



**COMMUNITY PLANNING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT
CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
2023 GENERAL PLAN ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORT**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction
 - A. Purpose and Summary
 - B. General Plan Background
2. General Plan Implementation Efforts

1. INTRODUCTION

A. Purpose and Summary

Government Code Section 65400 requires cities and counties to submit an Annual Progress Report (APR) on the status of the General Plan and implementation progress to their legislative bodies, the State Office of Planning and Research (OPR), and the Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD). The 2023 reporting period did not include amendments to the Carmel-by-the-Sea General Plan. Four urgency ordinances were passed in the reporting period, which rescinded various Covid-19 pandemic health and safety measures (UO 2023-001); adopted rules of conduct for public meetings (UO 2023-002); banned wood burning fires on Carmel Beach (UO 2023-004); and paused the intake of new Mills Act applications (UO 2023-008). The California Coastal Commission approved two updates to the City's Local Coastal Program, one which strengthened timeshare provisions and one which extended the Carmel Historic Context Statement to cover an additional twenty-year period (1966-1986). These actions, along with additional efforts to implement the City's General Plan during the 2023 reporting period, are detailed in Section 2. General Plan Implementation Efforts.

This General Plan Annual Progress report will be presented to the Carmel-by-the-Sea Planning Commission for review on June 12, 2024. The City Council will be asked to review and adopt the annual report on July 9, 2024.

B. General Plan Background

In 1929, the Carmel City Council adopted Ordinance No. 96 to direct the future development of Carmel. This ordinance, now outlined in Title 17 of the Municipal Code, established the residential character of Carmel and specifically outlined the City's intent that Carmel should subordinate other activities in order to preserve the community's unique residential character. The 1929 ordinance stated the following:

“The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea is hereby determined to be primarily, essentially and predominantly a residential city wherein business and commerce have in the past, are now, and are proposed to be in the future, subordinated to its residential

character; and that said determination is made having in mind the history and the development of said city, its growth and the causes thereof; and also its geographical and topographical aspects, together with its near proximity to the cities of Pacific Grove and Monterey, and the businesses, industries, trades, callings and professions in existence and permissible therein.”

The city council adopted Carmel’s General Plan in the spring of 1988. The 1988 General Plan superseded the City’s first plan from 1957, which was subsequently amended and updated over the decades (see GP/LUP page I-4 for a summary).

The General Plan is a comprehensive statement of the planning goals and policies for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea and its surrounding Sphere of Influence that is periodically reviewed and updated. California Government Code (Section 65302) requires the General Plan to include seven specific elements (information topics): Land Use, Circulation, Housing, Conservation, Open Space, Noise, and Safety. Elements may be combined, and additional elements may be added at a jurisdiction’s discretion. Though the titles of the seven required elements may be modified, all elements shall contain the content and analysis required by the State.

Because the entire City falls within the California Coastal Commission’s Coastal Zone, all of Carmel’s policies, practices, ordinances, and plans must conform with the requirements of the 1976 Coastal Act. Carmel’s Local Coastal Land Use Program (certified in December 2002) set forth goals, objectives, and policies governing the use of land and water in Carmel-by-the-Sea consistent with Chapter 3 of the California Coastal Act of 1976 (as amended through January 2003). Carmel’s Local Coastal Program was combined with Carmel’s General Plan in 2003 to ensure coordination of the two policy documents. The combined Local Coastal Program/General Plan includes:

Land Use and Community Character. This Chapter covers topics required in the State-mandated Land Use Element and also includes policies for topics in sections 30244 and 30250 through 30254 of the Coastal Act.

Circulation. This Chapter, also referred to as the Circulation Element, is required by the State. Several of the policies in this element also implement provisions of the Coastal Act.

Coastal Access and Recreation. This Chapter includes policies for topics covered in sections 30210 through 30224 of the Coastal Act.

Coastal Resource Management. This Chapter includes policies for topics in sections 30230 through 30243 and 30251 of the Coastal Act.

Each of these Chapters begins with a discussion of the local setting and policy direction adopted by the City to address the requirements of the Coastal Act. Specific Goals, Objectives and Policies are then listed. Much of the background information and policy contained in the Coastal Land Use

Program is incorporated directly from existing plans and reports that address special topics. The following documents are appendices to the General Plan/Coastal Land Use Program:

- *Forest Management Plan*
- *Mission Trail Nature Preserve Master Plan*
- *Final Results of the Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area Study Conducted for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea (ESHA Study)*
- *Historic Context Statement, Carmel-by-the-Sea*

The Carmel-by-the-Sea General Plan additionally contains the following Elements which are *not* associated with the Coastal Program:

Housing. This required element sets the city's policy and programs for housing construction and rehabilitation.

Public Facilities and Services. This is an optional element, not required by California Statutes. This element addresses the management and use of City-owned properties and facilities.

Open Space and Conservation. Open Space and Conservation elements are required elements often addressed separately, but Carmel has combined them into a single element.

Environmental Safety. This is a required element that covers topics related to earthquakes, fires, floods and other hazardous conditions.

Noise. This is a required element that addresses sources of noise in the community and establishes policies to protect noise-sensitive land uses.

The various elements have been updated and reorganized over the years and are currently ordered as follows: 1) Land Use and Community Character (2003), 2) Circulation (2010); 3) Housing (2015); 4) Coastal Access and Recreation (2003); 5) Coastal Resource Management (2003); 6) Public Facilities and Services (2009); 7) Open Space and Conservation (2009); 8) Environmental Safety (2009); and 9) Noise (2009). The City has submitted a Housing Element Update to the State Housing and Community Development Department for review, and a Safety Element Update is underway. The updated Housing and Safety Elements are on track to be adopted in 2024.

Throughout the General Plan, goals, objectives, and policies are differentiated by an alphanumeric system and are identified by the letters "G," "O," and "P," respectively. The second character identifies the General Plan element in which the goal, objective, or policy is found. For example, "P4-1" refers to a Policy within Element #4 (Coastal Access & Recreation) and specifically references policy number 1.

2. GENERAL PLAN IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS

Please note the summary below is not intended to be exhaustive or all-inclusive; rather, it is simply a snapshot of major developments, accomplishments, projects, and practices during the 2023 calendar year. In many cases, an item may fulfill multiple goals/policies within an element or even across multiple elements. However, in the interest of reducing redundancy, only the most relevant implemented goals/objectives/policies have been listed.

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
1) Land Use and Community Character	‘Design Traditions 1.5’ project to update the City’s Design Guidelines and Zoning Code underway.	G1-1: Continue to preserve and maintain the predominance of the residential character in Carmel through appropriate zoning and land development regulations in all districts. O1-10: Apply design regulations for the commercial district that will protect its established character while supporting the land uses contained therein.
	Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources maintained and updated.	O1-14: Maintain an inventory of historic resources.
	CA Coastal Commission approved Historic Context Statement Phase I: LCP-3-CML-23-0021-1-Part A (Historical Context Statement Update). Historic Context Statement Update Phase II Certified Local Government \$40k grant award received and consultant RFP released.	P1-85: Maintain an Historic Context Statement.
	City entered into 2 Mills Act contracts: L’Auberge (MA 21-238) and the Bird House (MA 23-117).	G1-5: Protect and enhance historic resources. Ensure that City ordinances, development review processes and administrative policies support, facilitate and coordinate with preservation activities. Provide incentives for property owners to preserve and rehabilitate historic resources.
2) Circulation	Resolution 2023-033 approving a list of street projects for Fiscal Year 2023/24 partially funded by SB1: The Road Repair and Accountability Act of 2017.	G2-1: Provide and maintain a transportation system and facilities that promote the orderly and safe transportation of people and goods while preserving the residential

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	<p>Resolution 2023-004, awarding a Professional Services Agreement to BKF Engineers for the Concrete Streets Repair Project for a not-to-exceed fee of \$214,667 / Resolution 2023-083, authorizing the City Administrator to execute Amendment No. 1 to the Professional Services Agreement with BKF Engineers for the Concrete Streets Repair Project, for a not-to-exceed fee of \$49,092.</p>	<p>character and village atmosphere of Carmel.</p>
	<p>Council received a presentation and provided direction to staff regarding the proposed paving, bike route, and median island projects along San Carlos Street, between Eighth and Thirteenth Avenues.</p>	<p>O2-2: Ensure safety improvements are undertaken in response to the changing travel environment.</p> <p>P2-6: Maintain and encourage informal landscaped median strips and natural landscaped areas within public rights-of-way. (LUP)</p>
	<p>Parking and Congested Traffic (PACT) program launched, along with public engagement efforts to gauge interest in paid parking.</p>	<p>P2-25: Evaluate a paid parking program for the downtown.</p>
<p>3) Housing Element</p>	<p>Resolution 2023-024 Authorizing a Professional Services Agreement with EMC Planning Group Inc. to update the General Plan Housing and Safety Elements.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-074 authorizing an Amendment to Professional Services Agreement No. PBD-EMC-037-22-23 with EMC Planning Group, Inc. to prepare an Initial Study in accordance with CEQA.</p>	<p>N/A (See Housing Element Annual Progress Report)</p>

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	Submitted Draft 2023-2031 Housing Element to the California Housing and Community Development Department on 8/3/23 and revised draft on 10/17/23.	
4) Coastal Access and Recreation	Continued Short Term Rental (STR) enforcement in 2023. STRs are identified through Host Compliance (a 3rd party compliance monitor) and resident complaints. In addition to NOV's/citations, the City sends educational "reminders" to local vacation rental companies and real estate agents. In 2023, 36 cases were logged in the City's tracking system.	P4-63 Retain measures to restrict commercial short-term rental of single-family residences in the R-I district. (LUP)
	Adoption of Ordinance No. 2022-007 - Amending Carmel Municipal Code (CMC) Sections 17.14.040, 17.28.010, and 17.70.020, to prohibit timeshare and fractional interest uses, as well as advertising and sale thereof, in a manner fully in conformity with the California Coastal Act (CA Section 30510). CA Coastal Commission approved LCP-3-CML-23-0022-1-Part B (Timeshare Provisions).	P4-64 Continue to prohibit the sale of interests in and rights to use real property in the City on a timesharing basis. (LUP)
5) Coastal Resource Management	Based on the report, "Tracing Fecal Contaminants and Copper From Watershed Sources to the Ocean (October 11, 2022)" and Council guidance, the Planning Division and Planning Commission ceased approval of copper as an	O5-43 Protect and enhance the water quality and biological productivity of local creeks, wetlands, and Carmel Bay through the prevention of point- and non-point-source water pollution. (LUP)

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	architectural metal for water-conveying elements.	G5-3: Protect, conserve and enhance the unique natural beauty and irreplaceable natural resources of Carmel and its Sphere of Influence, including its biological resources, water resources, and scenic routes and corridors.
	<p>Ongoing progress following Resolution 2022-094, agreement with EMC Planning Group Inc., for the Coastal Engineering and Adaptation Planning Project.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-081, authorizing the City Administrator to apply for and accept funds from the California Coastal Commission Local Coastal Program Local Assistance Grant Program for the Coastal Engineering and Adaptation Planning Project.</p>	G5-2: Establish and implement a comprehensive shoreline management program for the beach, bluffs and dunes that mitigates degradation caused by public use and natural forces.
	<p>Resolution 2023-107 approving Policy C2023-01 establishing Guidelines for Carmel Beach Cleanup Operations.</p> <p>Urgency Ordinance 2023-004 Regarding Wood Burning Beach Fires on Carmel Beach, Amending Municipal Code Section 17.20.200 E.</p>	O5-6: Keep the beach free of refuse.
	City Council Discretionary Funds Grant Program.	P5-39: Encourage volunteer programs for beach and bluff clean-up activities. (LUP)
	Enforcement of existing tree planting standards and required tree protection during development projects; ongoing City tree planting efforts per the Urban Forest Master Plan Project.	<p>O5-11: Maintain, restore and enhance the upper and lower tree canopy of Carmel's urbanized forest. (LUP)</p> <p>O5-13: Perform all tree work and landscaping within the City in</p>

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	<p>Resolution 2023-070, authorizing Amendment No. 1 to the Professional Services Agreement with Davey Resource Group for additional services to complete the Urban Forest Master Plan.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-015 authorizing purchase orders with John Ley’s Tree Service and Tope’s Tree service; Resolution 2023-060 authorizing on-call arborist services with Ono Consulting, LLC; and</p> <p>Resolutions 2023-028/2023-058/2023-059, authorizing On-Call Tree Maintenance Service Contracts with Community Tree Service, Tope's Tree Service, and West Coast Arborists.</p>	<p>accordance with City codes and policies and uniform planting practices that reflect the best current knowledge of tree and plant care.</p>
	<p>City continues to require tree removal and pruning permits.</p>	<p>O5-12: Implement policies, standards and procedures to regulate removal, pruning, and replacement of trees on private property.</p>
	<p>City continues to regulate the Right-of-Way per the Municipal Code and the Right-of-Way Vision Statement.</p> <p>Discretionary grant award to Carmel Cares for Vista Lobos landscaping.</p>	<p>O5-16 Remove or reduce unnecessary or excessive hardscape and other nonconforming encroachments on City parklands and within street rights-of-way to provide for and promote planting of trees and native vegetation. (LUP)</p>
	<p>City continues to require drainage plans for additions and new builds.</p>	<p>O5-22: Maximize retention of surface water on each site through site design and use of best management practices. (LUP)</p>

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	<p>Resolution 2023–103, selecting an Overhead to Underground Utility Conversion Project and establishing the Carmel Underground Utility District utilizing Rule 20A Allocations.</p> <p>Undergrounding of utilities required when a project valuation reaches \$200,000 over a cumulative five-year period (exemptions considered if needed to protect significant trees).</p> <p>City Council received a Presentation by Wave Astound Broadband on 10/3/23 to introduce a new Fiber Optic Project and authorize issuance of an Encroachment Permit with Special Conditions of Approval; Council inquired about undergrounding and micro trench options and deferred a decision on the item, directing staff to return at a future date with more information on undergrounding costs.</p>	<p>P5-183: Promote the placement of utilities underground where feasible and with minimum detriment to the root system of trees. (LUP)</p>
6) Public Facilities and Services	<p>Approve Fiscal Year 2021/22 and Fiscal Year 2022/23 carry-over projects, approve proposed Fiscal Year 2023/24 Capital Improvement Plan Projects.</p>	<p>P6-14: Maintain the City’s five-year Capital Improvement Program and conduct a yearly review by the Planning Commission of the Capital Improvement Program consistent with this Element.</p>
	<p>Ad Hoc Committee made recommendations on the Police/Public Works Building; authorized staff to move forward with RFP for architectural firms</p>	<p>O6-2: Support adequate levels of public services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and</p>

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	<p>with a strong practice in Police Department design and rehabilitation.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-063, authorizing a Professional Service Agreement with Hammond+Playle Architects, LLP (Indigo), for preparation of a functional program report, conceptual drawings, and cost estimates for the Police Building Project.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-003 to extend purchase contract with AXON for Police Body Cameras and related equipment and services.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-031 authorizing a 24-month service agreement with Flock Group Inc. for the lease of twenty-four (24) Falcon automated license plate reader (ALPR) cameras and six (6) Wing (ALPR) software overlays onto existing city cameras.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-034, authorizing a Construction Contract with Rehak General Engineering for the City Hall Wall Repair Project.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-002, authorizing a Professional Services Agreement with Jayson Architecture for the Library Master Plan Project.</p> <p>Council received a presentation on the exploration of street addresses and provided staff with direction.</p>	<p>sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.</p>

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	Resolution 2023-100, funding the San Carlos Bicycle Route, Eighth to Thirteenth Avenues, and Sidewalk Improvements Project.	P6-18: Pursue roadside improvements funds and other available sources to develop bicycle paths and pedestrian trails.
	Resolution 2023-072, authorizing Professional Services Agreement with Neill Engineers Corp. for civil engineering services associated with city-wide Drainage Improvement Projects. First Reading of Ordinance No. 2023-007 Amending the Carmel Municipal Code Title 17 (Zoning) by Repealing and Replacing Chapter 17.42 Stormwater Quality and Utility and Chapter 17.43 Water Quality Protection.	P6-19: Maintain the City's roadways, storm drains, and other public infrastructure to ensure they are safe and functioning adequately.
	Resolution 2023-041 Establishing the Electronic Form of Payment (Online). Ongoing public education of newly digitized Planning/Building records.	P6-20: Continue to evaluate ways to streamline the development review process.
7) Open Space and Conservation	Resolution 2023-014, authorizing Amendment No. 1 to the Professional Services Agreement with Ten Over Studio for architectural services for five facility renovation projects. Resolution 2023-082, rejecting all bids received for four Facility Renovation Projects, and directing staff to evaluate alternative contracting methods before re-advertising for bids.	07-1: Use, maintain and enhance publicly owned land for the benefit of Carmel residents.

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	Resolution 2023-073, authorizing Amendment No. 1 to the Professional Services Agreement with Ausonio, Inc. for Project Management Services for facility renovation projects for a not-to-exceed fee of \$125,000 for Fiscal Year 2023/24	
	Resolution 2023-077, authorizing a Construction Contract with Bowen Engineering and Environmental for the Water Well Decommissioning, and Tank and Pump House Removal Project in the Mission Trails Nature Preserve.	<p>G7-1: To protect, conserve, and enhance the unique natural beauty and irreplaceable natural resources of Carmel and its Sphere of Influence.</p> <p>P7-8: Maintain the City’s beach, park and open space in a manner that encourages use and enjoyment by residents and visitors while protecting the aesthetic and environmental quality of these areas.</p>
8) Environmental Safety	<p>Education and outreach about alerts (Monterey County, PG&E, Nixle, City of Carmel).</p> <p>The Planning Commission and Planning Division approved specific metal roof products and manufactured faux wood shingle products (as opposed to wood shake) and manufactured siding products due to flammability concerns.</p>	<p>G8-1: Ensure there is adequate preparedness to respond to a disaster.</p> <p>G8-2: Provide protection from natural hazards.</p> <p>G8-3: Reduce potential impacts from natural hazards.</p> <p>G8-4: Control land uses siting to avoid exposure to excessive risk.</p> <p>O8-4: Prevent or reduce the potential for life loss, injury, and property damage from fire hazards.</p>
	Weekly vlog and email updates used to disseminate emergency alerts and recommendations, such as City-provided sand bags	O8-3: Provide public education about what to do in case of emergencies and means available to avoid or minimize their effects.

Element	2023 Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
	<p>and emergency shelter at the Youth Center/Park Branch Library.</p> <p>Resolutions 2023-011, 027, 032, and 043, declaring the continued existence of a local emergency due to the 2022-23 Atmospheric River Winter Storm Event.</p> <p>Resolution 2023-026 Rescinding Resolution 2020-021 and Terminating the Proclamation of a Local Emergency within the City due to COVID-19.</p>	G8-2: Provide protection from natural hazards.
	Site coverage limited to 22% of allowed base floor area; extra 4% bonus granted if at least 50% of the site coverage is pervious.	P8-29: Limit the amount of impervious surface in flood-prone areas.
9) Noise	2 electric bicycles purchased for use by the Community Planning and Building Department.	P9-1: Noise emission levels shall be considered along with performance and cost, when purchasing City owned vehicles and construction equipment.
	Noise emission checks for all new generators, heating/AC, hot tubs, or similar systems upon permit approval and upon request.	P9-6: Develop a noise enforcement program to minimize disturbance of the community tranquility.
	Gas-powered leaf blowers prohibited.	P9-15: Continue to prohibit the use of gas-powered leaf blowers in the City.
	Truck route maintained.	P9-16: Continue to maintain a truck route to limit noise impacts in the City.
	Live Music Ordinance enforced.	P9-18: Continue to enforce the City's Live Music Ordinance limiting the sound and location of live music in the commercial districts.