

NOTABLE HOME INCENTIVE PROGRAM

AN INCENTIVE PROGRAM FOR SELECTED NON-HISTORIC CARMEL HOMES PROPOSED FOR DEMOLITION/EXTERIOR REMODELING

MISSION STATEMENT: To help preserve the unique residential architectural character of Carmel-By-The-Sea with an incentive program to save older homes that reflect that character.

The purpose of this proposal is to establish a new voluntary status for homes 70 years of age or older that do not qualify as “historic” but nevertheless are characteristic of our village in the forest, with the intent of protecting them from extensive alteration or demolition when possible. This designation would be less restrictive for the homeowner than the standard historic designation, both in qualifications and remodel requirements, should they choose to take advantage of the program. Incentives will be offered to encourage this “**Notable Home**” status.

IDEA STATEMENT: WHY WE NEED PROTECTIONS

Most Carmel homes of note do not qualify for historic status (see the criteria for historical register below, Table 1). This is for a variety of reasons, e.g., no record of who built it, the year built, etc. Many of these homes are being torn down, mostly to build larger structures to utilize the “highest and best use” for the owner/ investor.

This proposal is an incentive program to encourage homeowners to protect the special nature of Carmel-by-the-Sea. There is a range of architecture consistent with Carmel's character.

Yes, there is some “judgment” in determining which houses qualify for being designated **Notable Homes**. That is why we have knowledgeable staff and committees to ascertain these decisions. There will always be gray areas requiring judgment calls. However, as the current General Plan states, “conservation allows change and new construction as long as it is consistent with established character.” What is this established character? The General Plan defines it as follows: “In recognition of this close relationship between the natural and built environments, and perhaps intended to enhance this fit, many of the City's buildings have been designed with natural materials, pleasant open spaces and abundant landscaping with native plants. Carmel Stone, local granite, and the frequent use of wood in hand-carved doors, window frames, sills, moldings, roofing materials, and signs are all design features that contribute to the village character of the City. These form a contrast to the glass, steel, plastic, and featureless gray concrete so often found in other, more urban cities.

Attention to detail and emphasis on fine craftsmanship can be seen in the varied architecture of Carmel; local builders have embellished their work with detailing and individual style, which creates a unique and appealing building design. Most of Carmel-by-the-Sea's historic buildings exhibit myriad detailing, some of it intricate and some bold: surfaces are broken up by ridges, insets, decorative tiles, cavities, niches, and abrupt changes of material; textures exhibit a great

variety, from smooth-troweled plaster, brick, stone, rock or exposed aggregate to painted, carved or unfinished wood; corners often include bevels, bullnoses, cornices and moldings.”(2003 General Plan: “Land Use and Community Character: Architecture and Community Character”).

QUALIFYING CHARACTERISTICS FOR NOTABLE HOME PROTECTION

1. Homes typically built up through the 1940s (but generally restricted to 70 years of age or older). Among the most noteworthy to Carmel in this period was the design of “Storybook” cottages that drew upon references of “Cotswold houses.” The housing stock is generally considered old-world European, vernacular, or traditional styles.
2. Homes built by Murphy, Comstock, Denny and Watrous, Hill, Morgan, and others listed in the historic register that meet the characteristics above. However, a home is not required to have proof/knowledge of the builder or restricted to a listed builder/architect to qualify for **Notable Home** status.
3. Small homes—one and two bedrooms. Saving a small home does not preclude the possibility of adding on in the same vernacular if the addition is designed to be subservient to the original building, ideally hidden from street view if possible. The floor area ratio must still be no more than 45% of the lot.

The proposed Carmel city code changes are consistent with the **Notable Home** proposal (Proposed Zoning Code and Residential Design Guideline amendments, August 21, 2019). Particularly relevant statements from the amendments regarding designs follow:

“...standards have been added requiring that (the home) be sensitive to neighborhood context, incorporate natural finish materials, use earth-toned colors, and consider using traditional roof forms such as gables.”

ELIMINATED “POSSIBLE CHARACTERISTICS SECTION”

The updated City Design Guidelines (draft) provide six overlying principles of acceptable designs that ALSO apply to **Notable Homes**:

1. **PRESERVE**, restore, and enhance the forest in all improvement projects: private, public, and otherwise.
2. **SUBORDINATE** every built structure to the character and continuity of the forest, natural environment, and the natural features of its own site.
3. **FIT** every built structure within its neighborhood context.
4. **RETAIN** and build upon Carmel’s architectural heritage.

- 5. **DESIGN** every built structure with modesty.
- 6. **DETAIL** every property authentically and consistently.

TABLE 1: HISTORIC REQUIREMENTS FOR LEVEL 1 HOMES JUXTAPOSED WITH PROPOSED REQUIREMENTS FOR NOTABLE HOMES

HISTORIC REQUIREMENTS (LEVEL 1)	NOTABLE HOMES (LEVEL 2)
A. Representative of at least one theme in the Historic Context Statement.	Same, needn't be an exact included representation
B. Shall retain substantial integrity (association, feeling, setting, location, materials, and workmanship).	Not as restrictive, as long as the basic integrity of design, the house is maintained
C. Fifty years of age and older, and should meet at least one of the four criteria for listing in the CA Register at a national or statewide level of significance or at a regional or local level of significance:	70 years of age or older
1. Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history or the cultural heritage of CA or the U.S.,	Not necessary
2. Is associated with the lives of persons important to local, CA, or national History,	Not necessary
3. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, an important creative individual, or possesses high artistic values, or	Same
4. Has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important to the prehistory or history of the local area, CA, or the nation.	Not necessary

D. To qualify for the Carmel Inventory, an historic resource eligible under CA Register criteria no. 3 only, should:

- | | |
|--|---------------|
| 1. Have been designed and/or constructed by an architect, designer/builder or contractor whose work has contributed to the unique sense of time and place recognized as significant in the Historic Context Statement, | Not necessary |
| 2. Have been designed and/or constructed by a previously unrecognized architect, designer/builder, or contractor if there is substantial, factual evidence that the one or more of the historic contexts of the city to an extent consistent with other architects, etc. identified within the Historic Context Statement, | Not necessary |
| 3. Be a good example of an architectural style or type of construction recognized as significant in the Historic Context Statement,
or | Not necessary |
| 4. Display a rare style or type for which special consideration should be given. Rare styles and types that contribute to Carmel's unique sense of time and place shall be deemed significant. | Not necessary |

E., F., and G. Not applicable.

H. A resource less than 50 years old may be eligible if it is of exceptional importance to the city, state, or nation, based on its unusually strong contribution to history architecture, engineering, or culture, or because it is an integral part of an historic district. Same, but 70 years or older

NOTE: Only houses that reflect the established character of the village, as defined in the General Plan, but do not qualify as historic, are to be considered for **Notable Home** status.

PROPOSED INCENTIVES FOR NOTABLE HOMES

The **Notable Home** designation could be a badge of honor, further enhancing the value of the residence if financial and/or code amendment incentives were provided. Indeed, incentives would be the motivation for participation in most cases. Possible incentives follow:

1. Allow additions to existing homes while keeping the original home intact, using the same style of construction as the original.
2. Reduced planning and permit fees once the **Notable Home** designation is assigned.
3. Leniency regarding the following:
 - Flexibility in requirements for a home built before today's codes existed (illegal non-conforming issues)
 - Parking requirements relaxed
 - Basement allowed or expanded
 - Setback requirements reduced
 - Expedious tree removal (if approved by the City Forester)
 - Volumetrics or bulk plane
 - Allow variances for semi-permeable and impermeable landscaping site coverage
 - Drainage requirements reduced
 - Greater site coverage allowed

Note: These would be mechanisms for the city planners to apply site-specific criteria with which the **Notable Home** homeowner could work. Any non-financial incentive would possibly require code amendments.

STEPS TO ESTABLISH NOTABLE HOMES

1. A project would only be referred to the Historic Resources Board (HRB) by the city planning staff if the applicant elects to participate in the program and the checklist (Appendix A) indicates eligibility. The planning department staff would pass along to the HRB only cases for review for which the applicant desires to participate and that alter the exterior of the home. This includes all homes for which permit applications for exterior remodels or demolition have been submitted that are not designated historic and are 70 or more years of age. Excluded are plans only for deck and patio additions/changes, landscaping changes, and roof or other repairs/replacement if replaced with like-kind materials (see Checklist, Appendix A).
2. Candidates identified who are interested in participating would have their homes reviewed by the Historic Resources Board (HRB). The HRB would then make the determination of qualification for a **Notable Home** designation, similar to the procedures for Level 1 (historic) homes. This could be completed via email with a 4-day turnaround. If a majority of the HRB approves, the city planner proceeds with incentive(s) appropriate to the property.

3. If there is a majority “non-approval” by the HRB, staff would proceed as they have in the past, with “determination of ineligibility” established.

4. If a home is designated a **Notable Home**, the homeowner(s) could, if desired, meet with the HRB, to discuss their concerns/incentives with the designation and how it could impact their plans for the property. Otherwise, they would simply work with the planning department regarding incentives. The owner has the option of not accepting the designation before final plans are approved by the Design Review Board, Planning Department, or Planning Commission, whichever apply.

5. It becomes the responsibility of the Staff/Planning Commission to enforce restrictions for homes designated as a **Notable Home**, should the owner take advantage of the program.

Notable Home designation would exist through the property to new owners via city records, but not through deed restrictions. A new owner of an already designated **Notable Home** could retain the designation/incentives that had been originally applied but would not be able to utilize the designation for additional incentives, i.e., **Notable Home** incentives apply only once on a home. It is unlikely that a subsequent owner would demolish or extensively remodel a home that has a **Notable Home** qualified remodel or rebuild by the prior owner because they are already enjoying the benefits of the incentives and indeed might possibly lose prior incentives if rebuilding. Needless to say, designated historic homes do not qualify for incentives.

WAYS TO PROMOTE THE PROGRAM:

- The **Notable Home** program listed/described in the Design Guidelines, with a link to this document.
- Brochure for realtors, builders, and the public, at city hall – a method for notifying of the possibility of level two home designation.
- Slide show.
- City website list of examples of **Notable Homes** and requirements.

kh: revised 7.10.23

CHECKLIST: REQUIREMENTS FOR NOTABLE HOMES APPLIED BY PLANNING DEPARTMENT

All five criteria must be met to qualify as a **Notable Home**:

_____ A. Is seventy years of age or older.

_____ B. Plans for renovations/remodeling must retain basic integrity (association, feeling, setting, location, design, materials, and/or workmanship).

_____ C. Is representative of at least one traditional historic theme (needn't be an exact representation).

_____ D. Embodies the established character of a cottage in a village in the forest.

_____ E. Renovations/remodel building plans involve changes beyond deck and patio additions, landscaping changes, and roof or other repairs or replacements in-kind.

kh: revised 7.10.23