# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
# CITY COUNCIL
# Staff Report

**November 1, 2022**
**CONSENT AGENDA**

| | |
|---|---|
| **TO:** | Honorable Mayor and City Council Members |
| **SUBMITTED BY:** | Agnes Martelet, Manager, Environmental Compliance |
| **APPROVED BY:** | Chip Rerig, City Administrator |
| **SUBJECT:** | Resolution 2022-094 Authorizing the City Administrator to execute a Professional Services Agreement with EMC Planning Group Inc., for a not-to-exceed fee of $175,000, to conduct the Coastal Engineering and Adaptation Planning Project |

## RECOMMENDATION:

Adopt Resolution 2022-094 authorizing the City Administrator to execute a Professional Services Agreement with EMC Planning Group Inc., for a not-to-exceed fee of $175,000, to conduct the Coastal Engineering and Adaptation Planning Project.

## BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

**Project Origins**

As shown in the Fiscal Year (FY) 2022/23 and 2021/22 Adopted Budgets, there are two funded Capital Improvement Program (CIP) projects involved with this Agenda report as follows:

*"Sea Level Rise/Coastal Engineering Report: This report has been identified by the Climate Committee as a critical document for sea level rise resilience planning. This report will ensure the City has the information and tools necessary to make decisions related to the long-term durability and maintenance needs of our coastal resources and infrastructure. For efficiency, this project would be combined with the Beach Sand Survey and Wall Inspections project, a FY 2021/22 carry-over project. A consultant would be needed with an estimated fee of $150,000. Staff is researching whether grant opportunities can be leveraged to fund this project. A request for Statements of Qualifications has been posted to hire a consultant to execute this, and many other projects. The Environmental Compliance Manager will manage this project."*

*"Beach Sand Survey and Wall Inspections: This project involves collecting and reviewing existing data and aerial imagery to determine rates of beach sand loss. Next, the project establishes a series of beach profile transects to facilitate long-term beach sand monitoring. In addition, this project funds the initial, non-destructive inspection by a coastal engineer of the shoreline armoring structures during low sand levels to determine priorities and phasing for anticipated repairs."*

At their August 2, 2022 meeting, the City Council adopted the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea's Climate Adaptation Plan and Climate Action Plan under Resolution 2022-064. Council commented that implementation of these Plans is imperative and requested the Climate Committee to continue to oversee the implementation of certain projects, including the Coastal Engineering Study and the Beach Sand Survey.

The adopted Climate Adaptation Plan includes Action 3.1.9, which states, *"Sea Level Rise Coastal Vulnerability Study. Hire coastal engineer with experience in planning for climate change to:*

*(1) Conduct research and prepare a Sea-Level Rise Vulnerability Study to further assess the risks to the city's coastal assets, including the beach, sea walls, revetments, bluffs, stairs and access, public bathrooms, parking areas, drainage infrastructure, and utilities.*

*(2) Determine adaptation measures and Local Coastal Program policy options, including but not limited to: a) Mostly natural, unarmored North Dunes area; b) mostly armored bluffs along Scenic Roach south of 8th Avenue; c) Unarmored dunes along private property between 8th Avenue and Del Mar Parking Lot; d) Armored private properties on the bluffs at the north end of the City (Pescadero Canyon area).*

*(3) Evaluate the use of thresholds for phasing adaptation projects based on changing coastal conditions. Consider applying an adaptive pathways approach which establishes trigger thresholds for different adaptive measures based on the severity of the impact from flooding and erosion associated with sea-level rise."*

**Consultant Selection Process**

In April 2022, requests for Statements of Qualifications (SOQs) were advertised, from San Jose to Sacramento to San Luis Obispo, seeking qualifications from consultants covering 14 professional service areas, including Coastal Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering and Environmental Services, both with anticipated services related to Climate Adaptation and Action Plan implementation projects.

In May 2022, one SOQ was received for Coastal Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering services and independently evaluated by a Selection Committee consisting of the City Administrator and Public Works Director. The SOQ was submitted by Haro Kasunich & Associates (HKA) who have extensive local knowledge of Carmel Beach and the surrounding shoreline and are extremely well qualified to participate in this Project.

Initial communications with HKA revealed that while they are very interested in the Project and most capable of performing the required engineering and infrastructure cost estimating services, environmental and climate adaptation experts will also be required to provide the full scope of the Project as outlined in the Climate Adaptation Plan.

Next, nine SOQs received for Environmental Services were independently evaluated by a Selection Committee consisting of the Public Works Director and Environmental Programs Manager. EMC Planning Group was determined to be best qualified to provide climate adaptation project management and technical reviews for this Project. EMC included a key subconsultant, Integral Consulting, on their team to provide hazard modeling, shoreline change analysis, and technical policy review.

City staff held a series of meetings with representatives of all three firms to review the scope of the City's projects and requested that these firms consolidate into one team so that the City could enter into one Professional Services Agreement (Agreement).

As a result, EMC has been recommended as the lead firm to contract with the City for this project and for consistency over the long term for possible subsequent projects. HKA and Integral will perform a majority of the technical work for the project, while EMC will provide policy guidance and project management. This team has worked together in the past on similar projects, including: the 2019 West Cliff Drive Adaptation and Management Plan for the City of Santa Cruz, and the 2019 City of Marina's Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Reports.

**Project Scope of Work**

To develop the project's scope of work, the Consultant team performed a cursory review of the 2001 Coastal Development Permit for Scenic Road Armoring Repairs, 2003 Shoreline Management Plan (Shonman and D'Ambrosio), the 2016 Carmel Shoreline Assessment Update, 2016 Assessments of Shoreline Improvements at Carmel Beach (Easton Geology), and the City's 2022 Climate Adaptation and Climate Action Plans.

The work is proposed to be completed in two phases. Phase I of the project is funded in the current CIP and included in the Agreement in Attachment 2, while Phase 2 is not yet funded. Staff has identified a non-competitive California Coastal Commission grant of $100,000 for which this project is eligible. Staff would work with the consultant team to develop and submit the grant application. Council would approve the receipt of grant funds, and authorize an Amendment to this Agreement, before any work would begin on Phase 2. Key tasks and associated deliverables for both phases are outlined below:

**PHASE 1 – COASTAL ENGINEERING AND HAZARD ASSESSMENT (Funded)**

- Task 1 – Coastal Engineering Condition Evaluation
  - Deliverables: Technical memo of results with maps and GIS shapefiles, one Climate Committee presentation.

- Task 2 -Shoreline and Beach Change Analysis – Seasonal and Long Term
  - Technical memo of results with maps and relevant GIS shapefiles, one Climate Committee presentation.

- Task 3 – Shoreline and Beach Erosion Exposure Modeling
  - Technical memo of methods and maps showing results of the projected existing and future coastal hazard extents, one Climate Committee presentation.

- Task 4 – Coastal Hazard and Sea Level Rise Vulnerability, High Priority Adaptation, Identification, and Action Plan
  - Executive summary of results, up to five sector profile summaries (land use, transportation, utilities, etc.), tables summarizing feasibility, recommendations for policy and project approaches, and identify high priority adaptations, one Climate Committee presentation.

**PHASE 2 – HAZARDS POLICY REVIEW AND REVISIONS, OUTREACH, AND ADAPTATION PATHWAY DEVELOPMENT (Subject to Grant funding)**

- Task 1 – Policy Review and Revised Hazard Policies
  - Memo summarizing the City's existing coastal hazard policies, technical work and adaptation feasibility completed in Phase I, policy recommendations for climate adaptation, triggers and thresholds recommendations for policy implementation, and recommendations for Local Coastal Program (LCP) updates, and one Climate Committee presentation.

- Task 2 - Public Outreach and Engagement
  - Technical content and PowerPoint slides for input into presentations by City Staff.

- Task 3 - Adaptation Pathway Development
  - Technical memo on monitoring needs and adaptation pathway graphics for each section, one Climate Committee presentation.

At their September 15, 2022 meeting, the Climate Committee reviewed the consultant's proposed project scope of work and recommended its approval by the City Council. During the meeting, the Climate Committee members discussed the importance of public engagement. In order to conserve budget, staff is proposing to take the lead on public engagement, including presenting results of specific tasks to the Forest and Beach Commission, Planning Commission, and City Council, as appropriate.

**Schedule**

Phase 1 is anticipated to take up to 16 months to complete upon approval of the Professional Services Agreement and issuance of the Notice to Proceed. Phase 2 is also anticipated to take up to 16 months to complete, but is anticipated to be performed somewhat concurrently with Phase 1, subject to approval and timing of the LCP Grant.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

Consultant fees for the project are $175,000 for services to be performed in Phase 1 and $100,000 for Phase 2. Funding for Phase 1 in the amount of $175,000 is available in the FY 2022/23 CIP Budget from a combination of $150,000 for the Coastal Engineering Study plus $25,000 for the Beach Sand Survey Project which was carried-over from FY 2021/22. Thus, the total budget amount authorized for this Agreement is $175,000 and will be charged to the CIP account no. 301-311-00-43008.

Funding for Phase 2 is anticipated to come from a non-competitive California Coastal Commission LCP Grant in the amount of $100,000. Work will not be authorized to begin on Phase 2 until the grant is accepted by the City Council.

## PRIOR CITY COUNCIL ACTION:

In June 2022, City Council approved the Fiscal Year 2022-23 CIP budget, which included a Sea Level Rise/Coastal Engineering Report and a Beach Sand Survey and Wall Inspections. At their August 2, 2022 meeting, City Council adopted the City's Climate Adaptation Plan and Climate Action Plan under Resolution 2022-064. The Coastal Engineering Report is identified as a high-priority project in the Climate Adaptation Plan.

## ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1) Resolution 2022-094
Attachment 2) Professional Services Agreement with EMC Planning Group for the Coastal Engineering and Adaptation Planning Project