

# CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA COMMUNITY PLANNING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT

#### **2022 GENERAL PLAN ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORT**

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

- 1. Introduction
  - Purpose and Summary General Plan Background
- 2. General Plan Implementation Efforts

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

## Purpose and Summary

Government Code Section 65400 requires cities and counties to submit an Annual Progress Report (APR) on the status of the General Plan and implementation progress to their legislative bodies, the State Office of Planning and Research (OPR), and the Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD). The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea has not previously submitted a General Plan Annual Progress Report to the State. The 2022 reporting period did not include any amendments to the Carmel-by-the-Sea General Plan, nor the passage of any moratoria or emergency ordinances. However, the City did make significant accomplishments related to General Plan implementation during the 2022 reporting period, as detailed in Section 2. General Plan Implementation Efforts.

This General Plan Annual Progress report was presented to the Carmel-by-the-Sea Planning Commission on April 12, 2023, and the Carmel-by-the-Sea City Council on May 2, 2023.

## General Plan Background

In 1929, the Carmel City Council adopted Ordinance No. 96 to direct the future development of Carmel. This ordinance, now outlined in Title 17 of the Municipal Code, established the residential character of Carmel and specifically outlined the City's intent that Carmel should subordinate other activities in order to preserve the community's unique residential character. The 1929 ordinance stated the following:

"The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea is hereby determined to be primarily, essentially and predominantly a residential city wherein business and commerce have in the past, are now, and are proposed to be in the future, subordinated to its residential character; and that said determination is made having in mind the history and the development of said city, its growth and the causes thereof; and also its geographical and topographical aspects, together with its near proximity to the cities of Pacific Grove and Monterey, and the businesses, industries, trades, callings and professions in existence and permissible therein."

Carmel's General Plan was adopted by the City Council in the spring of 1988. The 1988 General Plan superseded the City's first plan from 1957, which was subsequently amended and updated over the decades (see GP/LUP page I-4 for summary).

The General Plan is a comprehensive statement of the planning goals and policies for the City of Carmelby-the-Sea and its surrounding Sphere of Influence that is periodically reviewed and updated. California Government Code (Section 65302) requires the General Plan to include seven specific elements (information topics): Land Use, Circulation, Housing, Conservation, Open Space, Noise, and Safety. Elements may be combined, and additional elements may be added at a jurisdiction's discretion. Though the titles of the seven required elements may be modified, all elements shall contain the content and analysis required by the State.

Because the entire City falls within the California Coastal Commission's Coastal Zone, all of Carmel's policies, practices, ordinances, and plans must be in conformance with the requirements of the 1976 Coastal Act. Carmel's Local Coastal Land Use Plan (certified in December 2002) sets forth goals, objectives, and policies governing the use of land and water in Carmel-by-the-Sea consistent with Chapter 3 of the California Coastal Act of 1976 (as amended through January 2003). Carmel's Local Coastal Plan was combined with Carmel's General Plan in 2003 to ensure coordination of the two policy documents. The combined Local Coastal Plan/General Plan includes:

**Land Use and Community Character.** This Chapter of the General Plan covers topics required in the Land Use Element and also includes policies for topics in sections 30244 and 30250 through 30254 of the Coastal Act.

**Circulation.** This Chapter or Element of the General Plan is one of the seven elements required by California Statutes. Several of the policies in this element also implement provisions of the Coastal Act.

**Coastal Access and Recreation.** This Chapter includes policies for topics covered in sections 30210 through 30224 of the Coastal Act.

**Coastal Resource Management.** This Chapter of the General Plan includes policies for topics in sections 30230 through 30243 and 30251 of the Coastal Act.

Each of these Chapters begins with a discussion of the local setting and policy direction adopted by the City to address the requirements of the Coastal Act. Specific Goals, Objectives, and Policies are then listed. Much of the background information and policy contained in the Coastal Land Use Plan is incorporated directly from existing plans and reports that address special topics. The following documents are appendices to the General Plan/Coastal Land Use Plan:

- Forest Management Plan
- Mission Trail Nature Preserve Master Plan
- Final Results of the Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area Study Conducted for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea (ESHA Study)
- Historic Context Statement, Carmel-by-the-Sea

The Carmel-by-the-Sea General Plan also contains the following Elements which are not associated with the Coastal Plan:

**Housing.** This required element sets City policy and programs for housing construction and rehabilitation.

**Public Facilities and Services**. This is an optional element, not required by California Statutes. This element addresses the management and use of City-owned properties and facilities.

**Open Space and Conservation**. Open Space and Conservation elements are often addressed separately, but Carmel has combined them into a single element.

**Environmental Safety**. This is another required element. It covers earthquakes, fires, floods, and other hazardous conditions.

**Noise**. This is an element required by statute. It addresses sources of noise in the community and establishes policies to protect noise-sensitive land uses.

The various Elements have been updated and reorganized over the years, as follows: 1) Land Use and Community Character (2003), 2) Circulation (2010); 3) Housing (2015); 4) Coastal Access and Recreation (2003); 5) Coastal Resource Management (2003); 6) Public Facilities and Services (2009); 7) Open Space and Conservation (2009); 8) Environmental Safety (2009); and 9) Noise (2009). The next planned Element updates will be the comprehensive update of the Housing Element and the Safety Element in 2023 in accordance with State law.

Throughout the General Plan, goals, objectives, and policies are differentiated by an alphanumeric system and are identified by the letters "G," "O," and "P," respectively. The second character identifies the General Plan element in which the goal, objective, or policy is found. Thus, "P4-1" refers to a **Policy** within Element #**4**, Coastal Access & Recreation, and specifically references policy number **1**.

## 2. GENERAL PLAN IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS

Please note that the summary below is not intended to be exhaustive or all-inclusive; rather, it is a snapshot of major developments, accomplishments, projects, and practices during the 2022 calendar year. In some cases, an item may fulfill multiple goals/policies within an element or even across multiple elements; however, in the interest of reducing redundancy, the most applicable implemented goal/objective/policy has been listed.

	2022	
Element	Projects and Accomplishments	Implemented Goals/Objectives/Policies
1) Land Use and Community Character	Verizon Wireless Litigation, United States District Court for the Northern District of California, Case No. 5:22- cv-00347-NC.	G1-1: Continue to preserve and maintain the predominance of the residential character in Carmel through appropriate zoning and land development regulations in all districts.
	Resolution 2022-014: Professional Services Agreement with Winter & Company to provide consultant support for the 'Design Traditions 2.0' project to update the City's Design Guidelines and Zoning Code.	O1-8: Preserve the traditional characteristics of scale, good site design and sensitivity to neighboring sites in the single-family residential district through the design approval of new homes, additions and exterior remodeling. Encourage the construction of residences that are diverse and innovative in design yet compatible with the forest setting, site design and materials established by other structures within the neighborhood and adopted Residential Design Guidelines.  O1-10: Apply design regulations for the commercial district that will protect its established character while supporting the land uses contained therein.
	2 properties added to the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources.  Resolution 2022-108, Adopting Carmel's Historic Context Statement Update for the 1966-1986.  City entered into 4 Mills Act contracts.	O1-14: Maintain an inventory of historic resources.  P1-85: Maintain an Historic Context Statement.  G1-5: Protect and enhance historic resources. Ensure that City ordinances, development review processes and
		administrative policies support, facilitate and coordinate with preservation activities. Provide incentives for property

		owners to preserve and rehabilitate historic resources.
		Thistoric resources.
2) Circulation	Resolution 2022-054, approving streets to be paved, partially funded by the Road Repair and Accountability Act.  Resolution 2022-060, amending the	G2-1: Provide and maintain a transportation system and facilities that promote the orderly and safe transportation of people and goods while preserving the residential character and village atmosphere of Carmel.
	Fiscal Year 2022/23 Budget/Capital Improvement Plan to correct the Concrete Street Repairs project description and superseding Resolution 2022-039, Concrete Street Repair projects for FY 2022/23, partially funded by SB 1.	
	Resolution No. 2022-025, Approving the Conversion from a Single Stop Sign to an All-Way Stop-Controlled Intersection at 7th Street and Junipero Avenue.	O2-2: Ensure safety improvements are undertaken in response to the changing travel environment.
	Resolution 2022-058, Professional Services Agreement with Wallace Group for Project Management Services, including but not limited to the Wayfinding Signs Project.	P2-5: Continue to restrict street signs and only permit those signs that are necessary and essential for public safety.
	Resolution 2022-013, Professional Services Agreement with Neill Engineers Corp. for On-Call Engineering Services, including but not limited to the design, bidding, and construction of the 2021-2022 Street Paving Project, including San Carlos median islands.	P2-6: Maintain and encourage informal landscaped median strips and natural landscaped areas within public rights-ofway. (LUP)
	On October 4, 2022, Council gave direction to pursue scoping of consultant contract to evaluate a paid parking program.	P2-25: Evaluate a paid parking program for the downtown.
3) Housing	See Housing Element Annual	N/A
Element	Progress Report	PA C2 Patrice and a second
4) Coastal Access and Recreation	Increased Short Term Rental (STR) enforcement in 2022. STRs are identified through Host Compliance	P4-63 Retain measures to restrict commercial short-term rental of single-family residences in the R-I district. (LUP)
	(a 3rd party compliance monitor) and resident complaints. In addition	

	to NOV's/citations, the City sends educational "reminders" to local vacation rental companies and real estate agents. In 2021 there were only 10 STR cases logged in the City's tracking system; in 2022, there were 43 by mid-November.	
	Cease and desist letters sent in 2022 to a timeshare property; Timeshare Ordinance update initiated.	P4-64 Continue to prohibit the sale of interests in and rights to use real property in the City on a timesharing basis. (LUP)
5) Coastal Resource Management	Final Report: Tracing Fecal Contaminants and Copper From Watershed Sources to the Ocean (October 11, 2022); subsequent community outreach/education. Resolution 2022-094, agreement with EMC Planning Group Inc., for the Coastal Engineering and Adaptation Planning Project.  Resolution 2022-098, extending the beach fire management pilot program by approximately six months, with an end date of May 15, 2023	O5-43 Protect and enhance the water quality and biological productivity of local creeks, wetlands, and Carmel Bay through the prevention of point- and non-point-source water pollution. (LUP)  G5-2: Establish and implement a comprehensive shoreline management program for the beach, bluffs and dunes that mitigates degradation caused by public use and natural forces.  O5-6: Keep the beach free of refuse.
	City Council Discretionary Funds Grant Program.  Enforcement of existing tree planting standards and required tree protection during development projects; ongoing City tree planting efforts per the Urban Forest Master Plan Project.	P5-39: Encourage volunteer programs for beach and bluff clean-up activities. (LUP) O5-11: Maintain, restore, and enhance the upper and lower tree canopy of Carmel's urbanized forest. (LUP)
	City continues to require tree removal and pruning permits.	O5-12: Implement policies, standards, and procedures to regulate the removal, pruning, and replacement of trees on private property.
	Resolution 2022-089, on-call Landscape Maintenance Services contract to Town & Country Gardening & Landscaping.	O5-13: Perform all tree work and landscaping within the City in accordance with City codes and policies and uniform planting practices that reflect the best current knowledge of tree and plant care.
	City continues to regulate the Right- of-Way per the Municipal Code and the Right-of-Way Vision Statement.	O5-16 Remove or reduce unnecessary or excessive hardscape and other

City continues to require drainage plans for additions and new builds.	nonconforming encroachments on City parklands and within street rights-of-way to provide for and promote the planting of trees and native vegetation. (LUP)  O5-22: Maximize retention of surface water on each site through site design and use of best management practices. (LUP)
Undergrounding of utilities required when a project valuation reaches \$200,000 over a cumulative five-year period (exemptions considered if needed to protect significant trees).  Resolution 2022-109 approving Policy 2022-01 establishing guidelines for review of projects involving installation of a grease interceptor.	P5-183: Promote the placement of utilities underground where feasible and with minimum detriment to the root system of trees. (LUP)  P5-212 Restaurants shall incorporate BMP's designed to minimize runoff of oil and grease, solvents, phosphates, suspended solids, and other pollutants to the storm drain system. (LUP)
The City of Carmel-by-the-Sea received "Ocean Champion Status" recognition as a Blue City by Project O, a 501c3 nonprofit ocean conservation organization. The major accomplishments that helped the City achieve this recognition include:  1) Residential waste diversion rates near 70%, one of the highest in Monterey County, indicating the effectiveness of the City's recycling outreach efforts.  2) Climate Committee dedicated to assessing climate change threats and challenges as they relate to their community, and using input from experts and regional constituents to develop actionable plans to mitigate threats.  3) Installing over the past three years, more than 800 energy-efficient LED light fixtures in nearly every City-owned building.	G5-3: Protect, conserve and enhance the unique natural beauty and irreplaceable natural resources of Carmel and its Sphere of Influence, including its biological resources, water resources, and scenic routes and corridors.

	4) Participating in the Monterey	
	Regional Stormwater Management's	
	First Flush and Snapshot Day events,	
	which are coordinated by the	
	Monterey Bay Marine Sanctuary	
	Foundation. Both events utilize	
	volunteers to collect stormwater	
	samples.	
	5) Restoration and upkeep of the	
	Mission Trail Nature Preserve, home	
	to the endemic Monterey Pine	
	forest, coastal prairie and arroyo	
	willow bogs (wetlands), and habitat	
	area for threatened and endangered	
	animal species.	
	6) Implementing stringent dark sky	
	guidelines and showing exceptional	
	dedication to the preservation of the	
	night sky. The residential streets of	
	Carmel are fully dark after hours,	
	with only a handful of safety	
	streetlights at a few key	
	intersections.	
6) Public	Twelve (12) capital improvement	P6-14: Maintain the City's five-year Capital
Facilities and	projects funded in Fiscal Year (FY)	Improvement Program and conduct a
Services	2021/22 to be carried over into FY	yearly review by the Planning Commission
	2022/23. Twenty -five (25) proposed	of the Capital Improvement Program
	capital improvement projects	consistent with this Element.
	recommended for funding in FY	
	2022/23. Four (4) proposed special	
	projects to be funded and executed	
	by others in FY 2022/23.	
	,	
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092,	O6-2: Support adequate levels of public
	,	services and facilities to serve the needs of
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092,	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092,	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092,	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers,
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a Budget Amendment of \$20,395 to	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers, commercial businesses and residents to
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a Budget Amendment of \$20,395 to the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Adopted	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers, commercial businesses and residents to minimize the amount of waste going to
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a Budget Amendment of \$20,395 to the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Adopted Budget for the CalRecycle SB 1383	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers, commercial businesses and residents to minimize the amount of waste going to landfills through improved recycling
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a Budget Amendment of \$20,395 to the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Adopted Budget for the CalRecycle SB 1383 Local Assistance Grant.	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers, commercial businesses and residents to minimize the amount of waste going to landfills through improved recycling efforts and programs.
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a Budget Amendment of \$20,395 to the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Adopted Budget for the CalRecycle SB 1383 Local Assistance Grant.  Resolution 2022-065, Professional	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers, commercial businesses and residents to minimize the amount of waste going to landfills through improved recycling efforts and programs.  P6-14: Maintain the City's 5-year Capital
	Adopt Resolution 2022-092, purchase of new fire truck.  Resolution 2022-067, approving a Budget Amendment of \$20,395 to the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Adopted Budget for the CalRecycle SB 1383 Local Assistance Grant.	services and facilities to serve the needs of the community, including police and fire protection, refuse and sanitary disposal services, building safety and public utility services.  P6-9: Work with service providers, commercial businesses and residents to minimize the amount of waste going to landfills through improved recycling efforts and programs.

Management Services for delivery of nine Capital Improvement Projects for Sunset Center, cottages, City Hall, Harrison Memorial Library, Vista Lobos, and Fire Station. of the Capital Improvement Program consistent with this Element.

Resolution 2022-075, Professional Services Agreement with 4Leaf, Inc. for Project Management Services for delivery of four Capital Improvement Projects: Citywide Annual Paving Project - Bidding and Construction: Police Building Renovation — Additional Scope — Design; Resilience Infrastructure Pilot Project - Planning and Design; and Electrical Panel Upgrades for City Hall, Public Works, Vista Lobos, and Sunset Center — Design.

Resolution 2022-101, Professional Services Agreement with Bureau Veritas North America, for Facilities Condition Assessments of four City buildings.

Resolution 2022-013, Professional Services Agreement with Neill Engineers Corp. for On-Call Engineering Services including but limited to design, bidding and construction of the 2021-2022 Street Paving Project, including San Carlos bike route projects, as well as additional sidewalk repairs that were identified by Council as high priority.

P6-18: Pursue roadside improvements funds and other available sources to develop bicycle paths and pedestrian trails.

Resolution 2022-058, agreement with Wallace Group for Project Management Services for delivery of Capital Improvement Projects, including the Citywide Drainage Repairs Project.

Resolution 2022-076, agreement with the Carmel Area Wastewater District to provide Stormwater Program Vactor Truck Services.

P6-19: Maintain the City's roadways, storm drains, and other public infrastructure to ensure they are safe and functioning adequately.

	Resolution 2022-088, agreement	
	with Schaaf & Wheeler to amend the	
	City's Storm Drain Master Plan.	
	Digitizing and Scanning Planning &	P6-20: Continue to evaluate ways to
	Building Department Records.	streamline the development review
		process.
7) Open Space	February 2022: Plants and irrigation	07-1: Use, maintain, and enhance publicly
and	parts installed in the Ocean Avenue	owned land for the benefit of Carmel
Conservation	median island between Lincoln and	residents.
consci vation	Monte Verde Streets for the	residents.
	Downtown Beautification Project.	
	Resolution 2022-058, agreement	G7-1: To protect, conserve, and enhance
	with Wallace Group for Project	the unique natural beauty and
	Management Services for delivery of	irreplaceable natural resources of Carmel
	four Capital Improvement Projects,	and its Sphere of Influence.
	including Mission Trails Nature	and its spriere of influence.
	Preserve (MTNP) Well Abandonment	P7-8: Maintain the City's beach, park, and
	and Tank and Pump Station Removal	open space in a manner that encourages
	Project	use and enjoyment by residents and
	110,000	visitors while protecting the aesthetic and
		environmental quality of these areas.
8) Environmental	Resolution 2022-064, adopting the	G8-1: Ensure there is adequate
Safety	City of Carmel-by-the-Sea's Climate	preparedness to respond to a disaster.
Surcey	Adaptation Plan and Climate Action	prepareuriess to respond to a disaster.
	Plan.	G8-2: Provide protection from natural
		hazards.
	Resolution 2022-096, adopting the	Tidzar as.
	2022 Monterey County Multi-	G8-3: Reduce potential impacts from
	Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan.	natural hazards.
	an isometrian in a sum of the sum	
		G8-4: Control land uses siting to avoid
		exposure to excessive risk.
	Resolution 2022-068, \$150k Cal Fire	O8-4: Prevent or reduce the potential for
	Grant / Professional Services	life loss, injury, and property damage from
	Agreement with Davey Resource	fire hazards.
	·	
	•	O8-3: Provide public education about
	recommendations, such as City-	means available to avoid or minimize their
	provided sand bags and emergency	effects.
	shelter at the Youth Center.	
	Site coverage limited to 22% of	P8-29: Limit the amount of impervious
	allowed base floor area; extra 4%	surface in flood-prone areas.
	bonus granted if at least 50% of the	
	Group for development of an Urban Forestry Master Plan Weekly vlog and email updates used to disseminate emergency alerts and recommendations, such as Cityprovided sand bags and emergency shelter at the Youth Center.	O8-3: Provide public education about what to do in case of emergencies and means available to avoid or minimize their effects.

	Resolution No. 2022-002, on-call tree maintenance services contracts with John Ley's Tree Service and with Iverson's Tree Service.	G8-2: Provide protection from natural hazards.
	Tope Tree Service substantially completed the mostly grant-funded, Fire Fuel Reduction Project in Mission Trails Nature Preserve.	G8-2: Provide protection from natural hazards.
	Resolution 2022-013, Neill Engineers Corp. on-call engineering services to include design work on three (3) inter-related Mission Trail Nature	O8-6: Prevent or reduce the potential for life loss, injury, and property damage from inundation due to flood or tsunami.
	Preserve drainage improvement projects funded by a State Department of Parks and Recreation Per Capita Grant.	P8-30: Reduce flooding hazards in areas with flooding potential by improving drainage and minimizing the alteration of natural drainage and natural protective barriers that accommodate or channel floodwaters.
9) Noise	Resolution 2022-059 authorizing the purchase of a RAVO 5E electric street sweeper.	P9-1: Noise emission levels shall be considered along with performance and cost, when purchasing City owned vehicles and construction equipment.
	2 electric vehicles purchased for Community Planning & Building.	
	Noise emission checks for all new generators, heating/AC, hot tubs, or similar systems upon permit approval and upon request.	P9-6: Develop a noise enforcement program to minimize disturbance of the community tranquility.
	Gas-powered leaf blowers prohibited.	P9-15: Continue to prohibit the use of gas-
	Truck route maintained.	powered leaf blowers in the City.  P9-16: Continue to maintain a truck route to limit noise impacts in the City.
	Live Music Ordinance enforced.	P9-18: Continue to enforce the City's Live Music Ordinance limiting the sound and location of live music in the commercial districts.