

Appendix 2: 1. Open response for Question 20 - in 75 words or less, what is the most important issue that the Urban Forest Master Plan should address?

**Open-Ended Response. What is the most important issue that the UFMP should address?**

the city stop planting more trees and start maintaining the trees we already have

Carmel is beautiful because it is gloriously green because of m. pines and its adjacent greenery. thats why i moved to carmel.

to revive and restore the m. pine forest. the general plan of carmel defines this very specifically

to revive and restore our urbanized m. pine forest as described and mandated in our general plan and supportive in our municipal codes

get rid of the Monterey pines and replace them with cypress and coastal oaks

tree health and care

the upper canopy trees are coming to the end of their lives and there are very middle-aged trees to take their place. Seedlings should have been planted long ago...but it is never too late to set some in the ground. Also there should be more of a variety of trees so that if pests take some varieties down, others will survive.

Owners should be able to remove trees that are too close to their home which could cause damage to foundation of home. Also, the cost for a city person to look at a tree is way too expensive as is the permit process. The permit process to remove a tree seems now seems arbitrary.

Addressing sick/dying trees to prevent injuries or property damage.

Removing dead trees, maintaining trees and replacing trees

Don't plant more upper canopy trees. Don't limit construction due to treeSurvey invalid because the dishonest could do multiple surveys

This survey is good but I wish the survey would allow more question/selection to differentiate the kinds of "upper canopy" trees. The coastal redwood and the Monterey pine are different in terms of risk of falling during storms. This distinction would have helped for a better survey.

Managing existing trees for safety. Stop planting new trees along Scenic Dr.

Upper canopy tree worship; show love to other trees

Over population of trees and those planted in the wrong areas

Private and public safety in addition to removal of high risk trees.

Removing dead / dying trees close to power lines

Aging trees

Safety

Removing and allowing removal of dangerous Monterey Pines and other trees.

Allowing Carmel property owners to more easily remove trees they deem dangerous to falling on their homes or person.

NO MORE REDWOOD TREES on private or public property & MORE OAK TREES

Taking down dead/dying trees and replacing with new

Remove old trees and replant new.

Tree removal along power lines

removing or massive trimming of large trees along scenic and near power lines

Dangerous trees

Fire safety. Stop planting new trees under electrical lines

Aging trees

Shift residential requirement away from upper canopy and require more lower canopy.

Replacing dead and diseased trees proactively

Restoring our urban forest to a natural state.

Spend the money and time for tree maintenance

Ensuring good health of trees to prevent fires

Poorly balanced and diseased tree removal

care and urban forest renewal

Maintaining healthy trees and 1-1 replacement

Tree health

mitigation and replacement of old monterey pines with more stable option for future

Maintenance and safety of trees, reduce the cost burden of tree permits

The disappearance of our forest

Lower costs associated with removing dead or dangerous trees. Also, tree stumps should be removed instead of left to create an eyesore.

Striking a balance between the need for maintaining our urban forest and minimizing the dangers of falling trees and fire.

getting rid of dead trees

Long term funding and dedicated forestry staff

Maintain existing tree health.

Prioritizing the safety of roads, humans, and powerlines.

identification of tree species that will thrive over the next 100 years and put a plan in place to plant

Conflicting Power lines and trees

keeping the high canopy of trees

Maintain existing trees. Keep away from houses. Fire

Maintain existing trees for safety and beauty

Maintaining and keeping healthy our large mature trees. They are beautiful and integral to Carmel.

Safety. Encourage pruning or replacing old unsafe trees with younger plants.

Taking down trees that can cause potential damage whether they appear healthy or not. Especially those trees that really weren't meant to be planted in CBTS like Monterey Pines.

Fire danger

Minimize the time, cost and damage of failing Monterey Pines. Change the plan to grow better trees.

Timely maintenance and strategic placement of trees. The right trees in the right places. Not just replacement of removed trees in the same place with the same type.

Dangerous tall pine trees whether on public or private property

Dangerous tall Monterey Pine trees near the end of their life and a risk to homes, property, and individuals

Remove old trees before someone is hurt or killed.

Maintain and increase the Oaks. Regarding the number of trees required on private parcels change the types of trees required keep the same number of trees but shift to 3 lower and 1 upper.

#### HOW WE GET OUT OF HERE IN A FIRE LIKE LAHEINA

We have an old cypress on that is on the property line. An arborist performed resistograph and a hazard rating came back as an 11 - at or near the highest risk. We are not allowed to remove it even though it is in danger of harming property or people. We would be very willing to replace it with a sizable tree. It should be easier to remove a dangerous tree.

Replacement of the mature/dying trees that are being removed now.

Storm issues related to power internet if trees fall

Maintenance (city and private), costs to private homeowners, permit process discourages owners to maintain trees, and too many oversized trees per 4,000 sq ft lot

Hazards - fire and large branches and trees falling

Remove dead or dying trees before winter storms are here again!!

No strong opinion

Fire danger and falling trees

Removal of diseased or otherwise hazardous trees.

Signal that public comment is no longer welcomed.

planting trees to replace the ones have been cut down the empty holes are unsightly  
fire danger and insurability of residences

Replacement trees should be proper for Carmel environment.

Pruning or removing trees regarding fire hazard. Difficult to get insurance.

Coast Redwoods in forest not residential

More foresters are needed to inspect trees and maintain them.

Better service / apparent inefficiencies

Protecting open space around trees so that they can thrive.

Aging trees

Tree removal

Climate change will greatly impact all the trees and hasn't been properly addressed

removal of dead trees/limbs and planting of new trees where appropriate.

Fire danger/storm damage from trees

Keep the urban forest mandate.

Damage from storms, power outages

fire prevention & older tree safety

FIRE HAZARD

resident's safety and the safety of their homes

Dead or unhealthy tree removal

Maintenance of existing trees

Maintenance of trees

Bringing Carmel up to date with urban forestry best management practices. Stressing the importance of an increase in resources for Forestry to make the urban forest safe/healthy

Costs associated with maintenance/removal

Need to do a better job of working with the residents/property owners, each time an issue with a tree is raised to the forestry dept it becomes a battle royale to get things to move in a timely fashion

Stop planning and take action, I've been hearing about a plan forever, city doesn't take the issue of tree falling seriously enough

Maintenance of the urban forest with safety

Dangerous Tree removal and Tree stump removal.

Addressing trees that would be fire hazards or weather problems

Broken trees, dead trees, tree maintenance

Failing tree removal

Monitoring PG&E's work (Hack) teams under High Tension lines

Maintain the forest—prevent frequent destruction of beautiful trees (by home builders).

Maintain native forest, avoid non-native introductions

Tree safety; aid homeowners with aging trees, make the assessment and removal (if nec.) process easier and more cooperative. For both private and city-owned trees: assess (year 'round), anticipate, act (AAA)

Removal of dangerous trees

Urban fire threat and hazards associated with dying/dead trees - 4,000 sq.ft. lots are quite small and conflicts with desire to require at least one upper canopy tree on each 'lot'.

Reinstitute the Assistant Forester position and diversify the age of planted trees

Stick to natives, Stop allowing uneducated people to decide what they think should be planted. Downtown is looking like a ridiculous combination of trees that don't go together.

Maintenance

Taking down city owned stumps (over 5' tall) and aged Monterey pines.

tree maintenance

Stop charging residents permit "fee" for tree removal.

Trees under power lines and endangering homes should be removed

Safety, both fire and falling due to storms

Safety

Decaying and dying trees. Checking root systems that are showing above ground for safety to surrounding homes. Monterey pines do not belong in close proximity to homes, and most in Carmel are past their safe lifespan

Defensible fire space to lower risk of fire to lower homeowner's insurance rates

Dead dying trees that are fuel for fire

Either dealing with, or letting property owners deal with dead or dangerous trees.

The UFMP needs to address the mature pine and cypress trees that are reaching the end of their lifespan and also give standards of practice for working on and around trees (I.E. Construction).

Modernizing the existing document meet present day and future needs while continuing to recognize that the city is an urbanized forest. 🌲

Reduce trees. They aren't original to Carmel yet have become a sacred cow. Eliminate Draconian restrictions.

UFMP is misleading. Carmel does not have an Urban Forest but instead an Urbanized Forest, meaning it is an ecosystem that predated human settlement. Urban Forests can follow any preferences indicated, say, in a questionnaire. Urbanized Forests should follow their original composition. Period.

Water usage and cost. If trees are not naturally occurring for the region they shouldn't be here.

Checking on health of trees to ensure minimum damage during storms and to keep the forest looking healthy

Diseased/dead trees should be able to be removed without such a lengthy process.

Maintaining and enhancing our urban forest  
fire mitigation

It is all about the right tree in the right place. You can always replace a tree but it needs to be the right tree. No high canopy trees by transformers and wires. High canopy trees in parks and trails.

Ease the process and cost of removing old trees on private property.

The health of a Urban Forest

preserving upper tree canopy - plant more trees, make sure they're watered & pruned properly & that property owners comply

Removing dangerous dying trees

How to balance urban forest best practices recommendation for a more diverse forest while maintaining Carmel's signature iconic beauty and high concentration of pines and oak species; how do we shape the plan so these exist in harmony?

Removal of Monterey pines

Removal of dying trees with power lines running thru

Maintain healthy native forest

Assessing state of diseased/dying trees and replacing them. UFMP needs to be strong and make decisions.

Fire risk (tree rules should accommodate Firewise certification) and life safety (old Monterey Pines are too tippy to be in residential areas).

Poor distribution. I have 3 high canopy. Neighbor none. Conflicting requirements.  
fire hazards

Maintain its natural history

Maintain and protect trees healthy

safety, when replanting new trees and pruning existing ones

(1) Homeowners should have more say over trees in the public right of way abutting their property.  
(2) There needs to be more flexibility -- just because a limb is 4" in diameter does not mean it should never be allowed to be cut or trimmed. If that tree is replaced elsewhere on the site, that should qualify.

Trimming and maintaining our existing trees.

Maintain the forest and protect trees.

Preserving and enhancing treescape (upper and lower) canopy.

a balance between trees and homes - there isn't one; it seems that priorities are: 1) trees, 2) dogs, 3) people

Tree limbs on electric lines

Tree maintenance and health

Dead trees

Safety which has largely been ignored on a proactive basis

Fire danger. Residents cannot get insurance.

preserving as many trees as possible

Recognizing that ocean view is valuable and trees can still be in abundance.

Caring for the trees and replanting trees after we lose one.

Keeping the forest healthy and in balance. Fire prevention measures where possible.

Mitigate potential storm damage.

Safety

removing dead branches and trimming; including B & B's should do but some do not.

Plant more trees in replacing the ones that are drying.

Dead wood and fire hazardous trees.

Fire safety AND the removal of private over-aged trees

Tree health

Tree removal because a homeowner wants a better view or a bigger house.

Safety first.

Be reasonable about requiring trees removed be replaced.

Clean-up

Public and private trees be maintained. Fire and Storms are my largest concern.

Maintaining Treesd

build 'budget-proof' plan for long term maintenance of urban forest.

#### Safety

Safety & Maintenance to avoid Power Outages & Fires!!!

Replace trees that were removed. Reduce fire danger by removing debris and dead trees.

Trim remove dangerous trees/limbs that have a high likelihood of causing harm to life, people/wildlife and homes where it could cause insurance claims.

#### Safety/fire

residents cutting down trees for "safety"

increase employees

Trees are being planted and are dying

#### Maintenance & preservation on scenic

Thinning out the oldest Monterey pines before they cause more damage.

Diversify the upper canopy species and improve maintenance

Upper canopy tree failure

Increase planting of new larger young trees

supervision

Storm safety & removal of older pines.

Maintain forest, plant significant size trees, water replacements, and protect all healthy trees.

Protect trees and fire risk by putting power lines underground.

Removal of trees, homeowners decide how many trees on property.

The dead and dying and aged trees

#### Planting new trees

Inspecting and pruning city trees, eliminate permit fees for removal of dead trees on private properties.

Planting and maintaining upper canopy trees.

Constantly surveying trees in danger of falling or are sick.

A effective strategy for the long term preservation of our urban forest and a plan for how will keep both the forest and the people living here safe and healthy.

Making everyone face the same consequence for removing trees; keep as many trees as possible as healthy as possible.

Stop with this survey by dividing everyone in Carmel asking about the 500 year old trees

Fire and storm safety

Trees that endanger safety of people, property and fire hazards

Safety of property from tree hazards.

Potential damage/fires caused by old trees

As long as each property has 4 canopy trees per 4000 sqft no replacement but if less than 4, replacement or required planting for ANY permit

Aging large trees

Fire mitigation and tree maintenance

Replacing non natives

Using correct trees for location. What will it look like in 50 years

Tree damage

Observe tree for age and danger of falling

Tree disease, limbing and planting

stumps, watering, trimming, maintenance

Fire and storm danger

Safely preserve and foster native trees

Maintenance

Provide homeowners with clear guidance for tree care. Old upper canopy trees should be resistograph tested and removed/replaced to reduce risk of property damage or injury. The requirement for 2 upper canopy trees seems excessive though. Our Monterey Cypress had a diameter of 7 feet and dominated the back yard, leaving no room for a second large tree.

Maintain upper canopy native trees.

Replacing Monterey pine with lower canopy trees or more stable redwood trees.

fire danger

Easier to remove trees over homes

Permit costs to remove trees.

Removal of aged diseased pines so they do not remove themselves during storms or simply fail. Eventuality a death or serious injury will occur

To revive and restore our urbanized Monterey Pine Forest as described and mandated in our general plan and supported in our Municipal Codes.

The upper canopy trees are coming to the ends of their lives and there are very few middle-aged trees to take their places. Seedlings should have been planted long ago...but it is never too late to get some in the ground. Also, there should be more of a variety of trees so that if pest take some varieties down, others will survive.

Routine maintenance so we don't lose the trees we have and before they do damage during stormy season.

Need to plant and maintain native trees and not non-natives. The more canopy the better.

No response provided

Explain the history & true nature of the CBTS's "urbanized" native forest and how it should be preserved, maintained & enhanced. Duplicate (retain) the information, goals, policies & programs. Include an accurate and appropriate tree & plant list with recognition of this native forest with a very unique ecosystem.

Work with PG&E to protect power delivery to the extent possible within our urban forest environment.

No response provided

Upper canopy is unworkable and avoids much use of the native Live Oak which is well liked. Better to add oak to upper canopy or go to small, medium + large as Sara suggested. Needs to be more varied trees including ones that flower or have fall colors. Views are important!! Tourist and locals value beach + ocean over tall trees. Number of pine need to be reduced and tall,.

No response provided

Maintaining our trees in a timely manner.

Removing trees that could potentially cause damage to property. Remove all the stumps including partial trees with high voltage overhead wires attached. Remove stump from 10th Ave beach access path. Thank you!

Proper care/maintenance of trees surrounding residents.

We live in a village with beautiful old trees that were never maintained or allowed to be removed when neighbors and homeowners begged. Protect our trees yes, but remember humans live underneath them.

To revive and restore our part of the Monterey native pine forest. The General Plan of Carmel describes this sufficiently.

No response provided

Routine maintenance so we don't lose the trees we have and before they do damage during stormy season.

Fairness to property owners. Choice of public tree variety maintenance of public trees.

Having undergrounding of our power lines...it is very dangerous having it where trees can cause fires.

Plant a variety of trees, move away from Pines (dangerous) and Cypress (messy!). It doesn't make sense to keep planting the same type of trees (Pines in particular) that are not going to do well with climate change.

Getting unbiased people on their committee. This survey has bias in it. Maintaining our trees for aesthetic beauty

Maintenance of current trees on Public Property.

Prevent tree problems during storms by better maintenance and removal. Use a "common sense" approach to replacing trees. That is, don't plant a tree in the middle of the street (ie 4th betw. Torres & Santa Fe)

Tree health and care

Get rid of the Monterey Pines and replace them with Cypress and Coastal Oaks

Carmel is beautiful because it is gloriously green because of Monterey Pines and its adjacent greenery. That's why I moved to Carmel.

no response given

The city stop planting more trees and start maintaining the trees we already have.

The plan should address tree limbs failure and pruning away from power/cable lines. It should also address infrastructure weakness where roots are causing safety issues on sidewalks & gathering spaces.

Adopt a plan that is safe and affordable.

The most important issue that the UFMP should address is the proper maintenance of the forest, keeping the trees healthy to protect safety of the citizens.

Chaparral and meadows are Carmel's native habitat. Historic photos show as late as the 1920s trees were not a significant natural part of Carmel's environment. Carmel's man made forest has unintentionally become a serious hazard.