
Keith Higgins

Traffic Engineer

July 3, 2024

Ryan Aeschliman
Project Manager
Esperanza Carmel
7th Ave 2 NW of Lincoln
Carmel-by-the-Sea, CA 93923

Re: JB Pastor Building Trip Generation and Vehicle-Miles-Traveled Study, Dolores, 2nd SE of 7th, Carmel-by-the-Sea, California

Dear Ryan,

Per your request, this is a traffic study for the proposed JB Pastor Building (Project), located at Dolores Street, 2nd Southeast, Carmel-by-the-Sea, California (City). The Project site is currently occupied by a total of about 2,292 gross square feet of commercial floor area and one residential unit. The Project will have a total of about 6,541 gross square feet of commercial floor area including the existing 692 net square-foot fine dining restaurant floor space in Unit 107 and 8 multifamily dwelling units.

The currently proposed site and floor plans are provided in **Attachment A**, which also includes a Project location map is included on the first page. A demolition plan is provided as **Attachment B**, which indicates the existing community building, which is the location of the existing wine tasting room that will remain. It also depicts the two existing buildings along the south property line that will be removed. A tabular summary of Project components is included as **Attachment C**.

This study includes the following.

1. An estimate of Project trip generation and qualitative discussion of its effect on nearby traffic operations. Trip generation is estimated for the proposed project based on trip generation rates in the ITE Manual. The ITE Manual is the standard source of trip generation data used throughout the traffic engineering and transportation planning industry.
2. A Vehicle-Miles-Traveled (VMT) evaluation is included as well, which is required per the latest California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) regulations.

A. PROJECT TRIP GENERATION

Attachment D provides a tabular summary of the traffic anticipated to be generated by each component of the Project, as summarized in the following discussion. These are based on trip generation rates

Ryan Aeschliman
July 3, 2024

provided in "Trip Generation Manual," Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), 11th Edition, 2021, tabulated on Attachment

1. Proposed Project trip generation is estimated to include the following, as tabulated on **Attachment D, Section B**.
 - a. Retail Commercial - The Project's retail spaces, which are assumed to include Units 101 through 106, will generate about 366 gross daily trips with 17 during the AM peak hour and 39 during the PM peak hour. According to the "Trip Generation Manual," Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), 11th Edition, 2021, an average of about 34% of retail trips are captured from traffic already passing the Project to and from a primary destination. The resulting net retail trips represent an increase in traffic on the nearby street system of about 242 daily trips with 11 during the AM peak hour and 26 during the PM peak hour.
 - b. Fine Dining Restaurant - The existing fine dining restaurant floor area will remain as Unit 107. It is estimated to continue to generate about 66 gross daily trips with 1 during the AM peak hour and 6 during the PM peak hour. According to the "Trip Generation Manual," Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), 11th Edition, 2021, an average of about 44% of fine dining restaurant trips are captured from traffic already passing the Project. The Fine Dining Restaurant net trip generation is therefore estimated to total about 37 daily trips with 1 during the AM peak hour and 3 during the PM peak hour.
 - c. Multi-family Housing - The eight multi-family housing units in Units 2A through 2H will generate a total of about 54 daily trips with 53 during the AM peak hour and 4 during the PM peak hour. An internal trip allowance of 10% is applied to the residential component of the Project because a portion of the Project will offer on-site residential trip attractions such as retail and food service. Residents will also walk to and from the large variety of other commercial uses within walking distance in downtown Carmel. The net residential trip generation estimate includes about 49 daily trips with 2 during the AM peak hour and 5 during the PM peak hour.
 - d. The entire proposed Project is expected to generate a gross total of about 486 daily trips with 21 during the AM peak hour and 49 during the PM peak hour. The net increase in traffic on the nearby street system is expected to total about 328 daily trips with 15 during the AM peak hour and 33 during the PM peak hour.
2. Existing development on the Project site is estimated to generate about 112 daily trips with 6 in the AM peak hour and 11 during the PM peak hour, as tabulated on **Attachment D, Section C**.
3. As tabulated on **Attachment D, Section D**, the Project will generate about 374 more gross daily trips including about 15 AM peak hour trips and 38 PM peak hour trips than the previous use. Its increase in net trips, when accounting for trips to and from the Project

already on the adjacent street system, is estimated to total about 216 daily trips with 9 in the AM peak hour and 22 in the PM peak hour.

B. PROJECT EFFECT ON NEARBY TRAFFIC OPERATIONS

Net Project trips represent a frequency of about one vehicle every six minutes in the AM peak hour and less than one vehicle every two minutes in the PM peak hour. The low frequency of Project trips will have a minimal effect on traffic operations in downtown Carmel.

The above estimates may be conservative. The Project's net increase in traffic on the nearby streets in greater downtown Carmel is likely to be much less. This is because the Project's location is conducive to walking to and from nearby residential areas and complementary commercial and employment uses in downtown Carmel. The "Trip Generation Handbook," Institute of Transportation Engineers, 3rd Edition, September 2017, Chapter 7, Trip Generation for Urban Infill/Redevelopment, page 65, recognizes this. It states, "The current *Trip Generation Manual* data volumes do not reflect trip generation at urban infill sites. Redevelopment in built out areas and new development in areas that are almost fully built out often results in fewer vehicle trips generated than would result in suburban and outlying locations. These effects may be the result of modal shifts:

- More walking (because of closer proximity of complementary uses).
- More transit ridership (because of convenient, frequent transit service).
- More bicycling (because of bicycle facilities that improve safety or reduce travel time).
- Higher vehicle occupancy (because of more carpooling that results from overall traffic congestion, preferential treatments along roadway network, or parking pricing-or limited parking supply)."

Most of the above characteristics are present in downtown Carmel and therefore applicable to this project.

C. PROJECT VEHICLE-MILES-TRAVELED

As required by California SB 743, vehicle-miles-travelled (VMT) has recently replaced level of service in the evaluation of environmental impacts under CEQA. Carmel-by-the-Sea has not adopted a VMT policy which would include a methodology for performing this analysis. This analysis is therefore based on the "Technical Advisory on Evaluating Transportation Impacts in CEQA," State of California Governor's Office of Planning and Research, December 2018 (OPR Guidelines), which provides implementation guidance for SB 743 for evaluating development proposals. This is consistent with the policies adopted by other nearby agencies including the City of Monterey, Santa Cruz County, and Caltrans. Monterey County is in the process of adopting a VMT policy and evaluation methodology nearly identical to these other agencies.

The OPR Guidelines include criteria for determining if development proposals will require further VMT analysis or if the proposal is below significance thresholds and exempt from additional analysis. The OPR Guidelines, page 17, states, "Lead agencies can evaluate each component of a mixed-use project independently and apply the significance threshold for each project type included (e.g., residential and

Ryan Aeschliman
July 3, 2024

retail). Alternatively, a lead agency may consider only the project's dominant use. In the analysis of each use, a project should take credit for internal capture. Combining different land uses and applying one threshold to those land uses may result in an inaccurate impact assessment." The two main components of the project, residential and commercial (retail), are therefore analyzed separately, as described below.

1. Multi-Family Housing

- a. Residential Significance Criterion - The OPR Guidelines, page 12, states, "Many local agencies have developed screening thresholds to indicate when detailed analysis is needed. Absent substantial evidence indicating that a project would generate a potentially significant level of VMT, or inconsistency with a Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) or general plan, projects that generate or attract fewer than 110 trips per day generally may be assumed to cause a less-than-significant transportation impact.
- b. Residential VMT Analysis - The 8 multi-family housing units are estimated to generate about 54 gross daily trips, which is below the 110 trips per day significance threshold. This component of the Project will have a less-than-significant VMT impact.

2. Retail Uses (Variety Stores and Restaurant)

- a. Retail Significance Criterion - The OPR Guidelines, pages 16-17, states, "Many cities and counties define local-serving and regional-serving retail in their zoning codes. Lead agencies may refer to those local definitions when available, but should also consider any project-specific information, such as market studies or economic impacts analyses that might bear on customers' travel behavior. Because lead agencies will best understand their own communities and the likely travel behaviors of future project users, they are likely in the best position to decide when a project will likely be local-serving. Generally, however, retail development including stores larger than 50,000 square feet might be considered regional-serving, and so lead agencies should undertake an analysis to determine whether the project might increase or decrease VMT."
- b. Retail VMT Analysis – The retail component of the Project will include a total increase of about 6,541 net square feet of floor area. The overall floor area is far below the 50,000 square-foot threshold considered to be regional serving that would potentially result in a significant VMT impact. The types of uses anticipated in the Project will serve local clientele and visitors. The retail component of the Project will have a less-than-significant VMT impact.

If you have any questions regarding this analysis or need additional information, please do not hesitate to contact me at your convenience. Thank you for the opportunity to assist you.

Respectfully submitted,

Keith Higgins

Keith B. Higgins, PE, TE
Attachments

Attachment A
Project Site and Floor Plans

Attachment B
Project Demolition Plan

Attachment C
Project Land Use
Tabular Summary

JB Pastor - Unit Matrix

Commercial Unit Matrix		
Unit	SF	Notes
101	784	
102	820	
103	794	
104	1,546	
105	595	458 SF of enclosed space, 137 outdoor patio.
106	501	
107	692	This is an existing building & it will remain. Currently used for by the 7th and Dolores restaurant.
Total	5,732	

Basement (MEP and Restrooms)		
Unit	SF	Notes
basement	167	Men's Restroom
basement	189	Women's Restroom
basement	58	Elevator
basement	40	Elevator Machine Room
basement	156	MEP
basement	181	Lobby
basement	18	Janitor
Total	809	

Residential Matrix					
Unit	SF	Notes	Terrace?	Bed	Bath
2A	1,714		Yes	2	1
2B	843		No	1	1
2C	669		No	1	1
2D	1,228		Yes	2	1
2E	551		No	1	1
2F	551		No	1	1
2G	1,117		Yes	2	1
2H	570		No	1	1
Total	7,243				

Currently existing onsite and will be demolished		
Unit	SF	Notes
Unit A	600	Bureau Vintage Property Management - 1-Story Building
Unit B	1600	Signature Day Spa - 1st Floor
Unit C	1600	Residential Tenant - 2nd Floor

*Note - Commercial Unit 107 above is an existing building which will remain.

A. TRIP GENERATION RATES

	ITE LAND USE CODE	WEEKDAY								
		AM PEAK HOUR				PM PEAK HOUR				
		DAILY TRIP RATE	PEAK HOUR RATE	% OF ADT	% IN	% OUT	PEAK HOUR RATE	% OF ADT	% IN	% OUT
Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Land Uses										
1. Multi-Family Housing (per dwelling unit)	220	6.74	0.40	6%	24%	76%	0.51	8%	63%	37%
2. Small Office (per 1,000 sq. ft.)	712	14.39	1.67	12%	82%	18%	2.16	15%	34%	66%
3. Variety Store (per 1,000 sq. ft.)	814	63.66	3.04	5%	55%	45%	6.70	11%	51%	49%
4. Hair Salon	918	15.125	1.21	8%	83%	17%	1.45	10%	17%	83%
5. Fine Dining Restaurant	931	83.84	0.73	1%	70%	30%	7.80	9%	67%	33%
6. Basement Storage Areas - Prorated to Variety Store and Restaurant	N.A.									

B. PROPOSED PROJECT TRIP GENERATION

B1. Proposed Non-Residential Land Use Summary											
Unit	Land Use	Net Floor Area	Gross Floor Area								
101	Variety Store	784 sq. ft.	895 sq. ft.								
102	Variety Store	820 sq. ft.	936 sq. ft.								
103	Variety Store	794 sq. ft.	906 sq. ft.								
104	Variety Store	1,546 sq. ft.	1,764 sq. ft.								
105	Variety Store	595 sq. ft.	679 sq. ft.								
106	Variety Store	501 sq. ft.	572 sq. ft.								
107	Fine Dining Restaurant	692 sq. ft.	790 sq. ft.								
Total Net Floor Area		5,732 sq. ft.									
Basement		809 sq. ft.									
Total Gross Floor Area			6,541 sq. ft.								
B2. Proposed Non-Residential Trip Generation											
10t through 106	Variety Store - Gross Trips	5,751 sq. ft.	366	17	5%	9	8	39	11%	20	19
			242	11	5%	6	5	26	11%	13	13
		- Net Trips (34% Pass-by)									
107	Fine Dining Restaurant - Gross Trips	790 sq. ft.	66	1	2%	1	0	6	9%	4	2
			37	1	3%	1	0	3	8%	2	1
		- Net Trips (44% Pass-by)									
a. Proposed Project Non-Residential Gross Trips		6,541 sq. ft.	432	18	4%	10	8	45	10%	24	21
b. Proposed Project Non-Residential Net Trips			279	12	4%	7	5	29	10%	15	14
B3. Proposed Residential Trip Generation											
2A thru 2H	Multi-Family Residential - Gross Trips	8 Units	54	3	6%	1	2	4	7%	3	1
			49	3	6%	1	2	4	8%	2	1
		- Net Trips (10% Internal)									
B4. PROPOSED PROJECT TOTAL TRIP GENERATION											
a. Gross Trips			486	21	4%	11	10	49	10%	27	22
b. Net Trips			328	15	4%	8	7	33	10%	17	15

C. EXISTING SITE TRIP GENERATION

EXISTING USES	LAND USE CODE	PROJECT SIZE	DAILY TRIPS	WEEKDAY							
				AM PEAK HOUR				PM PEAK HOUR			
				PEAK HOUR TRIPS	% OF ADT	TRIPS IN	TRIPS OUT	PEAK HOUR TRIPS	% OF ADT	TRIPS IN	TRIPS OUT
1. Unit 107 - Existing Fine Dining Restaurant	931	692 sq. ft.	58	1	2%	1	0	5	9%	3	2
2. Unit A - Bureau Vintage Property Management (Small Office)	712	1,600 sq. ft.	23	3	13%	2	1	3	13%	1	2
3. Unit B - Signature Day Spa - 1st Floor (Hair Salon)	918	1,600 sq. ft.	24	2	8%	2	0	2	8%	0	2
4. Unit C - Residential Tenant - 2nd Floor	1 Unit		7	0	0%	0	0	1	14%	1	0
Existing Project Non-Residential Gross and Net Trips		2,292 sq. ft.	112	6	5%	5	1	11	10%	5	6

D. PROJECT TRIP GENERATION INCREASE ABOVE EXISTING

Total Proposed Trips minus Existing Trips											
a. Gross Trips			374	15	4%	6	9	38	10%	22	16
b. Net Trips			216	9	4%	3	6	22	10%	12	9

Notes:

1. Trip generation rates are referenced from "Trip Generation Manual," Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), 11th Edition, 2021.
2. Trip generation rates are based on gross floor area, including storage, halls, restrooms, mechanical spaces, etc.
3. Gross Trips are total driveway trips including vehicles already passing by the site. Net trips are new trips on adjacent streets.
4. Passby rates are referenced from "Trip Generation Handbook," Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), 3rd Edition, 2017.
5. sq. ft. = square feet
6. Basement Storage Area - Prorated and added to Variety Stores Indoor Space to estimate gross floor areas.