

CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
PLANNING COMMISSION

PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 2023-XXX-PC

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA APPROVING DESIGN STUDY DS 22-150 (CRI ON CARPENTER, INC.-LOT 2) AND ASSOCIATED COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT FOR THE DEMOLITION OF FOUR HOTEL ROOMS AT THE CARMEL RESORT INN AND CONSTRUCTION OF A 1,971-SQUARE-FOOT TWO-STORY RESIDENCE LOCATED ON THE SOUTHEAST CORNER OF GUADALUPE STREET AND 1ST AVENUE
APN 010-021-014

WHEREAS, May 4, 2022, Eric Miller Architects, Inc. (“Applicant”) submitted an application on behalf of Santa Rosa Motel CO LP ET AL (“Owner”) requesting approval of Track 2 Design Study application DS 22-150 (CRI on Carpenter-Lot 2) described herein as (“Application”); and

WHEREAS, the Application has been submitted for a 4,000-square-foot lot located at the southeast corner of Guadalupe Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) Zoning District (Block 17, Lot 2); and

WHEREAS, the Applicant is requesting to demolish two cottages containing four hotel rooms at the Carmel Resort Inn and construct a 1,971-square-foot two-story residence with a basement and 200-square-foot attached garage; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with Carmel Municipal Code (CMC) Section 17.58.040 (Residential Design Review), the construction of new dwellings, rebuilds, and substantial alterations requires approval of a Residential Track Two Design Study by the Planning Commission; and

WHEREAS, a Coastal Development Permit is also required in accordance with CMC 17.52.090 (Coastal Development Permit Required); and

WHEREAS, CMC Section 17.58.040.B requires a design concept review by the Planning Commission at a public hearing before consideration of the final details review for project approval; and

WHEREAS, on January 11, 2023, the Planning Commission held a duly noticed public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the conceptual design, including, without limitation, the information provided to the Planning Commission by City staff and through public testimony on the project and adopted Resolution 2023-004-PC, accepting the conceptual design with a request for numerous changes; and

WHEREAS, on March 8, 2023, the Planning Commission held a second duly noticed public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the revised conceptual design, including, without

limitation, the information provided to the Planning Commission by City staff and through public testimony on the revised project and adopted Resolution 2023-015-PC, accepting the revised conceptual design as presented; and

WHEREAS, the project was scheduled for final details review on April 12, 2023; and

WHEREAS, on March 31, 2023, a notice of the public hearing scheduled for April 12, 2023, was published in the Carmel Pine Cone in compliance with State law (California Government Code 65091) and mailed to owners of real property within a 300-foot radius of the project indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before April 2, 2023, the Applicant posted the public notice on the project site and hand-delivered a copy of the public notice to each property within a 100-foot radius of the project site indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before April 7, 2023, the meeting agenda was posted in three locations in compliance with State law indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on April 12, 2023, the Planning Commission held a duly noticed public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the Final Design Study, including, without limitation, the information provided to the Planning Commission by City staff and through public testimony on the final design of the project; and

WHEREAS, the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code §§ 21000, *et seq.*, "CEQA"), together with State Guidelines (14 California Code Regulations §§ 15000, *et seq.*, the "CEQA Guidelines") and City Environmental Regulations (CMC 17.60) require that certain projects be reviewed for environmental impacts and that environmental documents be prepared; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission found that pursuant to CEQA regulations, the Application is categorically exempt under Section 15303 (Class 3) – New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures, and no exceptions to the exemption exist pursuant to section 15300.2 of the CEQA Guidelines; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution and its findings are made based upon the evidence presented to the Commission at the hearing date, including, without limitation, the staff report and attachments submitted by the Community Planning and Building Department; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission did hear and consider all said reports, attachments, recommendations, and testimony herein above set forth and used their independent judgment to evaluate the project; and

WHEREAS, the facts set forth in the recitals are true and correct and are incorporated herein by reference.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Planning Commission of the City of Carmel-By-The-Sea does hereby make the following findings and determinations regarding the **Final Design Study**:

FINDINGS REQUIRED FOR DESIGN STUDY APPROVAL		
For each of the required findings listed below, the staff has indicated whether the application, either as proposed or with conditions, supports adopting the findings. For all findings checked "no," the staff report discusses the issues to facilitate the Planning Commission's decision-making. Findings checked "yes" may or may not be discussed in the report depending on the issues.		
CMC 17.64.080.A, Final Details Phase Approval	YES	NO
1. The proposed architectural style and detailing are simple and restrained in character, consistent and well-integrated throughout the building, and complementary to the neighborhood without appearing monotonous or repetitive in context with designs on nearby sites.	✓	
2. The proposed exterior materials and their application rely on natural materials, and the overall design will add to the variety and diversity along the streetscape.	✓	
3. Design elements such as stonework, skylights, windows, doors, chimneys, and garages are consistent with the adopted design guidelines and will complement the character of the structure and the neighborhood.	✓	
4. Proposed landscaping, paving treatments, fences, and walls are carefully designed to complement the urbanized forest, the approved site design, adjacent sites, and the public right-of-way. The design will reinforce a sense of visual continuity along the street.	✓	

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Planning Commission of the City of Carmel-By-The-Sea does hereby make the following findings and determinations regarding the **Coastal Development Permit**:

FINDINGS REQUIRED FOR COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMITS		
For each of the required findings listed below, the staff has indicated whether the application, either as proposed or with conditions, supports adopting the findings. For all findings checked "no," the staff report discusses the issues to facilitate the Planning Commission's decision-making. Findings checked "yes" may or may not be discussed in the report depending on the issues.		
CMC 17.64.010.B, Coastal Development Permits	YES	NO
1. The project, as described in the application and accompanying materials, as modified by any conditions of approval, conforms with the certified City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Local Coastal Program.	✓	

2. If the project is located between the first public road and the sea, the project conforms with the public access and recreation policies of Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act of 1976 (commencing with Sections 30200 of the Public Resources Code).	✓	
--	---	--

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Planning Commission of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea does hereby APPROVE the Design Study application DS 22-150 (CRI on Carpenter, Inc. – Lot 2) to demolish four hotel rooms at the Carmel Resort Inn and construct a 1,971-square-foot two-story residence with a basement and 200-square-foot attached garage located on the southeast corner of Guadalupe Street and 1st Avenue (APN 010-021-014), subject to the following Conditions of Approval:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL		
No.	Standard Conditions	
1.	Authorization. This approval of Design Study application DS 22-150 (CRI on Carpenter, Inc. – Lot 4) authorizes the demolition of four hotel rooms at the Carmel Resort Inn and the construction of a 1,971-square-foot two-story residence inclusive of a 300-square-foot basement and 200-square-foot attached garage located on the southeast corner of Guadalupe Street and 1st Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District as depicted in the plans prepared by Eric Miller Architects, Inc. approved by the Planning Commission on April 12, 2023, and stamped approved and on file in the Community Planning & Building Department unless modified by the conditions of approval contained herein.	✓
2.	Codes and Ordinances. The project shall be constructed in conformance with all requirements of the R-1 zoning district. All adopted building and fire codes shall be adhered to in preparing the working drawings. If any codes or ordinances require design elements to be changed, or if any other changes are requested when such plans are submitted, such changes may require additional environmental review and subsequent approval by the Planning Commission.	✓
3.	Permit Validity. This approval shall be valid for one year from the approval date unless an active building permit has been issued and maintained for the proposed construction.	✓
4.	Water Use. Approval of this application does not permit an increase in water use on the project site without adequate supply. Should the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District determine that adequate water is unavailable for this site, this permit will be scheduled for reconsideration, and appropriate findings will be prepared for review and adoption by the Planning Commission.	✓
5.	Setback and Height Certifications. A State licensed surveyor shall survey and certify the following in writing: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The footing locations are in conformance with the approved plans before footing/foundation inspection; • The roof height and plate height conform to the approved plans before the roof sheathing inspection. 	✓

	Written certifications prepared, sealed, and signed by the surveyor shall be provided before the footing/foundation inspection and the roof sheathing inspection. In the event that multiple footing/foundation pours are required, a survey letter shall be submitted for each separate section.	
6.	Service Laterals. Prior to the final inspection, all electrical service laterals to any new building or structure, or to any building or structure being remodeled when such remodeling requires the relocation or replacement of the main service equipment, shall be placed underground on the premises upon which the building or structure is located. Undergrounding will not be required when the project valuation is less than \$200,000, or the City Forester determines that undergrounding will damage or destroy significant trees(s) (CMC 15.36.020).	✓
7.	Fire Sprinklers - Residential. Additions, alterations, or repairs to existing structures that involve the addition, removal, or replacement of 50 percent or more of the linear length of the walls (interior and exterior) within a 5-year period shall require the installation of an automatic residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with the California Building and Fire Codes (CMC 15.08.135).	✓
8.	Modifications. The Applicant shall submit in writing, with revised plans, to the Community Planning and Building staff any proposed changes to the approved project plans prior to incorporating those changes. If the Applicant changes the project without first obtaining City approval, the Applicant will be required to submit the change in writing, with revised plans, within two weeks of the City being notified. A cease work order may be issued at any time at the discretion of the Director of Community Planning and Building until: a) either the Planning Commission or Staff has approved the change, or b) the property owner has eliminated the change and submitted the proposed change in writing, with revised plans, for review. The project will be reviewed for its compliance with the approved plans prior to the final inspection.	✓
9.	Exterior Revisions to Planning Approval Form. All proposed modifications that affect the exterior appearance of the building or site elements shall be submitted on the "Revisions to Planning Approval" form on file in the Community Planning and Building Department. Any modification incorporated into the construction drawings not listed on this form shall not be deemed approved upon issuance of a building permit.	✓
10.	Conflicts Between Planning Approvals and Construction Plans. It shall be the responsibility of the Owner, Applicant, and Contractor(s) to ensure consistency between the project plans approved by the Planning Staff, the Planning Commission, or the City Council on appeal and the construction plans submitted to the Building Division as part of the Building Permit review. Where inconsistencies between the Planning approval and the construction plans exist, the Planning approval shall govern unless otherwise approved in writing by the Community Planning & Building Director or their designee.	✓

	<p>When changes or modifications to the project are proposed, the Applicant shall clearly list and highlight each proposed change and bring each change to the City’s attention. Changes to the project incorporated into the construction drawings that were not clearly listed or identified as a proposed change shall not be considered an approved change. Should conflicts exist between the originally approved project plans and the issued construction drawings that were not explicitly identified as a proposed change, the plans approved as part of the Planning Department Review, including any Conditions of Approval, shall prevail.</p>	
11.	<p>Exterior Lighting. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall include in the construction drawings the manufacturer’s specifications, including illumination information, for all exterior light fixtures. All fixtures shall be shielded and down-facing.</p> <p>Exterior wall-mounted lighting shall be limited to 25 watts or less (incandescent equivalent or 375 lumens) per fixture and shall be installed no higher than 10 feet above the ground or walking surface.</p> <p>Landscape lighting shall not exceed 18 inches above the ground nor more than 15 watts (incandescent equivalent or 225 lumens) per fixture and shall be spaced no closer than 10 feet apart. Landscape lighting shall not be used as accent lighting, nor shall it be used to illuminate trees, walls, or fences. The purpose of landscape lighting is to safely illuminate walkways and entrances to the subject property and outdoor living spaces.</p>	✓
12.	<p>Stone Facades (including chimneys). Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall clearly identify in the construction drawings the masonry pattern for all stonework.</p> <p>Stone facades shall be installed in a broken course/random or similar masonry pattern. Setting the stones vertically on their face in a cobweb pattern shall not be permitted. All stonework shall be wrapped around building corners and terminated at an inside corner or a logical stopping point that provides a finished appearance. Termination of stonework shall be subject to review and approval by the Community Planning & Building Director or their designee.</p>	✓
13.	<p>Wood Frame Windows. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall include the manufacturer’s specifications for the approved wood windows in the construction drawings. Windows approved with divided lights shall appear to be true divided lights, including internal and external mullions and muntins on insulated windows. Any window pane dividers, which are snap-in or otherwise superficially applied, are not permitted. The finish shall be matte or low gloss.</p>	✓
14.	<p>Indemnification. The Applicant agrees, at his or her sole expense, to defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City, its public officials, officers, employees, and assigns from any liability; and shall reimburse the City for any expense incurred, resulting from, or in connection with any project approvals. This includes any</p>	✓

	<p>appeal, claim, suit, or other legal proceedings to attack, set aside, void, or annul any project approval. The City shall promptly notify the Applicant of any legal proceeding and cooperate fully in the defense. The City may, at its sole discretion, participate in any such legal action, but participation shall not relieve the Applicant of any obligation under this condition. Should any party bring any legal action in connection with this project, the Superior Court of the County of Monterey, California, shall be the situs and have jurisdiction for resolving all such actions by the parties hereto.</p>	
15.	<p>Driveway. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall clearly identify on the construction drawings the driveway material and asphalt connection to the paved street edge. The driveway material shall be extended beyond the property line into the public right-of-way to connect to the paved street edge. A minimal asphalt connection at the street edge may be required by the Superintendent of Streets or the Building Official, depending on site conditions, to accommodate the drainage flow line of the street. If the driveway material is proposed to be sand set, a dimensioned construction detail showing the base material shall be included in the construction drawings.</p>	✓
16.	<p>Hazardous Materials Waste Survey. Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, the Applicant shall submit a hazardous materials waste survey to the Building Division in conformance with the Monterey Bay Unified Air Pollution Control District.</p>	✓
17.	<p>Cultural Resources. Throughout construction, all activities involving excavation shall immediately cease if cultural resources are discovered on the site, and the Applicant shall notify the Community Planning & Building Department within 24 hours. Work shall not be permitted to recommence until such resources are properly evaluated for significance by a qualified archaeologist. If the resources are determined to be significant, prior to the resumption of work, a mitigation and monitoring plan shall be prepared by a qualified archaeologist and reviewed and approved by the Community Planning and Building Director. In addition, if human remains are unearthed during the excavation, no further disturbance shall occur until the County Coroner has made the necessary findings as to origin and distribution pursuant to California Public Resources Code (PRC) Section 5097.98.</p>	✓
18.	<p>Truck Haul Route. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit for review and approval by the Community Planning & Building Director, in consultation with the Public Works and Public Safety Departments, a truck-haul route and any necessary traffic control measures for the grading activities. The Applicant shall be responsible for ensuring adherence to the truck-haul route and implementation of any required traffic control measures.</p>	✓
19.	<p>USA North 811. Prior to any excavation or digging, the Applicant shall contact the appropriate regional notification center (USA North 811) at least two working days, but not more than 14 calendar days, prior to commencing that excavation or digging. No digging or excavation is authorized to occur on-site until the Applicant has obtained a Ticket Number and all utility members have positively responded to the dig request. (Visit USANorth811.org for more information)</p>	✓

20.	<p>Conditions of Approval. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall print a copy of the Resolution adopted by the Planning Commission and signed by the property owner(s) on a full-size sheet within the construction plan set submitted to the Building Safety Division.</p>	✓
Landscape Conditions		
21.	<p>Landscape Plan Required. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit a landscape plan for review and approval by the Community Planning & Building Department and the City Forester. The landscape plan shall be included in the construction drawings and will be reviewed for compliance with the landscaping standards contained in the Zoning Code, including, but not limited to, the following:</p> <p>1) All new landscaping shall be 75% drought-tolerant; 2) Landscaped areas shall be irrigated by a drip/sprinkler system set on a timer; and 3) The project shall meet the City’s recommended tree density standards unless otherwise approved by the City based on on-site conditions.</p> <p>The landscape plan shall identify where new trees will be planted when new trees are required to be planted by the City code, the Forest and Beach Commission, or the Planning Commission.</p>	✓
22.	<p>Tree Planting Requirements. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall identify on the landscape plan the location, size, and species of required tree plantings. All new trees shall be installed before the final inspection. Trees shall be recorded and monitored for at least five years to ensure their establishment and growth to maturity. Trees that do not survive or are removed shall be replaced with new trees that are equivalent in size to the measured or projected growth of the original trees and shall be planted in the same location unless otherwise directed by the City Forester or Forest & Beach Commission.</p>	✓
23.	<p>Tree Removal Prohibited. Throughout construction, the Applicant shall protect all trees identified for preservation by methods approved by the City Forester. Trees on or adjacent to the site shall only be removed upon the approval of the City Forester or Forest and Beach Commission.</p>	✓
24.	<p>Tree Protection Measures. Requirements for tree preservation shall adhere to the following tree protection measures on the construction site.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prior to grading, excavation, or construction, the developer shall clearly tag or mark all trees to be preserved. • Excavation within 6 feet of a tree trunk is not permitted. • No attachments or wires of any kind, other than those of a protective nature, shall be attached to any tree. • Per Municipal Code Chapter 17.48.110, no material may be stored within the dripline of a protected tree, including the drip lines of trees on neighboring parcels. • Tree Protection Zone. The Tree Protection Zone shall be equal to dripline or 18 	✓

	<p>inches radially from the tree for every one inch of trunk diameter at 4.5 feet above the soil line, whichever is greater. A minimum of 4-foot-high transparent fencing is required unless otherwise approved by the City Forester. Tree protection shall not be resized, modified, removed, or altered in any manner without written approval. The fencing must be maintained upright and taught for the duration of the project. No more than 4 inches of wood mulch shall be installed within the Tree Protection Zone. When the Tree Protection Zone is at or within the drip line, no less than 6 inches of wood mulch shall be installed 18 inches radially from the tree for every one inch of trunk diameter at 4.5 feet above the soil line outside of the fencing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structural Root Zone. The Structural Root Zone shall be 6 feet from the trunk or 6 inches radially from the tree for every one inch of trunk diameter at 4.5' above the soil line, whichever is greater. Any excavation or changes to the grade shall be approved by the City Forester prior to work. Excavation within the Structural Root Zone shall be performed with a pneumatic excavator, hydro-vac at low pressure, or another method that does not sever roots. • If roots greater than 2 inches in diameter or larger are encountered within the approved Structural Root Zone, the City Forester shall be contacted for approval to make any root cuts or alterations to structures to prevent roots from being damaged. • If roots larger than 2 inches in diameter are cut without prior City Forester approval or any significant tree is endangered as a result of construction activity, the building permit will be suspended, and all work stopped until an investigation by the City Forester has been completed, and mitigation measures have been put in place. 	
25.	<p>Foundation Work Near Significant Trees. All foundations within 15 feet of significant trees shall be excavated by hand. If any tree roots larger than two inches (2") are encountered during construction, the City Forester shall be contacted before cutting the roots. The City Forester may require the roots to be bridged or may authorize the roots to be cut. If roots larger than two inches (2") in diameter are cut without prior City Forester approval or any significant tree is endangered as a result of construction activity, the building permit will be suspended and all work stopped until an investigation by the City Forester has been completed. Six inches (6") of mulch shall be evenly spread across the inside the dripline of all trees prior to the issuance of a building permit.</p>	✓
ENVIRONMENTAL COMPLIANCE CONDITIONS		
26.	<p>Drainage Plan. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit for review and approval by the Community Planning & Building and Public Works Departments a drainage plan that meets the requirements of the City's drainage guidance, SOG 17-07. At a minimum, new and replaced impervious area drainage must be dispersed around the site rather than focused on one corner of the property, infiltration features must be sized appropriately and located at least 6 feet from neighboring properties. The drainage plan shall include information on</p>	✓

	drainage from new impervious areas and semi-pervious areas.	
27.	BMP Tracking Form. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit for review and approval by the Community Planning & Building and Public Works Departments a completed BMP Tracking form.	✓
28.	Semi-Permeable Surfaces. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit for review and approval by the Community Planning & Building and Public Works Departments cross-section details for all semi-permeable surfaces.	✓
29.	Erosion and Sediment Control Plan. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit for review and approval by the Community Planning & Building and Public Works Departments an erosion and sediment control plan that includes locations and installation details for erosion and sediment control BMPs, material staging areas, and stabilized access.	✓
30.	Erosion Control in the Right-of-Way. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall identify on the landscape plan any natural slope within the right-of-way immediately adjacent to the property where parking is not practical. Jute netting and a drought-tolerant ground cover to manage post-construction erosion control shall be installed. Plants installed within the drip line of trees shall be selected from the City’s “List of Compatible Plants Under and Around Native Trees” located in the Forest Management Plan. The Public Works Director, or their designee, may waive this requirement.	✓
SPECIAL CONDITIONS		
31.	Condition of Approval Acknowledgement. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall include a signed copy of the Condition of Approval Acknowledgment form in the construction drawings. The Condition of Approval Acknowledgement form, available from the Community Planning and Building Department, shall be signed by ALL parties before the issuance of a building permit.	✓
32.	<p>Chimney. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the Applicant shall submit revised plans for review and approval by the Planning Division demonstrating that the fireplace chimney, vent, and cap meet the following standards:</p> <p>Fireplace chimneys and vents, including caps, shall be no higher than required by the Building Code and shall not exceed four feet in height above the building height. Chimneys, vents, or chimney enclosures that project above a roofline, flat deck, or parapet wall shall also be subject to the following standards.</p> <p>a. Maximum horizontal dimension: three feet and four inches. No cap or ornament shall exceed 24 inches in any horizontal dimension.</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">i. Exception: three feet and six inches for double-flue chimneys.</p> <p>b. Chimneys shall not contain any storage space, access openings, or other uses unrelated to the vent function of the chimney.</p>	✓

Acknowledgment and acceptance of conditions of approval.

Property Owner Signature

Printed Name

Date

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA this 12th day of April 2023, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

Michael LePage
Chair

Leah Young
Planning Commission Secretary