

CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA  
HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD RESOLUTION NO. 2023-020-HRB

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA ADDING THE HISTORIC “ELIZABETH F. ARMSTRONG HOUSE” TO THE CARMEL REGISTER, APPROVING THE CREATION OF A DESIGN NONCONFORMITY IN THE COMPOSITE SIDE YARD SETBACK, AND UPHOLDING THE DETERMINATION OF CONSISTENCY WITH THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR’S STANDARDS ISSUED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD ON SEPTEMBER 18, 2023 UNDER RESOLUTION 2023-015-HRB FOR DESIGN STUDY APPLICATION, DS 23-160 (LUTZ), FOR ADDITIONS, ALTERATIONS, AND SITE MODIFICATIONS AT THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON SANTA FE STREET 4 NORTHWEST OF 6<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE IN THE SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (R-1) DISTRICT.  
APN: 010-092-005-000

WHEREAS, on May 31, 2023, Thomas Bateman Hood, Architect (“Applicant”) submitted an application on behalf of Breck J and Carole A Lutz TRS (“Owners”) requesting the issuance of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Design Study application DS 23-160 (Lutz) described herein as (“Application”); and

WHEREAS, the Application has been submitted for the property located on Santa Fe Street 4 northwest of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District (Block 60, Lot 11); and

WHEREAS, the Applicant is proposing a substantial alteration involving additions, alterations, and site modifications; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with CMC Section 17.32.160.A.2, substantial alterations, as defined in CMC Section 17.70.020, are considered major alterations; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with CMC Section 17.32.160.B, determinations of consistency for major alterations shall be prepared by a qualified professional;

WHEREAS, Margaret Clovis, a qualified professional, prepared a Phase Two Historic Assessment and found the project inconsistent with the Secretary’s Standards; and

WHEREAS, if certain modifications to the project were implemented, the project could be found consistent with the Secretary’s Standards; and

WHEREAS, on September 8, 2023, a notice of the September 18, 2023, public hearing was published in the Carmel Pine Cone in compliance with State law (California Government Code 65091) and mailed to owners of real property within a 300-foot radius of the project indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before September 8, 2023, the Applicant posted the public notice on the project site and hand-delivered a copy of the public notice to each property within a 100-foot radius of the project site indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before September 15, 2023, the meeting agenda was posted in three locations in compliance with State law indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on September 18, 2023, the Historic Resources Board held a duly noticed public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the project, including without limitation the information provided to the Historic Resources Board by City staff and adopted Resolution 2023-015-HRB issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards with Conditions of Approval; and

WHEREAS, on September 20, 2023, the Applicant submitted a request for reconsideration of the project per the Historic Resources Board "Rules of Procedure" Section IV.C, specifically requesting the property be added to the Carmel Register for the purposes of allowing a reduced site yard composite setback, and also requesting the Board reconsider Resolution 2023-015-HRB Condition of Approval #4 to allow a 250-square-foot garage instead of a 200-square-foot garage; and

WHEREAS, on October 6, 2023, a notice of the October 16, 2023, public hearing was published in the Carmel Pine Cone in compliance with State law (California Government Code 65091) and mailed to owners of real property within a 300-foot radius of the project indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before October 6, 2023, the Applicant posted the public notice on the project site and hand-delivered a copy of the public notice to each property within a 100-foot radius of the project site indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before October 13, 2023, the meeting agenda was posted in three locations in compliance with State law indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on October 16, 2023, the Historic Resources Board held a duly noticed public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the project, including without limitation the information provided to the Historic Resources Board by City staff; and

WHEREAS, on October 16, 2023, the applicant requested the project be continued to such time that the full Board would be present, and the Board granted the request; and

WHEREAS, on November 10, 2023, a notice of the November 20, 2023, public hearing was published in the Carmel Pine Cone in compliance with State law (California Government Code 65091) and mailed to owners of real property within a 300-foot radius of the project indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before November 10, 2023, the Applicant posted the public notice on the project site and hand-delivered a copy of the public notice to each property within a 100-foot radius of the project site indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on or before November 17, 2023, the meeting agenda was posted in three locations in compliance with State law indicating the date and time of the public hearing; and

WHEREAS, on November 20, 2023, the Historic Resources Board held a duly noticed public hearing to receive public testimony regarding the project, including without limitation the information provided to the Historic Resources Board by City staff; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution and its findings are made based upon the evidence presented to the Board at the November 20, 2023 hearing, including, without limitation, the staff report and attachments submitted by the Community Planning & Building Department; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Resources Board did hear and consider all said reports, attachments, recommendations, and testimony herein above set forth and used their independent judgment to evaluate the project; and

WHEREAS, the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code §§ 21000, et seq., "CEQA"), together with State Guidelines (14 California Code Regulations §§ 15000, et seq., the "CEQA Guidelines") and City Environmental Regulations (CMC 17.60) require the review of certain projects for environmental impacts and preparation of environmental documents; and

WHEREAS, issuance of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards is "not a project" pursuant to section 15378 of the CEQA Guidelines as it does not grant any permits of entitlements approving a project which would result in a direct or indirect physical change in the environment; and

WHEREAS, a CEQA analysis and determination will be conducted as part of the Design Study review by the Planning Commission; and

WHEREAS, the facts set forth in the recitals are true and correct and are incorporated herein by reference.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historic Resources Board of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea does hereby add the historic "Elizabeth F. Armstrong House" to the Carmel Register to allow a reduced composite side yard setback and uphold the Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards made by the Board on September 18, 2023 under Resolution 2023-015-HRB for Design Study application, DS 23-160 (Lutz), for additions, alterations, and site modifications at the property located on Santa Fe Street 4 northwest of 6th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-092-005-000), subject to the following Conditions:

- 1) The proposed north addition shall be moved as far to the rear (west) as possible.
- 2) Door and window openings of the 1928 section of the house shall be retained in place where possible.
- 3) Stone veneer shall either be omitted from the proposed additions and garage or used in full.
- 4) The garage shall be reduced in size to 11 feet wide and 235 square feet in area ~~from 250 to 200 square feet (10 feet wide by 20 feet deep)~~.

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD OF THE CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA this 20<sup>th</sup> day of November 2023 by the following vote:

AYES: DYAR, GOODHUE, HALL

NOES: CHROMAN, POMEROY

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Jordan Chroman  
Chair

---

Leah Young  
Historic Resources Board Secretary