with the historic character of the Forecourt setting. The applicant shall work with staff on an appropriate material.
2. Within the Downie Building the applicant shall delineate the location of the original wall on floor to provide a guide for the potential future replacement of the wall. In addition, the property owner shall maintain a photographic record of this wall.
3. The pavement removed from the Quadrangle will be replaced to match existing in pattern and material type.

\*Acknowledgement and acceptance of conditions of approval.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Property Owner Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Printed Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

***Once signed, please return to the Community Planning and Building Department.***

**SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR THE TREATMENT OF  
HISTORIC PROPERTIES**

1. "A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment."
2. "The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided."
3. "Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken."
4. "Most properties change over time; changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved."
5. "Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved."
6. "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, and pictorial evidence."
7. "Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible."
8. "Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken."
9. "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."
10. "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."