

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
CITY COUNCIL**

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, April 1, 2025

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Mayor Byrne called the meeting to order at 4:32 p.m.

Roll call: Councilmembers Jeff Baron, Hans Buder, Alissandra Dramov, Mayor Pro Tem Delves, and Mayor Dale Byrne were present.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Pro Tem Delves led the pledge of allegiance.

EXTRAORDINARY BUSINESS

A. Carmel High School Report Out - Juliette Norman, CHS Associate Student Body President, updated on events and happenings at the high school.

B. Non-Profit Spotlight - Project Healing Waters - Brian Steckler presented his organization's goals, mission, and how people can get involved or give support.

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

Cindy Lloyd

Hugo Ferlito

Donna Jett

ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. City Administrator - Cautioned residents to be wary of people coming to their house saying they are with the census bureau, and to contact the Police Department if they seem suspicious.

B. City Attorney - Announced that there is no reportable action from closed session yesterday.

C. Councilmembers -

Councilmember Dramov - Announced that the Tor House will hold its Annual Garden Party on May 4th and welcomed everyone to attend.

Mayor Byrne - Reported that he met with Michael Kovak, a resident who volunteered to do work at the post office and Youth Center and has worked with PW staff. The Mayor also reported on the ReGen meeting he attended.

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

Council moved to hear item #3 first.

Item 3 - Receive the Fiscal Year 2025-2026 Fee Schedule for Administrative Services, Community Planning and Building, Public Safety, Public Works, Community Activities and Library services

Finance Manager Jayme Fields presented the proposed updates to the citywide fee schedule, which includes Community Activities and Library Fees, to align them with the consumer price index (CPI). She also clarified that the ambulance fees are included in the city's proposed fee schedule to match those published by the County of Monterey. She said that the proposed fee schedule will come back to Council on May 5th during a public hearing for further discussion and adoption, with an effective date 60 days after adoption.

Public comment:
None

Councilmember Buder suggested hourly billing for Design Track 1 fees instead of a flat rate. Councilmember Dramov inquired about tree permit fees, and Councilmember Baron requested a column showing lowered fees in the May report.

Council gave consensus direction to approve the proposed fee schedule update and to bring it back on May 5th for a public hearing and adoption.

Item 1 - Draft Agreement with Carmel Public Library Foundation Regarding Harrison Memorial Library Centennial Restoration Project and Draft Agreement with Architectural firm Moore Ruble Yudell

City Attorney Pierik presented the item to Council highlighting the changes that were made to the agreement between the City and CPLF based on the Council's direction at the last meeting. He summarized the changes address the concerns of the Council and the CPLF and were mutually agreed upon through the City and the CPLF.

Public Comment:
Marci Meaux
Pam Nyman
Susan Prest
Dan (man in a suit)
Ken Cranstone
Erik Dyar
Cynthia McCoy
Valera Loyals
Gail Sheridan

Cindy Lloyd

Mayor Pro Tem Delves reported that the City and the Carmel Public Library Foundation (CPLF) successfully negotiated a fair contract with the City. He noted that the revised agreement establishes a two-person Council ad hoc committee in place of the five-member executive committee, and that it includes contractor payment and indemnification of the CPLF.

Councilmember Dramov proposed adding a plaque to the Harrison Memorial Library (HML) to acknowledge MJ Murphy as the building's designer. She noted that Exhibit A of the draft agreement contains inaccurate information about the designer and requested that it be removed and replaced. City Attorney Pierik said the CPLF would need to agree to an amendment to the agreement to change Exhibit A. Mayor Byrne suggested that the plaque approval be considered separately from the approval of the agreement with the CPLF. Councilmember Baron expressed support for Councilmember Dramov's proposal and concern about the inaccurate information in the contract.

The Council expressed gratitude to the City Attorney for his effective negotiations with the CPLF Board members and attorney, resulting in a contract that addresses all concerns. The Council's appreciation was also extended to current and future donors to the project, as well as all staff involved in moving this contract forward.

Motion by Councilmember Buder to adopt Resolution 2025-033 approving the agreement with Carmel Public Library Foundation Regarding Harrison Memorial Library Centennial Restoration Project, and authorize the Mayor to execute the agreement, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Delves, and approved 5-0-0-0 by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Baron, Buder, Delves, Dramov, and Mayor Byrne

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

ABSTAIN: None

Item 2 - Receive Staff presentation regarding street addresses; the presentation will include an overview of a draft street address system implementation plan and a draft community engagement plan, a legal analysis by the City Attorney regarding street identification and City Options, and estimated costs and timelines for elections (ballot measure); Discussion item only and no action by City Council is proposed at this meeting.

Mayor Pro Tem Delves introduced the item and posed key questions for Council consideration regarding street addresses. Administrative Analyst Emily Garay presented staff research, including historical context, Council directives, current knowledge, and remaining questions. City Attorney Pierik provided a legal analysis of street address identification requirements. Ms. Garay and Mr. Pierik then responded to Council questions. Assistant Fire Chief Moore confirmed that the Monterey Fire Department can enforce street addresses in alignment with Council policy direction.

Public Comment:

Hugo Ferlito
No name
No name
Linda Califiore
Donna Jett
Kevin Ruess
Carrie White
Joe DiNucci
Andi Carr
Connie Hess
Harvey Billig
Maria Ruess
Todd Muck
Karen Ferlito
Ole Pedersen
Betty Kullas
Cindy Lloyd
Randall
Melanie Billig
Shirley Moon
Karyl Hall
Lindamarie Rosier

Council discussion resumed. Mayor Pro Tem Delves proposed several questions for Council consideration:

- Election timing? (2025 or 2026)
- Formation of a citizen advisory group (such as the AHA group for housing alternatives), for street address alternatives that are AMS compatible?
- What address scheme would be appropriate for Carmel?
- What are the different numbering options? Pros and cons of each?
- What would the cost and process of assigning addresses and notifying utilities be?
- What role does the County play in this process?
- Would it be possible for residents to “opt-in” to addresses?
- Do we need a city code to prevent future encroachments for the installation of mailboxes?

Councilmember Dramov said that if we did go to a vote, it makes more sense to do it in November 2026 during a regularly scheduled election for cost reasons. Councilmember Baron disagreed with waiting and advocated for making a decision and moving forward with street address implementation, emphasizing the Council's responsibility to act in the public's interest. He noted strong resident support for addresses based on his campaign and several meetings of public input. He argued that after three years of discussion, further delay is unnecessary. Councilmember Buder also noted strong resident support for street addresses due to public safety, findability, and insurance concerns.

Mayor Byrne expressed support for creating a citizen advisory group with diverse views and research experience on street addresses, similar to the AHA group. He suggested that the group should aim to develop a “Carmel-style” AMS-compatible address plan by the end of the year.

The Council agreed to revisit the discussion in May to decide whether or not to hold a special election in 2025 regarding street addresses. Mayor Pro Tem Delves stated he would meet with City Staff, City Administrator, and few select residents in the meantime to conduct further research on the proposed questions and provide an update to the Council by July.

RECESS

Council took a recess at 7:56 pm and returned to the dais at 8:16 pm.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Item 4 - Consideration of an Appeal (APP 25034 (Faia) of the Planning Commission's decision to Approve a Track 1 Design Study referral (DS 24203, 24216, 24217 (Faia)) with conditions for the replacement of the wood shake roof of a two-story single-family residence located on the Northeast corner of Torres and 2 nd Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-101-021, 010-101-020, & 010- 101-012. CEQAAction: Find denying the Appeal and upholding the Planning Commission’s approval of a Track 1 Design Study categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 and no exceptions listed under Section 15300.2 can be made in this case.

City Planner Jacob Olander presented Ms. Faia's appeal (APP 25034), challenging the Planning Commission's denial of her request for a metal roof. He summarized that Ms. Faia’s appeal seeks Council approval to overturn the decision and allow her to install a metal roof. Mr. Olander then answered Council questions regarding the appeal.

Public comment:

Brandi Faia, appellant and homeowner, addressed the council with reasons why her appeal should be granted

Andi Carr

Maria Ruess

Kevin Ruess

Nathan Smith

Council discussion resumed. Mayor Pro Tem Delves noted that the Planning Commission lacks clear guidelines on approving metal roofs, and that fire concerns and insurance coverage issues have increased over the last few months. Council gave consensus support for the appeal after considering the appellant’s arguments supporting approval for her metal roof. Councilmember Buder reiterated that adopting a clear policy on metal roofs or roof materials is necessary to prevent future appeals.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Delves to approve the appeal by Faia, overturning the Planning Commission's decision, and allowing the applicant to get her metal roof, seconded by Councilmember Buder.

Mayor Byrne made a friendly amendment to the Motion on the floor, to include the addition of a refund to Faia for the appeal fee. Motion amendment was accepted by Mayor Pro Tem Delves.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Delves to approve the appeal by Faia, overturning the Planning Commission's decision to deny the metal roof, and therefore allow the metal roof, and to refund Faia's appeal fee, seconded by Councilmember Buder, and approved 5-0-0-0 by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Baron, Buder, Delves, Dramov, and Mayor Byrne

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

ABSTAIN: None

Item 5 - Consideration of an Appeal (APP 25038, Brown) by Dorothy Jernstedt, for the Approval of a Combined Concept and Final Design Study (DS 24164, Brown), and associated Coastal Development Permit for substantial alterations to an existing single-family residence, and Variance (VA 24263, Brown) for modifications to maximum site coverage regulations located at Scenic Road 3 southeast of 12th Avenue located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) Zoning District, Beach and Riparian (BR) Overlay, and Park (P) Overlay (APN: 010-292-011).

Mayor Byrne recused himself from this item due to the proximity of his home to the project and left the dais at 9:03 p.m.

City Planner Evan Kort presented the appeal, summarizing the project, the Planning Commission's approval and rationale, and the appellant's arguments, along with an analysis of their validity.

Public comment:

Krista Ostoich, attorney for the appellant

Dorothy Jernstedt, appellant

Anthony Lombardo, attorney for the project applicant (Brown)

Eric Miller, project architect

Steve Brown, property owner

Councilmember Dramov left the dais and the meeting at 9:35 p.m.

Councilmembers Baron and Buder found the appellant's view and privacy concerns to be unsubstantiated, and their primary concern was the variance request for the deck due to its disproportionate scale and inconsistent materials.

Councilmember Buder proposed remanding the variance decision back to the Planning Commission for further design review. Assistant City Administrator Swanson said that this action would only result in a design study on the merits of the design and wouldn't address the variance concerns. Councilmember Baron preferred a compromise that would satisfy the appellant and the project applicant by partially granting the appeal.

Motion by Councilmember Baron to partially grant the appeal, by approving the variance just to accommodate a deck that is 4 ft less wide from the house, as well as a special condition that the variance doesn't run with the land but runs with the house, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Delves, and approved 2-1-1-1

AYES: Councilmembers Baron, and Mayor Pro Tem Delves

NOES: Councilmember Buder

ABSENT: Councilmember Dramov

ABSTAIN: Mayor Byrne (recused)

Item 6 - APP 25038 (Lim): Consideration of an Appeal (APP 25038, Lim) by Hastings Construction on behalf of Liyoong Lim, for the Denial of a Track 2 Design Study and associated Coastal Development Permit, DS 22-057 (Lim) for the demolition of an existing 1,053 square-foot, one-story single-family residence, inclusive of a 205 square-foot detached garage, and the construction of a 1,793 square-foot, two-story single-family residence, inclusive of a 288 square-foot attached garage, located at Casanova Street 2 southeast of Palou Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District, Archaeological Significance (AS) Overlay, and Beach/Riparian (BR) Overlay. APN: 010-225-003-000

Mayor Byrne returned to the dais at 10:26 p.m.

Mayor Pro Tem Delves recused himself from the item due to proximity of his home to the project and left the dais at and the meeting at 10:26 p.m.

City Planner Evan Kort presented the appeal, summarizing the project, the Planning Commission's denial and rationale, and the appellant's arguments that they have met design guidelines and the direction of the Planning Commission. Mr. Kort presented the applicant's initial design, revised plan 1, and revised plan 2, and the analysis of the appeal's merits, and outlined the Council's options: uphold the Planning Commission's decision, overturn it, or modify it with amended findings or conditions.

Public Comment:

Anthony Lombardo, attorney for the applicant

Liyoong Lim, applicant/appellant

Adam Jesselnick

Angie Ferris, designer

Mike McCall

Ace Construction

Peter Blatman

Gwen McCall
Ian Martin
Greg Meissner

Council discussion resumed. Council raised concerns about the second-story massing and noted that the applicant's revised plans do not appear to be significantly different from the original. Mr. Kort responded that the massing on the second level had been noticeably shifted to the south to help mitigate impacts on neighbors' light and views. Councilmember Baron recommended that the Lim's return to the Planning Commission with a full redesign of the second story, and work with the neighbors to address the view and light concerns as the Planning Commission requested after the first hearing.

Motion by Councilmember Baron to deny the appeal, and remand the applicant back to the Planning Commission with a full redesign of the project, directing the applicant (Lim) to work with staff and the neighbors to mitigate view and light impacts, following the direction given at the first Planning Commission hearing, seconded by Mayor Byrne, and approved 3-0-1-1 by the following roll call vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Baron, Buder, and Mayor Byrne
NOES: None
ABSENT: Councilmember Dramov
ABSTAIN: Mayor Pro Tem Delves (recused)

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

None

ADJOURNMENT

Council adjourned the meeting at 11:51 p.m.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

Dale Byrne, Mayor

Nova Romero, MMC, City Clerk