



JB Pastor Project

October 3, 2023 City Council Resolution Analysis

We are pleased to submit our revised design for the proposed JB Pastor Project at Dolores 2 Southeast of 7th (APN's 010-145-012, 023, & 024). The revised design has been thoughtfully prepared in direct response to the October 3, 2023, City Council meeting where two members of the City Council enacted their Right of Review, overturning the July 17, 2023 decision of the Historic Resources Board. At this meeting the City Council issued a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards predicated on Recommendations and Conditions of Approval being incorporated into the JB Pastor project and being accepted and approved by the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Planning Commission. The intent of this analysis is to provide a summary of the conditions included in the resolution approved by the City Council at the October 3, 2023 City Council meeting and how the proposed JB Pastor project has been redesigned to address these conditions.

Condition for Consistence with Secretary's Standards

1. **Ornamented Concrete Wall.** Prior to review by the Planning Commission, the Design Review plans shall be revised and submitted to the Community Planning and Building Department, so that the original ornamented concrete walls located adjacent to the Community Room are shown to remain in their original locations and configuration.

Applicant Analysis: Our revised design proposes to retain the ornamented concrete wall in its original form, recognizing its historical and architectural significance as a defining element of the site. In alignment with best practices in historic preservation, we are committed to upholding the integrity of the City's Preservation Buffer, ensuring that no development will occur within this designated area. This approach is essential to preserving the site's character and maintaining its historic value, while also safeguarding its long-term cultural and aesthetic importance. Please refer to our latest Site Plan sheet A1.0, where we are keeping the existing driveway next to the ornamented wall.

2. **Preservation of Spatial Relationships.** Prior to review by the Planning Commission, the Design Review plans shall be revised and submitted to the Community Planning and Building Department, to preserve the existing spatial relationship of the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex. At a minimum, all proposed structural elements shall be located outside of the Preservation Buffer as depicted in Exhibit A of this resolution. Walkways, at grade stairways, landscaping, paving, and similar features may be allowed within the Preservation Buffer, however, building elements that are defined as building coverage (CMC 17.14.130) shall not be permitted to encroach. Building eaves shall be limited to an encroachment of 18 inches or less.

Applicant Analysis: Please refer to the revised plans. The updated design incorporates and respects the Preservation Buffer established by the City Council surrounding the existing the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex and more specifically the Community Room and historic concrete wall. This buffer is intentionally designed to further protect and preserve the historic spatial relationship of these two significant structures. In accordance with preservation guidelines, no new development will occur within this designated buffer, ensuring the continued integrity and visual prominence of the complex and its surrounding context.

In revising our design, we have carefully ensured full compliance with the Preservation Buffer requirements. In certain areas, particularly along the frontage of Dolores Street, we have intentionally exceeded the minimum setback to enhance the preservation of the site's defining features. Specifically, we have strategically kept the existing driveway adjacent to the Ornamented Concrete Wall to prevent any structures from being built in this area, a decision that not only respects the historical integrity of the wall but also preserves its visibility from the street. This approach underscores our commitment to maintaining the architectural and historical character of the site while also integrating the project in a thoughtful and sensitive manner.

3. **Preservation of Site Context.** To ensure the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex is not subordinated by the proposed development, prior to review by the Planning Commission, the Design Review plans shall be revised and submitted to the Community Planning and Building Department, to preserve the context of the site so that the Saving and Loan Complex remains a prominent feature as viewed from 7th Avenue and Dolores Street. Changes to be considered include but are not limited to: articulation of the front elevation to preserve and open the view from Dolores Street looking north, reducing and minimizing the mass of the structure(s) to maintain to not diminish the character of the complex, and further enhancing the open space around the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex.

Applicant Analysis: *The revised design strategically kept the existing driveway adjacent to the ornamented concrete wall, creating open space that enhances the visual connection to the Community Room while preserving the integrity of the historic ornamental wall. Additionally, the new front façade is recessed and set back to minimize the mass of the new building, allowing for an unobstructed view of the Community Room and the Ornamented Wall, thus ensuring the overall character of the complex is maintained. These features, combined with the preservation buffer, ensure that the Savings and Loan Complex continues to serve as a prominent architectural landmark at the corner of 7th Avenue and Dolores Street. Additionally, the height of the proposed building has been lowered so it is approximately 3.95 feet lower than the highest point of the Savings and Loan Complex (reference the Building Height Survey included with our application).*

Conditions of Approval

4. **Ornamented Concrete Wall.** The original ornamented concrete wall located at the southwest corner of the Community Room shall remain in its existing location and configuration. It shall remain unaltered and protected through construction. Site improvements shall not significantly obstruct the wall from public view and the wall shall remain accessible to the public as a piece of public art as part of a courtyard, interblock-walkway, or other means.

Applicant Analysis: *The City has established a Preservation Buffer around the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex, including the Community Room and the Ornamented Concrete Wall. In the revised design, we are fully adhering to this buffer and, in certain areas, exceeding the minimum requirements to further protect the integrity of these historic elements. Specifically, we have kept the driveway adjacent to the Ornamented Concrete Wall, effectively expanding the buffer beyond the prescribed limit. This approach enhances the preservation of the open space surrounding the Community Room, ensuring that the historical significance of the complex is respected, and its visual prominence is maintained. Additionally, we have maintained the interblock-walkway through the proposed JB Pastor project and the Savings and Loan Complex.*

5. **Community Room Repairs.** If repairs or alteration of any nature are proposed for the Community Room, the applicant shall submit in writing to the Community Planning and Building Department an application outlining the details of any proposed work for review and approval prior to commencement of work. Any deteriorated exterior elements for the Community Room should be repaired, rather than replaced whenever possible.

Applicant Analysis: We are keeping the Ornamental Concrete Wall and Community Room intact, no proposed changes to these existing structures are planned. Any deteriorated exterior elements of the community room building will be repaired, rather than replaced whenever possible. Any repairs to the exterior, if necessary, will adhere to historic structures rehabilitation standards.